About ERR

Educational Research and Reviews (ISSN 1990-3839) is published bi-monthly (one volume per year) by Academic Journals.

Educational Research and Reviews (ERR) is an open access journal that publishes high-quality solicited and unsolicited articles, in English, in all areas of education including education policies and management such as Educational experiences and mental health, the effect of land tenure system on resource management, Visualization skills and their incorporation into school curriculum, Gender, education and child labour etc. All articles published in ERR are peer-reviewed.

Contact Us

Editorial Office: err@academicjournals.org
Help Desk: helpdesk@academicjournals.org
Website: http://www.academicjournals.org/journal/ERR
Submit manuscript online http://ms.academicjournals.me/.
Editors

Dr. Peter W. Wong
Southern Cross University
Australia.

Assoc. Prof. Manjula Vithanapathirana
Faculty of Education
University of Colombo
Colombo,
Sri Lanka.

Associate Editors

Dr. Melissa Vick
School Of Education
James Cook University
Townsville,
Australia.

Dr. Ahmet Basal
Yıldız Technical University
Education Faculty
Foreign Languages Education Department
Istanbul,
Turkey.

Dr. Maniam Kaliannan
Faculty of Adminstrative Science & Policy Studies
Universiti Teknologi MARA (UiTM)
Selangor,
Malaysia.

Prof. Ogunsakin R. Ebenezer
Department of Statistics
Ekiti State University
Ado Ekiti,
Nigeria.

Dr. Tavis D. Jules
Cultural and Educational Policy Studies
School of Education
Loyola University Chicago
Chicago,
USA.

Dr. A. Kadir Maskan
Dicle University
Ziya Gokalp Education Faculty
Department of Physics Education
Diyarbakir,
Turkey.

Dr. Dr. Adams Onuka
Centre for Peace and conflict Studies (CEPACS)
University of Ibadan
Ibadan
Nigeria.

Dr. Mohd Akhtar Siddiqui
Institute of Advanced Studies in Education
Faculty of Education
Jamia Millia Islamia Central University
New Delhi,
India.

Dr. Yambo John M. Onyango
University of Eastern Africa
Kamagambo Adventist College Campus
Baraton,
Kenya.

Dr. Tolga Gök
Torbali Vocational School of Higher Education
Dokuz Eylul University
Izmir,
Turkey.
Editorial Board

Prof. García Mayo, María del Pilar
Departamento de Filología Inglesa y Alemana y de Traducción e Interpretación
Universidad del País Vasco (UPV/EHU)
Paseo de la Universidad 5
Vitoria,
Spain.

Prof. Frank Witlox
Ghent University
Department of Geography
Gent,
Belgium.

Prof. Georgios D. Sideridis
University of Crete
Department of Psychology
Rethimno,
Greece.

Prof. Andreas Veglis
Department of Journalism and Mass Media
Aristotle University of Thessaloniki
Thessaloniki,
Greece.

Prof. MutendwaHothe Walter Lumadi
Curriculum & Instructional Studies
College of Education
UNISA,
South Africa.

Dr. Miriam McMullan
Faculty of Health and Social Work
University of Plymouth
Plymouth,
UK.

Prof. Moshe Barak
Graduate Program for Science and Technology Education
Ben-Gurion University of the Negve,
Beer Sheva,
Israel.

Dr. Hiam Zein
Psychology and Education
Lebanese American University
Chouran-Beirut,
Lebanon.

Dr. Joel O. Eriba
Faculty of Education
Benue State University
Makurdi,
Nigeria.

Prof. Bingjun Yang
School of Foreign Languages
Southwest University
Chongqing,
China.

Dr. Ernest W. Brewer
The University of Tennessee
Educational Administration and Supervision
Tennessee,
USA.

Prof. Gail Derrick
Regent University
School of Education
Virginia Beach,
USA.

Dr. Evridiki Zachopoulou
Department of Early Childhood Care and Education
Thessaloniki,
Greece.

Dr. Francesco Pastore
Seconda Università di Napoli
Italy,

Dr. Syed Iftikhar Hussain Shah
Technical Education and Vocation
TEVTA Secretariat
Lahore,
Pakistan.

Dr. Ravi Kant
College of Teacher Education
Maulana Azad National Urdu University
Darbhanga,
India.
Editorial Board

Dr. Dibakar Sarangi  
*Directorate of Teacher Education and State Council*  
*for Educational Research and Training*  
(DTE & SCERT)  
*Odisha, India.*

Dr. Elisa Backer  
*Faculty of Business*  
*Federation University Australia*  
*Australia.*

Dr. Ahmad Alkhawaldeh  
*Department of Curriculum and instruction*  
*University of Jordan*  
*Jordan.*

Dr. Mehmet Akif Sözer  
*Department of Primary Education*  
*Gazi Faculty of Education*  
*Gazi University*  
*Turkey.*
Table of Content

A review on the relationship between critical thinking skills and learning domains of Turkish Language
Epçakan Cahit

Evaluation of Turkish teacher candidates’ perception of note taking concept
Hüseyin Özçakmak and Okan Sarığöz

Evaluation of Turkey’s 2013 Visual Arts (Grades 1-8) curriculum
Eylem Tataroğlu

Perceptions of democracy of foreign students studying at Mustafa Kemal University
Servet HAL and Fatih ÖZYURT
A review on the relationship between critical thinking skills and learning domains of Turkish Language

Epçaçan Cahit

Department of Turkish Language Teaching, Faculty of Education, University of Siirt, Turkey.

Received 15 November, 2018; Accepted 20 December, 2018

Knowledge has been transforming and progressing at an unprecedented pace at the present time. In the face of the incomprehensible transformation and progression of the knowledge, human beings have had to change their vital needs. Education is among these vital needs. In the last century, particularly in the last quarter of the century, the developments in the knowledge and science necessitate the formation of relevant education-instruction programs. In today’s world, raising individuals who can keep up with this progress and transformation has become the main responsibility of educational institutions. One of the most important issues that are emphasized in the new curriculums is to raise individuals who perceive knowledge and life from a critical perspective, produce, manage and interpret knowledge. Instead of the understanding that accepts the knowledge as is not or the challenges in the life without questioning, it is aimed to raise individuals who question the knowledge and life through how and why questions, investigate, reason and produce new knowledge. This can be actualized only by raising generations with a critical understanding. Therefore, one of the basic skills that are aimed to be developed through the new curriculums which have been created with a constructive approach is the critical thinking skill. Critical thinking skills play a fundamental role in terms of improving other basic language skills which are targeted to be provided within the Turkish language course curriculum, in addition to the four basic learning domains given as reading, speaking, listening, and writing. The impact of critical learning cannot be rejected in terms of the development of all basic language skills. Individuals with advanced critical reading, critical speaking, critical listening and critical writing skills approach to situations and incidents with a disciplined, systematized and questioning understanding. They also improve other skills like creative thinking, communication, problem-solving, decision making, using information technologies, investigation, and entrepreneurship which are included in the curriculum.

Key words: Basic language skills, skill, thinking, knowledge, critical thinking, thinking skill.

INTRODUCTION

In today’s world, individuals face thousands of stimulants every day in social media, internet, books; in other words, in every sphere of life. It is certain that individuals who accept this information without questioning are under...
Various threats. The incidents took place in recent years reveal the severity of the issue. Keeping up with the track of a life-cycle where informatics and communication spread in an uncontrollable and rapid manner in such an extent has become the duty of societies. Therefore, the curriculums that have been created recently pursue the objective of raising individuals who do not accept every kind of stimulants and approach to the stimulant with a critical understanding, asking-questioning, thinking creatively, have the ability to solve the problems individually, and well-equipped in terms of knowledge and technology; briefly individuals with developed critical thinking skills.

In the new Turkish language course curriculum, development of basic language skills, critical thinking skill and high-level thinking skills constitute the foundation of the program. Because Turkish language course is not a memorization course that knowledge it thought. It is a skill course that an individual demonstrates speaking, listening and writing language skills and high-level thinking domain. In the Turkish language course, learning occurs as a result of intellectual, cognitive processes of basic language skills.

Developments which emerge both in the world of science and technology reveal that the 21st century required an education system which is not knowledge-oriented yet skill-oriented. In the curriculum which was created based on the assumption that basic skills are effective in terms of language development, an importance is attached to the cognitive and affective learning domains of an individual. Many activities are performed in Turkish language curriculums with the purpose of developing basic language skills, because actualization of learning differs depending on the development of language. Along with the development in the language skills and four main learning domains based on the language skills of the individual, the individual actualizes the learning process in a more productive way.

Critical thinking skill plays an important role in terms of the development of language and internalization of the acquisitions that are mentioned in the curriculum by students. The use of sub-skills of critical thinking which are questioning, asking questions, interpretation, criticizing, asserting different opinions in the implementation of activities related to the basic learning domains of reading, speaking listening and writing would make the development of these four learning domains more productive. Therefore, implementation of critical thinking skill and other skills which are the sub-skills of it in every kind of activity and practice in the Turkish language courses would improve the language skill which is the core of thinking. The primary purpose expected from the Turkish language course is the realization of qualified reading, listening, speaking and writing performances. The delivery of Turkish language courses in a critical manner is significant to achieve this goal.

Purpose and significance of the research

The purpose of this study is to identify the relationship between critical thinking skill and learning domains of Turkish language which are reading, listening, speaking and writing. Critical thinking takes place effectively in curriculums that have been created in recent years. Organizing the reading, listening, speaking and writing domains with a critical understanding and bringing them to individuals have become one of the most important requirements of being a contemporary society. The study, in which the impact of critical thinking skill on learning domains is investigated, is a qualitative study and formed in the literature review model. In the descriptive survey model which aims at revealing a situation as it is, the incident, individual or objected that is subjected to the research, is tried to be defined in its own circumstances and as it is. There are no efforts of changing and affecting them (Karasar, 2011).

The critical thinking skill is an essential life skill among the 21st-century skills which guides an individual to make an independent and emancipated decision. In the recent years, teaching the critical thinking skill to students and improving their basic language skills such as reading, listening, speaking and writing have been emphasized in the preparation of educational curriculum in modern and democratic societies. In the curriculums, teaching of the four aforementioned basic learning domains with a critical understanding to individuals is among the expected outcomes of the education process, because one of the most important steps of advancing in science and technology is raising individuals with critical and creative thinking ability. This study is unique as it addresses such a significant issue, and it makes an important contribution to the field.

Thinking

Thinking is accepted as formulating an opinion on any issue, occupy one's mind, reflecting, reconsidering an opinion in detail, and making analysis-synthesis in the sources. In the TDKD (2011), thinking is defined as an independent and authentic state of mind independently of senses, impressions and imagination; making comparisons, merging, the competence of comprehending connections and forms. Cüceloğlu (1999) defines thinking as a cognitive process which is active, goal-oriented and organized. When the definitions made on thinking are examined, we can say that thinking is a cognitive process that high-level skills of an individual take a functional action consciously in line with a goal.

In the curriculums which have been prepared in recent years thinking skill has been attached a great importance. The issues as how students think, why they should think, pondering on events and situations, making assessments
and what they should think has become important issues that have been given emphasis by the educational scientists. In the traditional curriculums, the knowledge was passed to students through a system based on memorization; on the other hand, in the new instruction models, it is suggested to make activities as producing new knowledge through cognitive processes of students' old knowledge and knowledge they acquired by thinking and reconsidering. The thinking skill becomes prominent also in the focus of these studies. Therefore, bringing the thinking skill becomes so important in the process of learning and teaching of formal education. The individuals whose thinking skills are developed also acquire the skills of understanding and interpreting what they read, see, listen and experience in a better way. As thinking is a straight cognitive process, it also improves various skills of intelligence. Due to the fact that high-level cognitive skills such as elimination, questioning, classification, selection, sorting, analysis, synthesis and assessment enter into a transaction, these skills also find an opportunity to improve at the meantime. Language is the concrete form of thinking. Without language, thinking cannot come to life. Hence, improvement of language skills facilitates the expression of thinking as well.

CRITICAL THINKING AND ITS INSTRUCTION

Not only in our country, but also in other societies of the world, programs towards improving critical thinking skill have been implemented for the last half-century and practices and activities towards this understanding have been made in textbooks and schools. Unfortunately, in this sense, studies have just started to be carried out in our country. Apart from the curriculums applied in the recent period, a rote-learning model based on passing information had been used in the curriculums applied until today. In programs that are applied within this model, an individual was only responsible for memorizing the given knowledge. On the other hand, teachers had the position of individuals who passed knowledge. However, with the constructive approach-curriculum model that has been applied in recent years, after 2005, the education-instruction model in which student realize his/her own learning, and critical thinking and multiple learning are applied have been implemented. In this model, the teacher only has the role of a guidance and mentor.

A student is an individual who investigates, find and apply the knowledge in life. In this model, applications which aim at improving students' high-level cognitive and affective skills are given place, and an education-instruction model in which students are active in learning and knowledge, instead of memorization, is made permanent through cognitive restructuring is implemented. One of the most important main principals of the new model is to raise individuals who develop a critical understanding of what is read, listened, seen or experienced. This will be the key to both personal and social development. An individual thinks more conveniently, independently and freely, make independent decisions, and in this way, it will be possible to develop unique ideas. Students should be able to question what they do not understand or curious about freely and judge the knowledge which is provided by elders and teachers. It should not be forgotten that critical thinking arises in such an environment.

The word 'critical' is described as examining, testing and judging the foundation and accuracy of knowledge in TDKD (2011). The origin of the word 'critical' is Greek and the Greek word, 'kritikos' which means questioning, judging and assessing had spread from other languages herefrom.

On the other hand, critical thinking is the approach of an individual to what is read, seen, listened and experienced, and not believing them imprudently. Ennis (2007), states that critical thinking skill is an integrated skill consisted of the combination of various skills regarding expression styles, cognitive methods and assessment. Ennis (2007), states that critical thinking skill is an integrated skill consisted of the combination of various skills regarding expression styles, cognitive methods and assessment. The writer adds that a critical thinker has various types of skills such as questioning, focusing on the problem, internalizing the basic concepts regarding thoughts, making inference and observation and paying attention to assumptions. On the other hand, Nosich (2012) states that critical thinking is trying to understand the logic of the concepts by questioning and drawing a conclusion from this logic.

Critical thinking which is defined as analyzing, conscious questioning of an individual against the life incidents is a skill which is formed according to certain principles. In the face of any written or visual incident/situation that an individual read, listened, seen, came across or experienced in the life-cycle, first of all, the individual: confronts an incident/situation, recognizes the incident/situation, perceives the incident/situation, makes a research/examination on the incident/situation, collects information on the incident/situation, makes analyses, makes logical links between collected information and reasoning (cause-effect, condition-effect, purpose-effect, etc.), analyses the information, processes it through high-level cognitive operations, makes interpretations, makes assessments, reaches a general conclusion, integrates, and reconstructs and expresses.

Starting from the earlier explanations and definitions, we can express critical thinking as an individual's questioning, examining, scrutinizing of an information or incident which come across in life, and reaching a conclusion through an evaluation as a result of these process. Critical thinking is a complex process of
cognitive operations. An individual who gained critical thinking skill is aware of what he/she is doing with which purpose; has a high level of problem-solving skills, thinks analytically and has advanced reasoning skills. An individual who uses a text in a book that we read in the daily life, new on published by the press or a sentence made by a politician in his/her life by filtering them through the processes given earlier acquire critical thinking skill. Critical thinking is an acquisition for an individual to lead a happy and successful life. Raising individuals equipped with this skill is one of the main objectives of education.

We bring acquisitions to our students in our curriculum through critical thinking skill. Individuals with advanced critical learning attain characteristics as free-thinking, independent decision making, reasoning, develop empathy, being tolerant to different opinions, being open to innovations, being neutral, comprehending the truth and realizing problems. Turkish language course is the course which critical thinking skill can be taught in the most effective manner. Turkish language course has the characteristic for improving students' high-level cognitive skills through the four basic language skills. The domains of reading, writing, listening, speaking are domains that an individual’s use constantly in a lifetime. Curriculums which will be prepared in these learning domains should be prepared in accordance with the critical thinking skill. An individual who uses questioner-learning in cognitive and effective learning processes regularly starting from the first years of primary school approach any situation that he/she seen, experienced, and came across in every sphere of life with a critical understanding, not only with what was taught in school. Therefore, Turkish language course has a fundamental position in this sense. The critical thinking skill should not be limited with courses yet students should be advised to use these skills in other aspects of life as well. Because, it should be considered that these skills can be forgotten or become blunt in the case that students do not alter them into a lifestyle, a perspective. Therefore, it should be ensured that the preparation of curriculums, not only in the Turkish language course but in all courses, are made in line with the aim of developing students’ cognitive and effective critical thinking skills.

Students who gain the critical thinking skill, on what they read, listened or experienced:

(1) Assert different opinions courageously  
(2) Ask questions without hesitations or concerns  
(3) Have increased interest in courses and success  
(4) Acquire the culture of democracy  
(5) Learn how to be protected from the negative impacts of social media  
(6) Learn how to think logically  
(7) Can distinguish the contradictions between thoughts immediately  
(8) Obtain the skills of questioning stereotyped judgements, traditions, social judgments, values and beliefs undauntedly  
(9) Comprehends semantic relations such as cause-effect, purpose-effect, and condition-effect immediately  
(10) See the differences and similarities between the expressed judgements  
(11) Make a semantic sorting  
(12) Can question the accuracy and inaccuracy of a de facto judgement  
(13) Try to prove it by presenting alternative ideas  
(14) Try to find the new and different constantly  
(15) Learn about the discussion culture  
(16) Become self-confident  
(17) Do not abstain from discussion and investigate the information to prove his/her opinions  
(18) Put an emphasis on details  
(19) Make detailed observation and examinations  
(20) Produce new knowledge through cognitive reconstruction by synthesizing previous and current knowledge  
(21) Present alternative solutions to problems  
(22) Think logically, analytically and systematically  
(23) Have strong written and verbal expression

Beside high-level of cognitive and affective skills, students with advanced critical thinking skills also have high academic success. Because students with advanced questioning and investigation skills develop a critical understanding of their current knowledge or incidents occur in life in other courses apart from the learning domains of Turkish language course. The skills will become permanent in students with practices based on critical thinking. Despite the fact that practices in critical thinking skill give different results, the essential point is the development of critical understanding of students. Educational institutions should not only provide information yet should prepare individuals to the life and challenging conditions of it. Individuals with advanced thinking skills are prepared to live better. With an improvement in critical thinking skills, new advancements in science and technology will also take place. Accordingly, new ideas will emerge both in science and technology. The development of science and technology is only possible with individuals’ openness to new developments, having authentic ideas, being tolerant towards differentiated and production of new ideas. Critical thinking does not only ensure the internal development of an individual. It also contributes to the emergence of developments in science and technology that enhance the living conditions of an individual and allowing them to live in a more convenient world. Therefore, an individual who can read, write, speak, listen critically or perceive issues from a critical perspective display accurate behaviors and responses by analyzing many situations.
precisely.

Many studies have been conducted on inserting critical thinking skill in curriculums in a systematic and permanent manner and on the delivery of instruction, and all educational scientists have been carrying out research studies on the issue. Karadüz (2010) emphasized the importance of bringing critical thinking skills in terms of supporting and improving language skills and states that students’ critical thinking skills should be improved in order to realize the acquisitions of basic language skills such as listening, speaking, reading and writing. A critical thinking skill which consists of various high-level cognitive skills as understanding, comprehending, analyzing, describing, questioning, reasoning and is a significant milestone for raising individuals who will respond to our century

The principles and rules of critical thinking should be taught to students from the first years of primary school. How to perform critical thinking, how a critical thinking will be brought to students and which phases to be followed to achieve this should be included in curriculums. In order to raise generations who think critically and realize critical learning, first of all, our teachers should have a critical understanding. It is not possible for a teacher who was raised within a traditional, rote-learning based education system to raise individuals who are thinking critically, questioning, scrutinizing and have cognitive flexibility and readiness. Therefore it is important that our teachers also have critical thinking skill and received education in this field. Individuals who think with a critical understanding have the constant curiosity of investigation and examination. They have the skill of questioning on the incidents and situations that they read, saw, listened, or experience through the questions of “what, how, why”. They have thinking structure which is open-minded, unprejudiced, transparent, reasonable, and logical. They have an understanding which implements the knowledge in their lives, support the ideas with pieces of evidence, able to solve the problems, use the verbal and written language efficiently, respectful to other opinions, yet questioning.

In this framework, teachers have important responsibilities. Teachers who support critical thinking in their classrooms contribute to students’ scientific development and enhance the positive attitude towards critical thinking. When critical thinking skills are used regularly in the lectures, the participation of students in the critical thinking process demonstrates a tendency to increase (Seferoğlu and Akbıyık, 2006). Wilks (2005) indicates that students who think critically are more participative, do not avoid discussion, make assumptions and inferences, come up with alternatives, develop different meanings from the opinions, and argue that teachers that will educate students who have the aforementioned characteristics should also gain these competencies. Furthermore, in the “Teacher Behavior Supporting Critical Thinking Inventory” conducted by Akin (2012), it was stated that teachers should possess the behaviors of being open-minded, questioning the accuracy and credibility of the information, searching for reason-evidence, advanced level of questioning and openness, and included the sub-dimensions. Qian (2007) states that education improves the life of an individual in every aspect and indicates that education aims at raising individuals who think critically and possess the required knowledge to solve problems. Forrester (2008) argues that the skills, which are presented in the following, should be taught as the first step to improve students’ high-level thinking skills.

(1) Considering and assessing different perspectives
(2) Open-mindedness
(3) Developing logical arguments through appropriate evidence
(4) Identifying the strong and weak aspects of an argument
(5) Identifying the prejudice of oneself and others
(6) Identifying priorities and importance
(7) Analyzing the features of sources
(8) Synthesizing from different sources
(9) Questioning from the general to the specific
(10) Questioning from the specific to the general
(11) Problem-solving
(12) Developing standards for evaluation
(13) Evaluating self-decision making process
(14) Evaluating self-work and other’s work
(15) Making a purposeful and reflective judgement
(16) Self-control

A teacher who aims at enhancing critical thinking skills of students should consider the following points:

(1) Applying instruction methods that will help students to think multi-dimensionally in their lectures,
(2) Bringing their students the skill of approaching what is read, listened, experienced or seen with, briefly any incident or situation that they experience in life, with a questioning and investigative approach,
(3) Providing a democratic environment that students can express their thoughts freely during lectures and activities,
(4) Setting students with homework, responsibilities and duties that will improve their skills of examination and reaching information,
(5) Providing opportunities that will develop students personal initiative skills both in classroom and out-of-class,
(6) Creating learning areas that students will realize exchange of opinions in co-operation with their friends,
(7) Going beyond curriculums and textbooks if it is necessary to reveal their students’ personal skills,
(8) Being fair among their students,
(9) Not imposing their truth on students, not using an imposing tone, and reflecting this feeling to students,
(10) Giving students time for thinking, making independent decisions etc.,
(11) Creating spaces that students use the knowledge they obtained in life,
(12) Providing a classroom environment that students discuss any issue freely and conveniently,
(13) Providing an opportunity for students to interact through interactive methods,
(14) Asking incongruous questions to reveal the creative side of students and demand them to make research on the answers,
(15) Believing that there can be other truths besides theirs and develop this opinion in students as well,
(16) Following a method that allows students to reach different opinions by asking open-ended questions
(17) Listening to their students with interest and respect even they are inaccurate,
(18) Performing implementations that ensure students’ cognitive development,
(19) Creating a free lecture environment that students can produce new ideas.

Erdamar and Alpan (2017) identified the characteristics that a teacher who thinks critically should possess and presented the given conclusions: should respect student opinions; should be a role model for students in terms of critical thinking; should establish a democratic and safe learning environment; should keep up with the innovations in the field; should listen to students; should be open to criticism, should be unprejudiced, and should appeal to the individual differences of students by using different techniques.

FOUR BASIC CRITICAL THINKING-BASED LEARNING DOMAINS

Language instruction is a major step for a society to become a contemporary society both in science and social life. Individuals who realize language instruction completely, raise as successful individuals and serve to the society they live in. Rafi (2011) indicates that critical thinking broadens students learning experiences and gives a more meaningful shape to the language for them. Language instruction which is provided from the first years of primary school is included in curriculums as the main point of both academic success and starting the life as a healthy and happy individual with advanced social skills. One of the most important components of language instruction is critical thinking. The Turkish language course curriculums that have been created in recent years have been created by taking critical thinking skills as the baseline. In the latest Turkish Language Course Curriculum, the fact that thinking and critical thinking are the main philosophies of the curriculum has been emphasized by the expression given as “raising individuals who understand what they listen, watch, and read; expressing their feelings, thoughts and dreams; think critically and creatively, take responsibility; entrepreneurial; coherent with the environment; make investigation, criticizing and interpretation of incidents, situations and information a habit starting from their accumulation of knowledge” (MEB, 2006: 3). In curriculums, the concept of ‘critical’ is given a wide place. The relationship between each learning domain related to basic learning domains and the concept of “critical” has been underlined. The domains of reading, listening, speaking and writing have been included extensively, and it was aimed to improve critical thinking skills while these learning domains are being discussed.

Critical reading

The reading skill which is a complex cognitive process the interpretation of signs and symbols that are perceived with the help of an eye after certain cognitive processes. Ülper (2010) defines reading as a repetitive interpretation process with an emotional aspect actualized by individuals who recognize the semantic and grammatical features of the language that the written text is produced, by analyzing codes and using a set of strategies in accordance with certain objectives. Ferah (2005) states that reading is a cognitive activity arises as a result of the cooperation and collaboration of the sense organs and voice devices with the purpose of interpreting and inferring pressed or written signs. Günes (2007) asserts that reading is an active process that an individual produces new meanings by associating and integrating his/her pre-knowledge with the information in the text. Starting from these definitions, we can state that reading is an interpretation process. In other words, it is the process of interpretation and reconstruction of voices in the brain after certain cognitive processes.

On the other hand, critical reading is approaching to a text with a questioning and sceptical approach, interpreting the text accurately, comprehending the feelings and thoughts that are tried to be expressed in the text effectively, and to have a command on the text from every aspect. An individual who consider the action of reading with a critical understating acquire the skill of reading and interpreting a text more in detail, sensitively and multi-dimensionally. Before interpreting and reconstructing each test that is read in the mind, cognitive processes as questioning, interpreting and thinking on alternative opinions are performed. After these processes, reconstruction of the text is completed in the mind. The accuracy of the information given in the text is investigated, a comparison is made between the previous knowledge, inferences on the text are made, the internal
Critical reading requires a student to approach the text with an entirely independent perspective. The reader should only perceive the purpose of the writer for writing text and should put an effort to understand the text. Because reading is just about the perception of visual indicators and interpretation entirely based on the text. The reader should not go beyond the meanings given in the text and contribute self-interpretations. The comments and assessment should adhere to the root of the text as well. The visible and nonvisible meanings are also revealed by adhering to the text. The critical reader also gains the ability to expose the new meanings that are hidden by the writer in words, sentences and paragraphs by going beyond the visible meaning of the text by communicating with the writer over the text through the high-level thinking skills. In today's world that thousands of publications find a place on the shelves every day whether they are scientific or not, individuals can be protected from the informatics ignorance and being affected from the pieces that are written with malicious intentions depend on individuals' possession of critical thinking skills and acquisitions of questioning- critical reading skills.

Therefore, it is important that individuals make healthy readings, and perform reading activities that will improve them and contribute to their academic, cognitive and intellectual development. The importance of critical reading comes to the fore more clearly in this process.

Critical listening

Listening learning domain is one of the learning domains that individuals access information at most. Unfortunately, we live in an era that individuals read less yet are exposed to listening in a constant manner. We are in an age that media is all-pervasive through communication mediums such as the internet, radio and smart devices, and have a constant impact on us. Every moment that we live, we confront a propaganda, a trailer, a political speech or an advertisement through these mediums. In the face of these discourses that are presented to us with or without our will, having a critical listening skill will ensure us to make more accurate decisions in life. Every day, the most private spheres of our lives are exposed to thousands of commercial product advertisements, political propaganda discourses and movies. Our children grow up with these discourses. Therefore, embedding the critical listening understanding in our children from the early ages will help them to make more accurate decisions in the following years both as a choice of life and in general sense. An individual with a critical listening skill will question what is listened, filter them with truth, examine them profoundly and make comparisons with previous learnings when he/she listens to all of the concepts and thoughts that he/she hear with or without
consent during the circle of life with a ‘critical’ understanding, and in this way will be able to decide on accuracy or inaccuracy of them. When listening turns into a qualification, the individuals will have the skill to make healthier assessments.

An individual with a critical listening skill gives healthier response after processing the listened information with cognitive processes which are in line with the critical understanding. When a listener obtains a critical reading skill, she/he sets listening objectives, make assumptions on the issue before listening, and asks detailed questions to the speaker during listening. In this way, the listener also provides a skill to the speaker to respond with a stronger evidence. Because listening to the given information with a questioning understanding, also allows the individual to activate the previous knowledge in mind and to give an accurate response to the speaker based on this previous knowledge.

An individual who listens critically also improves high-level thinking skills as the quick-thinking skills are gained. Because in terms of listening, both listening organ and the mind have very active positions. The listener listens the every word of the speaker attentively to the smallest until, and processes the thoughts of the speaker cognitively by considering the all the situations as the purpose of speaking, what is told, why it is told, to whom it is told, by whom it is told and whether the thoughts are consistent or not. The listener is the mood of constant active listening. Therefore, every expression that is made is examined and assessed. After various cognitive processes such as questioning during listening, the consistency of the expression in itself and in terms of the reality of life, creating alternative ideas, comparison, reasoning, interpretation and assessment, the expressed thought is reconstructed through an integration with the previous knowledge. In the listening process, the listener should think very quickly and focus entirely on the speaker during these processes.

Critical writing

Another important learning domain that is developed by the critical thinking skill is the critical writing. Göçer (2010) defines writing as an expression of the ones who have the power of thinking on their opinions, ideas, feelings, observation, experiments and experiences in the scale of the selected topic, appropriately to the rules of the language. The components such as; having a rich vocabulary, a constant reading skill, a command on the grammar and structure of the language and s skill to order incidents or situations in a consistent and logical manner, are effective in the development of the writing skill which is also defined as writing down the knowledge, opinions, emotions and dreams regular by an individual.

The four learning domains of the Turkish language are very associated to each other very closely. A development in one of them also affects others. In learning and teaching processes, reading, listening, speaking and writing domains develop each other in an integrative manner. The most important domain that has a direct impact on the writing skill is the reading learning domain. The development of the writing, particularly the critical writing skill, is connected with the development of the reading and critical reading skills. An individual who reads has a richer vocabulary, imagination and a broad perspective gains the skill of multi-dimensional thinking about the incidents and situations, has advanced high-level thinking skills such as reasoning, questioning etc.,
and becomes informed about the language and expression characteristics of texts. Therefore, the first step of writing is reading. Therefore we should improve the reading skill in individuals at first in order to improve the writing skill.

Critical writing is based on making a research on the topic that will be written on and writing down thoughts, emotions and dreams with a questioning and critical understanding by an individual. In order to develop the critical writing skill in an individual, first of all, the individuals should have the joy of writing and should be informed about the topic that will be written about from all aspects. An individual should have the knowledge accumulation, cultural richness and life experience on the subject that will be criticized, because an individual cannot have the competency of criticizing and questioning the issues which are not known. An individual should be able to write on topics that will inform readers or that will make them enjoyed, to give a logical shape to the incidents and situations while writing, competent on technical issues as spelling rules and grammar, have the confidence for writing, and should be able to consider issues from a different perspective. In addition, the individual should be able to use high-level thinking skills such as questioning, reasoning, producing different alternatives, visualization of what will be written in mind, organization, classification, ordering, making analysis-synthesis and assessments while writing with a critical understanding. Critical writing is a cognitive and intellectual process entirely. It is writing down the emotions and thoughts through cognitive processes. The formation of this textual structure which is written down within the framework of consistency criteria is important in terms of the semantic and formal integrity of the text. The correct use of grammar, spelling, punctuation, language and expression will enhance the impact of the text on readers.

**DISCUSSION**

Recently, the critical thinking skill has stated to be involved in education-instruction processes considerably. The critical thinking skill particularly has a significance in terms of language teaching and teaching students to approach life with a critical and questioning perspective. The research studies conducted on the issue also demonstrate that individuals with advanced thinking skills perform language teaching more easily. It is a well-known fact that students with an advanced critical thinking skill are more successful in reading, listening, speaking and writing skills. Escobar (2017) emphasized that the critical thinking skill is integrated with subjects of various courses, and indicated that the skills of critical reading, critical listening, critical speaking and critical writing are improved with critical content in the curriculum. The contribution of foreign language education supported by critical thinking skill on the development of students basic language skills such as reading skills (Fahim and Sa’eepour, 2011; Fahim et al., 2012), writing skills (Bayram, 2015; Rafi, 2011; Şenkaya, 2005; Moghaddam and Malekzadeh, 2011), listening skills (Malmir and Shoorcheh, 2012) and speaking skills (Fahim and Koleini, 2014; Khodashenas and Farahani, 2014; Sanavi and Tarighat, 2014; Uğurlu, 2018: 50).

In the literature, there are various studies that can support the positive relationship between language skills and critical thinking skill. These studies also have features that also support our study. Çiftçi (2006) focused on the question of how critical reading should be in the article written with the title of critical reading and indicated the characteristics of a critical reader. In this study, Çiftçi reached the result that gaining the habit of reading with a critical understanding is considerably effective and important in individuals' academic and social lives. Karadüz (2010) also highlights the importance of critical thinking skill in terms of developing language skills in a way to support our study, in the study, carried out under the name of language skills and critical thinking. In addition, the writer reached the result that methods and techniques that will sustain critical thinking skills in a learning environment in order to improve students basic language skills. Furthermore, the writer indicated that the teacher and the approach of the teacher plays an important role in terms of bringing critical thinking skills to students. In the theoretical section of the study that was conducted Söylemez (2015) on the development of basic language skills scales towards secondary school students, it was found out that bringing critical thinking skill to students is important. In the study conducted by İşlekeller (2008) based on the critical thinking skills titled the impact of Turkish language teaching on gain, critical thinking levels and attitudes normal and gifted children, the impact of critical thinking skill on Turkish language teaching was investigated. In the study, the pretest-posttest design among the testing models. As a result of the study, it was found out that curriculums that are prepared with the critical thinking understanding increase students success levels and affect their attitudes towards Turkish language course positively. The study that was carried out by Akdan (2016) which examined the impact of prospective teachers’ critical thinking tendencies on reading skills, it was found out that critical thinking skill contributes to critical thinking in a positive way. Tiryaki (2011) reached to the conclusion that there is a statistically significant and positive correlation between critical thinking and argumentative text writing as a result of the study that was conducted with the purpose of determining the relationship between university students’ argumentative text writing skills, writing anxiety and critical think skills. In addition, Özensoy (2011) found out in the study conducted to reveal the impact of social
The development of basic language skills and critical thinking skills included in the Turkish language course curriculums are considered as important and required skills from the spheres of individuals’ academic and life-success. Supporting reading, listening, speaking, and writing skills of individuals with a critical understanding; and provision of education from students from the early years of formal education with critical equipment, not only in the Turkish language course but in all courses, will enable to realize themselves. When a human being has a command on the specifics of his/her mother language, the thinking skills also improve. In today’s world that information transforms quickly, individuals who produce knowledge contribute value to the societies they live in. The main way of producing knowledge is developing reading, listening, speaking, and writing skills with a critical understanding. Therefore, language domains in Turkish language courses should be developed with a critical understanding with the purpose of developing these four learning domains. Students’ critical and questioning approach to the courses that they take in the scope of formal education, and to the incidents and situations that they confront in life will be the main principle for success. Students’ use of instructional methods and approaches that enable them to think multi-dimensionally, support their authenticity, encourage them and enable them to produce new knowledge will also enhance their reading, listening, speaking, and writing skills. The key to being a modern society is to raise such a generation.

**SUGGESTIONS**

Parents and teachers have great responsibilities in terms of the development of individuals’ critical thinking skills and basic language skills such as reading, listening, speaking, and writing.

1. Teachers should teach about critical reading, critical listening, critical speaking, and critical writing methods/techniques in lectures and ensure that students gain these skills. Activities should be performed for developing these four main learning domains with a critical understanding.

2. In order to develop the critical thinking skill, a democratic background should be set in the school, home, and social environment, the idea that tolerance should be shown to individuals with different opinions should be given to students from early ages, and environments that enable individuals to express feelings and thoughts freely should be created.

3. In-service seminars/trainings should be provided to teachers on the subject of teaching the critical thinking skill.

4. Individuals with different, controversial, authentic and
creative opinions should be encouraged, their ideas should not be underestimated and received with tolerance. (5) In curriculums that will be prepared, activities and practices which improve critical thinking should be given more place.

CONFLICT OF INTERESTS

The authors have not declared any conflict of interests.

REFERENCES


Fahim M, Saeepour M (2011) The Impact of Teaching Critical Thinking Skills on Reading Comprehension of Iranian EFL Learners Journal of Language Teaching and Research 2(4). DOI: 10.4304/jltr.2.4.867-874

Ferah A (2005). First Reading And Writing In Turkish In Every Aspect. İstanbul: MEB Publications.


Full Length Research Paper

Evaluation of Turkish teacher candidates’ perception of note taking concept

Hüseyin Özçakmak* and Okan Sarigoz

Department of Turkish Language Education, Education Faculty, Hatay Mustafa Kemal University, Turkey.

Received 1 October, 2018; Accepted 26 November, 2018

Note taking is individual’s recording of the attraction grabbing, unknown or newly learned knowledge in brief notes so as to remember afterwards. Note taking nowadays is no longer a routine action for students but viewed as a skill. In fact, students do not take note of all the word being taught in classes but record the knowledge in short notes, sometimes even shortening the words in a way understandable to them. The purpose of this study is to determine Turkish Language Teaching Department students’ perception of note taking concept. The sample of the research is composed of 163 teacher candidates’ of Hatay Mustafa Kemal University in 1st, 2nd, 3rd or 4th grade of Turkish Language Teaching Department from 2017-2018 education year. The method of the research was chosen as descriptive phenomenologic pattern as one of qualitative research patterns. In the research, 301 opinions of 32 themes were gathered related to writing down important information, writing down the knowledge that should not be forgotten, writing down as one can make sense of, writing shortly, writing down so one can review later and writing down the useful parts. As a result of the research it was found that teacher candidates mostly confuse note taking and summarizing concepts, candidates mostly take notes in occasions of seminars, symposiums, and conferences, most themes of the note taking were developed by 1st grade students, most opinions were stated by 3rd grade students, female teacher candidates were more interested and sensitive in note taking compared to male candidates.

Key words: Note taking, recording, perception, Turkish teacher candidates.

INTRODUCTION

Notes are the recall writings for the individual to remember the learned information later. Note taking is individual’s recording of the unknown or attention grabbing subjects while learning in brief parts. According to Hebert et al. (2014), note taking takes place when the people who feel inadequate in terms of knowledge come across new information; they record this information in brief notes.

*Corresponding author. E-mail: huseyinozcakm@gmail.com.

Author(s) agree that this article remain permanently open access under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License 4.0 International License.
must comprehend the content, detect whether the content is worth for note taking and restructure the content in a short way (Mueller and Oppenheimer, 2016).

Note taking is a widely used method of university students during the lectures, even considered a skill. It mostly can be thought as learning the knowledge of the lecture or preserving the information (Teng, 2011). Note taking in classes and reviewing the notes afterwards develops remembering the subjects in short and long terms and helps alleviate forgetfulness by forming permanent patterns in one’s mind (Eades and Moore, 2007). The actual value of note taking is the reviewing part rather than recording process (Luo et al., 2018). Even though empirical studies verify the efficiency of note taking and reviewing the taken notes, this does not indicate that university students can improve their academic success only by taking notes in the lectures. Discussions of in-class note taking action’s effect on academic performance is not only focused on difference between taking or not taking notes or reviewing or not reviewing the taken notes. There are other factors such as focusing on the class, motivation, note taking amount, note taking quality, existence in the class level, teacher’s knowledge of the field that are impacting academic performance and success (Chen, 2013).

Although recent developments of the technology sign presentation of course content in wider information technologies, note taking still remains important until the day (Cortez, 2010). Because a study by Bohay et al. (2011) shows that presenting the knowledge to the students in form of video creates very little difference in their performances. However, note taking forms a bond between the student and course material. Students who cannot form a bond with the material taught, mostly cannot take efficient notes in verbal presentations and do not develop good note taking skills (Eades and Moore, 2007). This situation shows that we have to think twice about students’ development of note taking skills. The question to be answered is, whether the students should take random notes or effective notes. Considering the fact that students take notes beginning from primary school until university, effective note taking by capturing the knowledge is mostly left to the responsibility of the student (Cortez, 2010). The state influencing students’ success positively or negatively, mostly depend on the quality of notes taken by the students (Moos, 2009). Taking good and quality notes develops students’ listening and writing abilities as well as helping keeping the knowledge in memory for long terms, reinforcing memorization, articulating the learned knowledge in different expressions (Cortez, 2010).

Note taking facilitates better understanding of the students since it makes active participation in the class possible with materials. Also, notes taken by students can be used as clues for better remembering (Bohay et al., 2011). Note taking is a learning skill that is effective both during the class and after the class. It is important for students to utilize taken notes to express themselves or the subject (Dündar, 2015). In cases where notes are not taken related to newly learned knowledge, remembering the knowledge at a later time gets harder. Thus, according to Bohay et al. (2011), there is a gap between the performance of the individuals just after taking notes and a week later. Testing the performances after a week, remembering skill impairs.

Note taking generally consists of two dimensions, namely recording and archiving. Recording is the dimension which aims to prevent forgetting the shared or read knowledge momentarily. Archiving is dimension that includes keeping the notes in order to be utilized afterwards, operating on them and summarizing. In other words, recording is related to note taking while archiving is related to summarization. These dimensions are made up of consequent higher level skills.

By the development of technology in recent years, note taking has been transformed. The first stage of note taking, that is recording, has moved to a higher level. There has been changes in note taking methods of students in classes. It is possible to observe students taking pictures of the boards rather than writing on a notebook with a pencil in classical method. Notes can also be taken by many softwares set up on phones or computers. There are some advantages of digital notes with respect to classical pencil-notebook notes. The most prominent advantages are that, notes do not cover much space, can be shared with e-mail and information technology programmes any time, and has recalling function for cases deemed important. The programmes such as EndNote, EverNote, to-do list, SimpleNote, even though they have differences, can realize the function of note taking everywhere. Computers offer advantage on note taking process. Besides the researchers who argue that note taking by computers is more beneficial than those taken by pencils and notebooks (Sim, 2013), there are some studies defending the idea that note taking by pencils help student raise their grades in cases where operations should be carried abstractly (Aragón-Mendizábal et al., 2016), and that notes taken by laptops hurts students ability to process and reconstruct the knowledge therefore learning (Mueller and Oppenheimer, 2014).

Although notes taken with note taking apps are easier and more accurate, when requirements of note taking skill are not satisfied, learning experiences may be adversely affected. Therefore while choosing note taking apps, there should be special care on drawing for student to make cognitive participation in note taking process, reformation, summarization, and emphasis in apps (Stacy and Cain, 2015).

The question that arises is that, if digital note taking apps have many advantages, why then are classical note taking methods needed at all? The answer to this
Table 1. Demographic information of the participants

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Grade level</th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>f</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1&lt;sup&gt;st&lt;/sup&gt; grade</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2&lt;sup&gt;nd&lt;/sup&gt; grade</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3&lt;sup&gt;rd&lt;/sup&gt; grade</td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4&lt;sup&gt;th&lt;/sup&gt; grade</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>163</td>
<td>100</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The question is that, note taking apps are not being widely used as of this moment. On the other hand, note taking is not only recording but also writing the knowledge in clear, comprehensible sentences with no time passing. Because as the time passes, abbreviations used might be forgotten and integrity of knowledge might be harmed.

On the other hand, borrowing the notes taken by other students or copying the notes taken well are alternative study methods preferred by students. Hence, according to the study conducted by Kim et al. (2009), an important part (68%) of university students admit taking their study notes from their friends. It was found that reviewing the notes increased the success rate (Kiewra, 1987). However, in a study again made by Kiewra et al. (1991), it was observed that those who reviewed their own notes were more successful than those who do not review at all and those who review other’s notes. Notes are personal. Notes taken by someone else is suitable with the mind form of that person. Knowledge deemed important-unimportant and causes such as formerly knowing would have impact on quality of note taking.

The most significant reason for this research was the observations of the researcher during the lecture. Another state as important as recording and archiving in the note taking, is pace of note taking being close to pace of speech. In this sense, trying to write down all the knowledge being spoken or read might be tiresome. Writing down everything is not possible and also preventing student’s focus on the lecture. In classroom observations, researcher took notice of some students trying to write down everything, this situation brought up the question of how students perceive note taking and what they think about it.

Students’ most used technique during the lecture is note taking, so as to study later. However, about this technique that is largely used from primary school to university, there is no course being taught in Turkey. Even though it is the most frequently used skill, having no learning experience on how to take notes effectively might lead students to take notes in ways understandable to them. Further, some students confuse note taking with summarization, and perceive note taking as writing down the knowledge the way it was told with no abbreviations and shortening. Therefore, in this research, note taking perception of teacher candidates were examined.

Research objectives

The purpose of this study is to determine teacher candidates’ perception of note taking concept, and to evaluate determined perceptions based on variables of gender, grade and demographic variables.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

Research model

The method used in the research was descriptive phenomenology, which is among the qualitative research patterns. Phenomenology means understanding the core or main idea of the subject. Even though phenomenologic studies do not reveal exact and generalizable results as per the nature of qualitative research methods, they provide the chance to analyze the event in depth (Tavşanlı and Akaydın, 2017: 59). Phenomenology forms a suitable basis for the research subjects that are not entirely distant from us but we are not fully capable of comprehending (Yıldırım and Şimşek, 2013: 78). Note taking skill has not been totally comprehended although it is used from primary school until university. Therefore, in our phenomenology based study, the meanings that were assigned to note taking concept by university students studying Turkish Teaching Department was analyzed.

Study group

In this research, from 2017-2018 education year in Turkish Teaching Department, Education Faculty, Hatay Mustafa Kemal University, 163 students from 1st, 2nd, 3rd and 4th grades participated. Convenience sampling method was utilized, which is among purposeful sampling methods. Convenience sampling is the selection of sample from people that are volunteers and, suitable for research and easy to Access (Gravetter and Forzano, 2012). Therefore, it provides pace and practicality to the researcher. Demographic information of the participants is stated in Table 1.

On examining Table 1, it can be seen that 56% of (92 persons) participants are female while 44% (71 persons) are male teacher candidates. In terms of grade level, 32% study in 1st grade (52
Collection and analysis of the data

Research was initiated with the purpose of revealing note taking perception of students. The data of the research was obtained by asking the students the question of “What does note taking mean, in your opinion?”. Content analysis was utilized to analyze the responses of students. It is the act of bringing together, reconstructing and arranging the similar data under certain concepts or themes (Yıldırım and Şimşek, 2013: 259).

Blank pages were given to students to write down their opinions with no restrictions or timelines. Volunteering was considered in the research, and applications were only carried out with those willing to participate. The application was completed in four class hours. No explanation was made on note taking concept in order not to disturb the perception of students; also, students were asked not to consult each other during the process. Students were labeled with codes to prevent mistaking the given answers and make the gender and grade level analyses easier. While stating direct quotes to mention the views of students, these codes were used. For instance, opinion of fifth student was abbreviated as (S5).

Code assigning began with 1st grade students and ended with 4th grade students. The qualitative analysis process that began with the first paper of 1st grade students were restarted as new themes appeared. This loop was perpetuated until the paper of the last student was reviewed in this sense and all themes were scrutinized from the top until the bottom three times in order to hinder the loss of data. Examining detailed content analysis on responses of students, themes towards,

(i) Note taking perception,
(ii) Note taking methods, and
(iii) Note taking source were produced.

Papers of students were arranged with respect to gender and grade level variables. Response of female students were gathered and analyzed at first; thereafter, responses of male students were investigated and transferred to Excel tables. This operation was performed for grade level variable, and data from 1st, 2nd, 3rd and 4th grades were recorded in different columns.

Validity and reliability

To ensure internal validity of the research, making use of literature analysis, processes of studies that were similar in topic to the present study were examined. The resulting themes were formed such that relevant ones were encompassed while irrelevant themes were ignored, data were controlled in this sense three times. To ensure external validity of the research, processes of the study were described in methods, model, study group and data analysis headings. Validity was attempted to be improved by stating the quotes from student opinions. It is very important for the persuasion of the study to state views of participants.

A solid method of reliability in qualitative study is “convenience between coders”. The same set of data coded by two experts makes the definitions sharper. Whether coders produced similar codes for the data set or not, forms the basis of the technique (Miles and Huberman, 1994). Convenience between coders were utilized to promote reliability in our study. In coding made with an expert of Turkish Education, convenience rate was 91%. This rate states the reliability of data used in the research.

FINDINGS

According to Table 2, 301 opinions were acquired from 163 students under 32 themes. So, the student candidates mostly stated the perceptions of “Writing down the important information” (f=91), “Writing down the information that should not be forgotten” (f=57), “Writing as one understands” (f=29), “Writing briefly” (f=28), “Writing so as to review later” (f=11) and “Writing the useful knowledge” (f=11).

Investigating the stated opinions, it could be seen that almost a third of teacher candidates regard note taking as writing down the important information. Some teacher candidates view note taking as a skill functioning during reading: “Note taking is underlining the parts of a text we deem important and writing it down on a different paper” (S73). Note taking is also thought as a skill applied during studying: “Writing down the important parts while studying” (S86). Moreover, a teacher candidate stated that note taking is differentiating: “Note taking is distinguishing. Instead of memorizing all the parts of a structure, it is writing down the key aspects” (S28). Similarly, a teacher candidate emphasizes that note taking has to do with choosing: “Note taking is a skill requiring selective listening” (S99). One teacher candidate articulated a more extensive view: “It is writing down the important knowledge stated verbally, visually or in written form” (S81). Therefore, note taking is not only performed with writing but with many materials.

In addition to this, the second most stated opinion (18.9%) of teacher candidates is that note taking prevents forgetfulness. This view is explained by a teacher candidate as follows: “Notes are taken to prevent forgetting” (S100). On the other hand, 9.6% of candidates express note taking as writing as one understands. A view of this opinion says “Writing what was understood from the speech” (S141).

There is the opinion of note taking as an act of shortening. One of the teacher candidates describes this as “Shortening the whole nature knowledge in clear and comprehensive way” (S40) while another teacher candidate states his opinion as follows “Writing what is being listened in abbreviated forms” (S158). This opinion also emphasizes the importance of source of knowledge.

Besides being a skill that concerns the moment, note taking gives individuals advantage for future reviews. Because another function of note taking is archiving, this issue is mentioned by teacher candidates as follows: “It is organization of the knowledge in a suitable way to review later” (S136). There are some teacher candidates who argue that note taking is useful (f=11). A teacher candidate states his opinion on that as follows: “Note taking is selecting and writing down useful information” (S2).

Examining Table 2, it was seen that 3.3% of the candidates confuse note taking with summarization. Note
Table 2. Note taking perception of teacher candidates.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Note taking perception</th>
<th>f</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>It is writing down important information.</td>
<td>91</td>
<td>30.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It is writing down the information that should not be forgotten.</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>18.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It is writing as one understands.</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>9.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It is writing briefly.</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>9.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It is writing so as to review later.</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>3.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It is writing useful knowledge.</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>3.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It is summarization</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>3.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It is writing on notebook with keywords.</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>3.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It is writing down everything being told.</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>2.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It is writing the necessary stuff.</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>2.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It is writing the knowledge presented.</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>2.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It is writing the information to be successful.</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It is the grade given by the teacher.</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It is recording the information for the exam.</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It is transferring the course content to notebook.</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It is a studying method.</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It is arranging the knowledge.</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It is writing down the opinion.</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Others</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>4.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>301</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

taking is creating momentary records, rather than writing. In other words, writing the important information briefly matters in note taking, instead of long sentences. "Note taking is summarization of a text in comprehensive ways" (S127). However, there are some candidates stating that note taking is “less general than summarization” (S69), who can differentiate note taking and summarization. "Note taking occurs during listening while summarization takes place after note taking" (S147).

Some teacher candidates put forth different opinions on note taking. A particular teacher candidate moves beyond classical pencil-notebook note taking perception and describe it as “verbal recording” (S162). Another candidate defined note taking as “transforming sound to writing” (S137).

On the other hand, there are some candidates who are not aware of what note taking is. According to them, note taking is “writing down whatever the lecturer says” (S94). Some teacher candidates stated opinions on the method of note taking. To them, “note taking can be in writing as well as pictures, and drawing.” (S113).

According to Table 3, examining the teacher candidates’ note taking methods, note taking concept is mostly understood as “note taking in listening” (61%); this is followed by “note taking in reading” (31.4%) and “note taking in watching-seeing” (7.5%). Owing to the interviews with teacher candidates after the application, the reason for this can be explained as teacher candidates’ perception of note taking as being a class-related activity. Table 4 is supportive of this opinion.

Reviewing the data from Table 4, in terms of sources of note taking, it can be seen that notes were mostly taken in lectures (55.4%), speeches (12%) and conferences (8.4%). In terms of note taking from reading, the fact that only 1 person stated note taking from reading was far from the expectations.

In Table 5, most themes on note taking were produced by 1st grade students (f=21) while most opinions of themes were stated by 3rd graders (f=105). In terms of opinions per teacher candidates, 3rd graders were more successful than others (x=2.33) by arithmetic averages. In terms of opinions per themes in note taking, lowest arithmetic average belonged to 2nd graders (x=1.41).

According to Table 6, teacher candidates’ perception of first four themes show similarities for different grade levels. According to that, the ranking of note taking definitions for 1st and 4th grade students and for 2nd and 3rd grade students are the same. However, in terms of 5th theme, different opinions are ranked. This distribution for 1st graders is “writing down the given information”, for 2nd graders “writing necessary information”, for 3rd graders “writing to review later” and for 4th graders “writing down with keywords”.

Investigating Table 7, it was found that female teacher candidates were more interested and sensitive on note taking about both produced themes (f=24) and produced
Table 3. Teacher Candidate’s perception of note taking methods.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Note taking method</th>
<th>f</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>From what is listened</td>
<td>97</td>
<td>61.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>From what is read</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>31.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>From what is seen</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>7.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>159</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4. Teacher candidates’ perception of note taking source.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source of note taking</th>
<th>f</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lecture</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>55.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Speech</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>12.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conference</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>8.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Observation</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mind</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Symposium</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Seminar</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Internet</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meeting</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Book</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Presentation</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Panel</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>83</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5. Distributions of produced theme and opinions on grade levels.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Grade level</th>
<th>Number of teacher candidates</th>
<th>Number of themes</th>
<th>Number of opinions</th>
<th>Opinion per teacher candidate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1st grade</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>1.69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2nd grade</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>1.41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3rd grade</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>105</td>
<td>2.33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4th grade</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>2.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>163</strong></td>
<td><strong>62</strong></td>
<td><strong>301</strong></td>
<td><strong>1.85</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

opinions (f=185) with respect to male teacher candidates. In terms of opinions per teacher candidate, it was seen that female teacher candidates were stating more and better opinions (x=2.01) than male teacher candidates. Evaluating Table 7 as a whole, it can be stated that female students are more efficient than males on note taking in terms of themes and opinions.

Examining Table 8, it can be observed that gender distribution of teacher candidates’ note taking perception is the same for four themes and differ in fifth theme. The last theme accepted as “writing useful information” by females was perceived as “writing to review later” by male students. Moreover, top 5 opinions stated mostly by females and males, represent 68.1% of females’ opinion (126/185×100) and 80.2% of males’ opinion (93/116×100).

**DISCUSSION**

At the end of the study, 301 opinions under 32 themes were gathered from 163 teacher candidates. The most widely stated opinions are “writing down important information” (f=91), “writing down the information that
Table 6. Teacher candidates’ note taking perceptions’ state with grade levels.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Themes (First 5 themes)</th>
<th>1st grade</th>
<th>2nd grade</th>
<th>3rd grade</th>
<th>4th grade</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Writing important knowledge</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Writing the knowledge that should not be forgotten</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Writing as one can understand</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Writing in short forms</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Writing the given information</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Writing necessary information</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Writing to review later</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Writing down with keywords</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>58</strong></td>
<td><strong>49</strong></td>
<td><strong>76</strong></td>
<td><strong>39</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total number of themes</strong></td>
<td><strong>21</strong></td>
<td><strong>12</strong></td>
<td><strong>16</strong></td>
<td><strong>13</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 7. Distribution of produced themes and opinions with gender.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Number of teacher candidates</th>
<th>Number of themes</th>
<th>Number of opinions</th>
<th>Opinion per teacher candidate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>92</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>185</td>
<td>2.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>116</td>
<td>1.63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>163</strong></td>
<td><strong>42</strong></td>
<td><strong>301</strong></td>
<td><strong>1.85</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 8. State of teacher candidates’ note taking perception depending on gender

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Themes (First 5 themes)</th>
<th>Females</th>
<th>Males</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Writing important information</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Writing information that should not be forgotten</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Writing as one can understand</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Writing in short form</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Writing useful information</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>–</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Writing to review later</td>
<td>–</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>126</strong></td>
<td><strong>93</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

should not be forgotten” (f=57), “writing as one can understand” (f=28), “writing to review later” (f=11) and “writing useful information” (f=11). Considering all of the statements, it was found that opinions of the first five themes constitute three-fourth of the entire opinions. Also, about a third of teacher candidates perceived note taking as “writing useful information”.

In a study conducted by İpek (2018) in a State University on English noticing significant ideas and Teaching Department, similarities were observed with our study in terms of results. According to that study, students described note taking as process of writing important words, noticing significant ideas and using symbols and abbreviations. According to the study conducted by Teng (2011) with EFL students to define note taking strategies of students, note taking was mostly described as “writing as much as possible during the lectures” by students. This idea was followed by views of “recalling the lectures to be successful in exams” and “examining the knowledge lectured by instructor through the clues”. The research of Teng shows similarities to our study in “writing useful information” and “writing to review later” concepts but differs in “writing as much as possible” theme. Because, even though technically it is possible to
write down everything during the lecture, it may cause troubles in achieving comprehension. Also, in the research of Teng (2011), the fact that participants stated that “I wish I had better note taking skills” opinion shows that participants highly regard note taking.

In the study on teachers and students by Guasch and Costello (2002), interpretation of middle school teachers and students on note taking, in-class performances of students, class notes of students and conceptualization of the process by teachers were taken into consideration. According to the findings of the research, middle school teachers and students defined note taking as “a useful study technique to personalize the knowledge”. Other results showed that student notes were inefficient and inadequate, and most teachers were only telling students how to take notes. In comparison to our study, the research by Guasch and Costello (2002) shows similarity in the theme of “writing as one can understand”.

In the study conducted by Brown (2005), it was found that students mostly used notes to “prepare for the exams”, they find them “beneficial for learning” and they “write down in their own words”. Besides, it was found that students were not willing to arrange the notes they had written. The study of Brown (2005) shows similarities to our study in “writing as one can understand” and “writing useful information” themes. However, it differs from our study on theme of “preparing for the exams”. This theme is among the least stated ideas (f=3) in our research.

The study carried out by Islam (2017) on university students, it was determined that students took notes with the purpose of “recording the information for later learning” and “using the notes taken during the course as a clue to remember”. This study is similar to our study in terms of “writing to review later”.

It was observed that 3.3% of teacher candidates confuse note taking with summarization in our research. Note taking is creating momentary recording, rather than writing. In other words, during note taking brief writing takes place, rather than writing long sentences. The fact that teacher were just telling students to take notes, students’ notes were inadequate and inefficient (Guasch and Costello, 2002), can account for the realities that note taking is perceived as “writing as much as possible during the lecture” by students (Teng, 2011), and note taking and summarization concepts are mistaken. The perceptions of note taking reveal that, unfortunately effective note taking skill was not provided adequately.

There are some candidates expressing different views on note taking in this research. Moving beyond classical pencil-notebook note taking approach, describing note taking as “verbal recording” and defining note taking as “transforming sound to writing” have taken place. Moreover, a teacher candidate who stated that note taking is not “writing whatever the lecturer says” showed that he/she had a correct knowledge on the function of note taking.

Studying the note taking methods of teacher candidates, note taking was mostly perceived as “note taking in listening” (61%), followed by “note taking in reading” (31.4%) and “note taking in watching” (7.5%). This finding is important as it shows that candidates view note taking as a class-based activity. However, note taking is a skill mostly referred to in our daily lives. For instance, we take notes of the materials and recipe of the food in a paper while watching a cooking show on TV.

It is possible to understand that teacher candidates’ note taking perceptions are school-related also from the sources they expressed. Investigating the opinions of that, it becomes more clear when teacher candidates state that they mostly take notes in classes (55.4%), speeches (12.4%) and conferences (8.4%). The fact that only one person expressed taking notes from the book was unexpected in the research. In other words this finding shows that teacher candidates were not fully able to associate reading and note taking.

Analyzing data based on grade levels, it was seen that most themes of note taking were produced by 1st graders (f=21), whereas most opinions were stated by 3rd graders (f=105). Investigating as a whole, in terms of opinions per teacher candidate, 3rd graders were more successful than other grade levels with 2.33 arithmetic average. It was detected that lowest arithmetic average belonged to 2nd graders (x=1.41). In terms of grade level distribution of note taking perceptions, it was observed that all grade levels showed similarities for the first four themes, however differences occur for the fifth theme. According to that, for the 5th theme, 1st graders prefer “writing down the given information”, 2nd graders state “writing necessary information”, 3rd graders signify “writing to review later” and 4th grader state “writing in keywords”.

Evaluating based on gender variable, it was found that female students were more interested than male students in terms of produced theme (f=24) and opinions (f=185). Distribution of note taking perceptions for female and male students were similar for the first 4 themes and varied in the 5th theme. According to that, the 5th was accepted as “writing useful information” by females while it was accepted as “writing to review later” by male students.

SUGGESTIONS

Considering the fact that some teacher candidates confuse note taking and summarization, the difference between note taking and summarization should be taught to candidates. Teachers must develop themselves in the subject of note taking.

Comparing the pace of speech and writing, clearly speech is faster. In this sense, writing down everything...
might be a torture for teacher candidates as well as moving attention away from the lecture. Therefore, it should be taught that frequently used skill of note taking is not merely writing every word of the lecturer.

Note taking does not only concern classes. It can be used in every stage of life. Thus, this function of note taking must be conveyed to the teacher candidates, techniques and methods of the note taking should be presented. Besides, teacher candidates should be informed about emerging note taking and recalling programme and applications with the improvement of technology. Hence, note taking with smart phones and tablets by teacher candidates should be made possible.

Teacher candidate who has not learned taking notes adequately cannot be successful with the notes taken. There is not any course on note taking being presented in Turkey. Therefore, about the skill of note taking that is utilized not only in language classes but all of the lectures by teacher candidates, education should be provided.

Even though there are a lot of studies on note taking in the literature, the number of studies that consider note taking and summarization together are limited. By making different researches on the subjects, opinions of teacher candidates should be gathered.

CONFLICT OF INTERESTS

The authors have not declared any conflict of interests.

REFERENCES


Evaluation of Turkey’s 2013 Visual Arts (Grades 1-8) curriculum

Eylem Tataroğlu

Department of Visual Arts and Design, Faculty of Fine Arts Design and Architecture, Başkent University, Turkey.

Received 17 September, 2018; Accepted 18 December, 2018

Turkey’s Ministry of National Education aims to identify and develop valuable characteristics to prepare the nation’s young for their professional life as adults. The Ministry has been conducting an extensive and comprehensive review of the educational system since the beginning of 2000. Educational system was implemented in time for the 2012/2013 academic year. The purpose of this study is to evaluate the clarity; the developmental, ethical, and intellectual appropriateness of Turkey’s 2013 Arts Education policy to improve the Visual Arts curriculum. The evaluation shows that the curriculum contains significant erroneous information, creating misunderstandings regarding explanations of art and design in Visual Arts. The results of this study can be used as a reference for future academic and ministerial research.

Key words: Visual arts and design education, curriculum, evaluation, Turkish educational policy, visual arts curriculum.

INTRODUCTION

The beginning of the 19th century witnessed the introduction of age-appropriate painting classes for children, with painting and art education gradually applied to other school subjects as part of an integrated education. In the case of Turkey, prior to the changes initiated in mid-1920s, art education mainly followed the ‘copy’ method. In other words, educational curricula from other countries would be introduced to Art Education programs in the country without any localization process. That is, the borrowed curricula, and hence, the overall perspective, would be adopted without being appropriated according to the national and local circumstances.

However, the content of Art Education changed around 1925. When John Dewey arrived in Turkey (1924), improvements were made to both class content and the individual rights of teachers. Another important influence at this time was the establishment of museums by private benefactors. As Kurtuluş (2000) emphasizes, the ideas that have been effective in Art Education were formulated in line with the framework of Baltacıoğlu, Tonguç and foreign experts who were invited to Turkey to prepare reports on the field of education and who shared Atatürk’s opinions on science as a leading force in achieving modern civilization (Atatürk, 2000: 21).
As such, Art was, afterwards, not only used as a tool in other classes but also taught as a separate school subject with content based on the principles of behaviorism. The transformation of Art Education in Turkey began after the decision of the Fifteenth Education Council (May 13-17, 1996) to restructure secondary education and the subsequent transition to higher education. Furthermore, elementary education (an 8-year program) was made mandatory, and elementary curricula were redesigned on the basis of the principle of integration.

It is possible to describe the Visual Arts curriculum updated in 2006 under the "World Bank Project," as an 'independent' curriculum focused on interdisciplinary Art Education in the first years of the Republic of Turkey. The new curriculum completely rejected the previous function and structure of Art Education under the 1968 and 1992 curricula as a tool to be used in other classes. The name of the subject, which had been changed numerous times before, was substituted by 'Visual Arts' to encompass both the arts and the design fields. Öğuz and Akhun (2015), conducted a research, titled "A Comparative Study of Two National Curricula: 1992 Art-Craft and 2006 Visual Arts Curricula" and identified the similarities and differences in terms of curriculum design between the 1992 National Primary School Curriculum for Art and Craft Course and the 2006 National Primary School Curriculum for Visual Arts Course with the Guide Book (Grades 1-5) in Turkey.

Between 2012 and 2013, Turkey's 12-year compulsory education system (also known as '4+4+4," indicative of the number of years spent in each level of schooling), which garnered significant public reaction, was introduced under Code 6287. As a result, drastic changes were made to Turkey's education system (T. C. Official Gazzette, 2012, No: 28261). Prior to this law, children started school at 72 months of age; the new law lowered the starting age to 60 months. In response to the public's reaction, children were allowed to start elementary school at 66–71 months, and those determined not ready for school (after undergoing health assessment) were allowed to start a year later. The education system introduced by the Ministry of National Education (2013) shifted from a primary education system to one of elementary and secondary schools, and required the rearrangement of class hours and content. Elementary school Visual Arts classes (Grades 1-8) were introduced into the elementary and secondary school curricula by the Ministry in 2013, and for the first time, class texts were presented in a digital format before publishing.

Within this framework, the aims of the present study include evaluating the 2013 curriculum, identifying the benefits resulting from radical changes adopted in a short time (that is, within the same year), assessing the suitability of the content and structure of Art Education in Turkey, and discussing the current state and quality of Art Education since the establishment of the Republic. In this perspective, it is argued that the constructivist model cannot adequately address Turkish culture and experiences because the physical infrastructure and equipment in classrooms are inadequate. Furthermore, change and reform is not achieved through furthering the titles. In other words, the adoption of educational curricula from other countries disregards local historical and cultural dynamics and skills, built upon years of experience. The curricula of other cultures, in essence, become destructive elements when applied to foreign systems. Buck and Snook (2016) summarize the broader concern as follows: "The first theme presented a broader problem than the specific school situation. That is, parents, students, and careers advisors view Arts as dance, drama, or music performance, or a visual art show. Seldom are the arts regarded as being interconnected and anything but a 'showing of talent.' Shifting perceptions to see both intrinsic and instrumental roles of the arts and then applying this across the curriculum requires a considerable pedagogical shift from principals, teachers, students, and parents. It was noted that performance offers many benefits and opportunities for students, however maintaining this limited perspective limits the scope for developing teaching and learning experiences" (Buck and Snook, 2016: 15-16).

CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK

'The universe is a large human being, and a human being is a small universe' - Farabi

Just as art has existed since the first humans, so, too, has our curiosity and desire for learning. When there are few to no external negative elements threatening their biological and physiological integrity, humans are programed for 'normal' growth and development. In addition to these basic functions which are programed from birth, humans begin to learn and increase their knowledge through experience as they age, adapting to society, and, in a broader sense, to humanity. At this stage, they have responsibility for every period, every technological development and even paradigm of every changing education; and then they start to receive an education to become part of society and to behave 'appropriately.' Moreover, most of the rules set by societies arise out of necessity. Education starts within the family. Thereafter, multi-part and organic learning experiences are provided by formal and informal educational institutions, instilling the values of society and all areas of adaptation, including technology, cultural structure, geographical differences and language. Deniz and Erözkan (2012: 91) described this as follows: 'By birth, we find ourselves first within a family, later in a school environment and then within an environment,
within which we live, work and form dialogues. These conditions, in which we exist and characterize as an environment, have great physical, social and psychological effects on our lives. We gain most of our values, habits and characteristics by interaction with the environment.' Christensen and Kirkland (2009) also note that “Children become aware of other cultures as they experience art and connect their budding identities to artists' work. Seeing and hearing about representations of other cultures can fill in the spaces between themselves and others. Discussing and seeing art is a channel by which students become aware of historical contexts, and evaluate what the related art means to them” (Christensen and Kirkland, 2009: 89). Benic (2016) adds her opinion on this topic as follows: “[C]hildren have the ability to understand the world where they live much better than adults think they can, and they can use visual media to express their opinions regarding those topics as well as adults, but there is one condition. Children can express their attitudes and develop their sense of identity through visual communication only when teachers and adults do not confine their attitudes and expressiveness into predetermined frameworks. Freedom to express attitude is an important assumption that needs to be met so that children can explore their identities and attitudes about the world around them” (Benic, 2016: 61). Tozlu (1992: 141) extends Baltacıoğlu’s in-depth analyses on this topic: ‘National personality: Humans are clearly affected by the ideas, beliefs, inspirations and influences of the nations in which they live. The personality of humans is remoulded and developed with the values of the nation in which they live. If individuals are suspicious about the values that make up their personalities, and the beliefs and inspirations of the nations, and if this suspicion is widespread in society, then the members of that nation become alienated from their own nation and values.’ Baltacıoğlu (1932) believes that Turkey is afflicted by such a sense of alienation and therefore claims the said values should be again assimilated by the Turkish people. According to him, ‘the entire problem is the existence of the nation. For this, we need to know this nation well.’ Baltacıoğlu (1932) goes on to define the concept of nation as ‘all social institutions such as religion, morality, customs, and language making up society.’ In the light of these various yet complementary viewpoints, the significance of the interrelations among art, education, and the nation become undeniable.

The structure of the Turkish education system is rather fractured under the coordination of the Ministry of National Education (one of the three institutions in the country and defined as a ‘national’ institute). In Turkey, there are many educational institutions aiming to raise individuals with many different characteristics for many different goals. The first of these institutions takes individuals from childhood and educates them in a programed manner from early youth. John Locke summarizes the goal of education (Locke, 1995: 1) as achieving “A sound mind in a sound body;” and though brief, this statement may be taken to represent the most accurate definition of happiness at the same time. Furthermore, he claims that “Men we meet with, nine parts of ten are what they are, good or evil, useful or not, by their education.” In other words, education makes people who they are. Moreover, it would be beneficial to include the teacher, who is the most important component of education. Russell (1984: 42) expands this conception: “When humans die, they disappear as a value. The things they create as a tool exist until the end of the time. The importance of a human being as a tool could be positive or negative. Long-term results of human behavior are so uncertain that a wise person does not include this in their estimations. In a general sense, good people have good effects, bad people have bad effects.” Here, the characteristics of the individual and student are questioned, not only those of the teachers.

Yayla et al. (2011) explains the significance of education thoroughly (based on the work of Tozlu). They claim that education in Turkey is misunderstood by many people; that is, education in the country is used like a ‘magic wand,’ a ‘cure-all’ solution to problems. Yayla et al. (2011: 86) then asked, ‘What can you do with education if you do not have an understanding of humanity, of civilization, a deep-rooted philosophy, a strong economy, and a legal system operating on customs?’ According to Tozlu (1992: 143), an education without philosophy is not an education but an ideology, a transformative custom. Education based on such an understanding is driving people away from their core. As Tozlu states, ‘it steals people from themselves. It prepares them for servitude to anyone.’ Another scholar examining the relationship between ideology and education is Sönmez. According to Sönmez (1994: 64-71), an education system can raise individuals who will, to some degree, challenge the official ideology, be in opposition to it, and change or even shatter it. This characteristic lies in the structure and at the core of the education system. In this context, the relations among the political system, education and philosophy can be grouped under the following explanations:

i) No currently existing system can depoliticize people. Each person has to deal with politics, not only at the individual level but also at the institutional level, including organizations, society and communities. School has a structure that generates politics, examines effective political systems, and depicts their consistent and inconsistent aspects. Although this is an inescapable fact, it is not necessarily negative.

ii) Education is the most efficient and effective long-term investment because, through education, people can establish and operate all components related to economic, social and political systems. That is, they can
establish the components of the cultural system, repair, reverse, dismantle, find and create new structures, and evaluate the existing ones.

iii) Generally, education can be considered a process that socializes people by equipping them with values that are deemed dominant by society. Thus, the appropriateness of terminal behavior to these dominant values of society can operate as a measure. However, it should be recognized that terminal behavior can come from science, art, philosophy, nature, the readiness of persons and other measures of social reality.

In this case, theories for which philosophy and education are to be linked gain importance. It has been claimed that Pythagoras was the first to use philosophical terminology (Gökberk, 1961: 17). The history books depict that philosophy started in Greece 2,500 years ago. In ancient Greece, a person who sought wisdom (sophos) was called a philosopher (quoting Ulken, 1965: 2) (where philia means love and sophia means knowledge and wisdom [quoting Akarsu, 1919: 76]). Philosophical ideas and terminology were later incorporated in Arabic texts and from there on entered the Turkish language.

‘Philosophy originated from myth, religion and poetry. It is clear from these components that they are carried in time. It developed by erecting scientific and free thinking foundations and attempted to completely explain the reality’ (Sönmez, 1994: 7). Scientific study and reality can be broken down to manageable pieces, based on proven information. In contrast, philosophy handles reality as a whole and is suspicious of fundamental information obtained by organizing the thoughts and activities of people. In other words, philosophy is suspicious of scientific information and analysis. Thus, there is an obligation for the analysis of philosophy as a whole, to which educational paradigms are connected. Similarly, Tozlu (1992) provides some valuable comments regarding the roots of philosophy on which our education system is to be based: ‘the philosophy on which our education is to be based will be a source of renewal for our social structure. This is to be gathered from the richness of groups, nations, regional and national cultures and philosophies, and will be based on religion, language and history, all of which come together under cultural values’ (Tozlu, 1992: 214).

Therefore, Tozlu (1992) focuses on the need for educational content to be national, and highlights that it is a nation’s ‘core culture’ that makes it ‘a nation.’ For Tozlu, the existence of a nation stems from this fundamental concept. Therefore, in addition to creating and maintaining a core culture for future generations, it is crucial to introduce and encourage a living example and exemplary personalities, and to have the desire to follow them. Tozlu (1992) calls this ‘values education’ (from the section of Assist. Dr. Ahmet Yayla, titled a new educational ideal in the educational philosophy understanding, quoting Tozlu (1992: 87)) (Yayla et al., 2011: 90).

Russell’s (1984: 35, 60) approach complements that of Tozlu: ‘it is best to clarify what the result we want to achieve will be before deciding how to educate.’ Many of our daily activities should be based on collaboration, and such collaboration should be intuitive. Nevertheless, we should learn for ourselves, especially in matters we fully understand, and we must gain the courage to clearly stand up for what we believe is important. When it comes to visual arts area in education, Kristch (2016) notes: “Artists believed that the problems with existing curricula and methods of instruction could be solved if performance-based art forms, which had the potential to reclaim the pedagogical value of play, were introduced to those in younger grades. In an interview with Filliou, Kaprow suggests that this experiment should be continued through to college, saying that “it would be interesting to see if their attitudes and capacities to study historical art (and) more advanced intellectual critical problems about the arts... made them much better qualified than the students who now come to college... with nothing but prejudices?”” (quoting Kristch, 2016: 16).

**Arts Education curriculum and policy in Turkey**

Turkey’s Art Education system was developed between 1887 and 1931. During that era, the concept of individuality was encouraged in both the Arts and the Sciences. This period marked the study of children’s souls/personalities and the emergence of a new perspective: the Art Education Movement. The movement then gave rise to the Business School Movement. Particularly, the declaration of Constitutional Monarchy in 1908 helped to introduce pedagogic education in Turkey (Tonguç, 1932). After this date, all classes began to include painting to better reveal the personality of children and to create a national culture.

In 1924, immediately after the declaration of the Republic (1923), John Dewey was invited to Turkey by the Ministry of Education at the behest of Atatürk. Based on Dewey’s (1994) reports, various reforms were introduced into the Turkish education system in 1926. The 1932 book Painting, Handcrafts and Art Education in Elementary-Middle Schools and Teacher Training Schools, by İsmail Hakki Tonguç, was considered one of the most important books for educators at that time, addressing Turkish education, and appropriate methods, principles, tools and techniques.

Curriculum. These were followed by the 2006 curriculum (encompassing a structured approach and abandoning the behavioural model) and the 2013 Elementary School and Secondary School Curriculum, the subject of the present study. The latest model marked the use of an open access digital system, based on the reform of the 2006 curriculum (Tataroğlu, 2011).

A select committee developed a new curriculum for Art Education for the 2005-2006 academic year. The curriculum presented a broad perspective for art and design education for grades 1-8 under its new title: Visual Arts 1-8 Curriculum. During the 8-year period between the 2006-2007 and 2013-2014 academic years, significant efforts were made to ensure that interdisciplinary education played a significant role in formal education in Turkish Arts Education utilizing the curriculum and guidance books. Furthermore, the school starting age was reduced to 66 months under the 12-year mandatory general education system (‘4+4+4’).

On the issue of the perspective of other countries that included Turkey, United States, Argentina, Australia, Brazil, Canada, England, Finland, Germany, Korea, Portugal and Taiwan, Milbrandt et al. (2015) present these findings: “This study included questions regarding the source and content of art curricula standards in order to better understand the policies and standards in place at the national or state level that provide the context for the delivery of instruction in the art classroom. Based on the compiled documentation of visual art standards the predominant themes for teachers appear to be clustered around: Creating and Expressing, Problem Solving and Responding to Art. It should be noted that most curriculum standards for visual arts were grouped with other arts disciplines such as Music and Drama, and some shared overarching standards. There were also curricular indications of using the arts to ‘connect’ across disciplines like science or social studies” (Milbrandt et al., 2015: 161).

This study aims to evaluate the curriculum in terms of its learning areas, attainment goals, content, and most importantly, its applicability. It will discuss whether the arts and design education has attained an appropriate level of the aforementioned elements under the Turkish national education system. The strengths and weaknesses of the 2013 curriculum will be compared with the previous curriculum in the area of arts and design, its appropriateness to students, and its ability to meet the existing experiences and information of all educators.

Thus, after briefly outlining the theoretical framework and describing the Turkish educational system, the content and structure of the 2013 curriculum are evaluated in detail. This investigation was conducted using a qualitative research method. Data were collected through document review and a descriptive analysis was performed. The 2006 and 2013 policies were analyzed to determine their consistency, coherence, ethics, and developmental appropriateness, especially related to the development of childhood cognitive, emotional, and psychomotor skills. Such policies often make unfounded developmental assumptions, and use ambiguous language that may complicate implementation.

The general structure of the curriculum was then analyzed, and the content of learning areas scrutinized. In what follows, the content/strengths of each class level is examined, the classification of these attainment goals based on cognitive, emotional and psychomotor skills is determined and their level of relevance with scientific literature is evaluated. Both the applicability of the curriculum and also possible reservations regarding their applicability are discussed.

A Critical Inquiry model developed by Parlett and Hamilton (quoted in Özdemir, 2009: 138), with a focus on pluralistic-humanistic evaluation, which includes ‘a critical inquiry process and a rigorous self-examination,’ has been adopted. In this connection, the training program was evaluated line by line.

RESULTS
Evaluation of the general structure of Visual Arts Curriculum (Grades 1-8)

This part of the work identifies and evaluates the problematic sections of the general structure of the curriculum.

1. An evaluation of the general purpose of the Visual Arts class teaching curriculum: The general purposes are listed in the educational curriculum. The first article states that the curriculum has been prepared on the basis of general purposes of Turkish National Education expressed in Article 2 of the National Education Fundamental Law, numbered 1739, and the Fundamental Principles of Turkish National Education. However, the content of these articles has not been clarified. On closer inspection, it would seem that this article was included as an obligation originating from guidance functionality, to both motivate and clarify targets. Otherwise, it suggests an insincere approach that does not go beyond fulfilling legal liability. Başaran (2007: 197) defines the article as follows:

Turkish National Education principles: The principles of the education system that developed between the 1920s and 1973 were legalized in the National Education Fundamental Law enacted in 1973.

a) Generality and equality: Educational institutions are available to anyone without discriminating in terms of language, race, gender and religious beliefs. No special educational privileges are granted to persons, families,
b) Necessities of individuals and society: The national education service is arranged according to the desires and skills of Turkish citizens and Turkish society.

c) Directing: Individuals are educated by directing various curricula or schools during their education based on their interests, skills and aptitude.

The end of the second paragraph concludes as follows: 'These artworks are works including architectural structures, painting, ceramics, statues, textile design, and photography.' Note that both art and design are mentioned. In this case, the given examples have to be considered as examples of these design and art areas. They cannot solely be called artworks.

The primary objectives of the curriculum are given in paragraph 4. Again, ambiguity ensues in these goals:

i) Visual literacy has perception and aesthetic consciousness: What is 'perception consciousness'? Or is 'perception' a stand-alone term? Confusion, both in terms of content meaning and sentence structure, characterizes this paragraph.

ii) Having knowledge, skills and understanding of fundamental concepts and applications in the visual arts area: What does having an understanding of applications and concepts mean? What kind of an understanding is mentioned? This matter requires clarification.

iii) Using information, materials, skills, techniques and technology affectively and in a safe manner in visual arts studies, and expressing their ideas: Here, the kind of tool required to express their thoughts should be indicated. In addition, 'expressing their ideas' is connected to listed techniques, hardware, knowledge, skills and technology. However, individuals can express their thoughts and emotions visually without the need for these. For example, look at the drawings in the Lascaux Caves from BC 25000. When considering elementary school students, who are at the peak of their creativity, surely it is sufficient that they think and feel that visual expression is enjoyable.

iv) Displaying ethical behaviour in the arts area: What is ethical behaviour? What level and approaches are expected to be expressed by the students? Essentially, ethical behaviour is usually assigned to various professional branches. Thus, elementary and secondary school students do not generally aim to engage in a profession in their visual arts class, nor can their work be evaluated as artworks. Furthermore, 'ethical,' included in the Turkish Language Society dictionary, is considered synonymous with morality. The approach described in the governing statute is aimed at the child's benefit, that is, exhibiting ethical behaviour, underlines various rules that are mostly professional in nature, and therefore places an extremely dangerous expectation on students' developmental assignments.

Russell (1984: 199) notes, on the matter of age appropriateness, that "In general, things taught at school before the age of fourteen must be the type of things to be known by anyone; specialization must follow, other than in special cases. However, one of the purposes of the education before fourteen years of age should be to discover special skills in children, so that these found skills can be developed during the following years."

v) Examining their environment, being inspired by it and transferring it to future generations: Is it the 'environment' to be transferred to future generations? Or is it the cultural values in this framework? This sentence represents a serious content problem. Unfortunately, the actual meaning of the sentence is the transfer of the examined environment to future generations. It is not clear why such a goal is included in the goals of a visual arts class.

vi) To raise individuals who are willing to learn and apply visual arts: What does it mean to apply visual arts? Should a goal be expressed in this manner, be perceived as individuals who are willing to work in the visual arts area?

The last paragraph contains the following expression: 'assimilation of information generally obtained in classes 5 to 8 in the Visual Arts class curriculum and evaluates artworks more meaningfully.' What does to 'evaluate more meaningfully' mean? If we say 'more meaningfully,' can we conclude that less meaningful evaluations at earlier education stages are sufficient? This is surely an undesired result; however, it should be remembered that the meaning should be transferred clearly and not according to the area or level.

Curriculum's areas of learning

Visual communication and design

This area of learning is defined as the 'use of art components (color, line, mode, form, texture, location/ space) and design principles (rhythm, balance, ratio- proportion, emphasis, unity, variation, movement, and contrast) in visual artworks.' As the arts and design components are listed, it is not clear why the principle of 'repeat' was omitted. Typically, there are four essential components to aesthetically characterize a design or an art object as an 'artwork': the principles of repetition, rhythm, contrast and unity. Only three principles are included in the curriculum but all four fundamental components must be present in qualified artworks and designs.

In contrast, information regarding the technical tools of design and their necessity are included in this area of learning. However, it contains no statement or explanation about visual literacy on the fundamentals of visual
communication or a directive about its importance. This omission within such an area should be clarified, and more importantly, remedied.

Cultural inheritance

When the content of the area of learning resembles an actual related heading, it is clear why the statement ‘comprehension of the shaping and reflection of art and culture of other students’ was included. It is universally recognized that culture is a higher form of identity and a common spirit. In this case, culture does not reflect art or this cannot be its sole purpose because art is a sub-component of culture. However, the reflection of culture through art is a sought-after quality. Art and the artwork dilemma becomes distanced from the society by the congestion experienced at the point of cultural connection, and typically, research conducted on this matter produces negative indications when examining this relationship. Therefore, this statement must be rewritten.

Another statement describes students as ‘relating to museums and visual arts.’ What is the intended meaning here? Museums have a wide variety of collections and there are many kinds of museums in Turkey classified accordingly. Is a museum relationship only formed via visual arts? How can this be achieved? Is this necessary? Or does this convey that the functions of a museum are to preserve, protect, repair and transfer? If so, does not a different ‘consciousness’ apply? Answering (or even not answering) these questions lead to rather significant conclusions. Although this area of learning seems to focus on the purposes of art history and museum functions, it also includes the goals of aesthetic and pedagogic art criticism in its explanations. Therefore, this area of learning is essentially presented as inadequate and baseless to trainee teachers and teachers. Similarly, the following statement produces the same result: ‘Examining artworks and artists from different societies and cultures, mainly from Turkish culture, during the historical process.’ What are the criteria for examination here? When the age group is considered, there is a pedagogical approach which is compulsory. In this case, the work conducted is criticism. In other words, it is an action to diagnose and understand. This is done verbally and visually. This statement requires clarification and definition. Given the title of the following area of learning, it can be argued that this section, too, appears to be misplaced.

Art criticism and aesthetics

This area of learning focuses on art history, steps of the application process, art criticism in interdisciplinary education, and various aesthetic stages. Although only inferred, pedagogic criticism is located between the stages and purposes. In addition to these elements, the material value of an artwork is included: ‘Noticing that artworks have an economic value.’

Artworks can never be measured by the revenue obtained from assigning everyday goods as meta-aesthetic or by means of manipulation via product marketing. On the contrary, this definition has never been universally used for artworks, not since the founding of aesthetic science nor today – the status of purchase and sale is only used for ‘design’ products. This is the fundamental difference between design products and artworks. Furthermore, introducing elementary and secondary school children (that is, 5-12-year olds) to such a perception will negatively affect future generations. It is thought that this purpose was placed here by mistake. This clause should be rewritten according to the spirit and content of art education.

The learning-teaching approach of the curriculum

Collaboration in the learning-teaching approach of the curriculum includes directives to make art education functional, such as individual/group studies and critical thinking. In addition, the reality, considering the ages and skills of the students, given that their interests and tendencies could be different, is emphasized and it is requested that these will be considered.

Russell (1984: 199) emphasizes an important issue, namely the teacher-student relationship: “Knowledge, processed by love, is what is needed by educators and required to be obtained by students.” The most fundamental conclusion to be derived here is that mutual communication and interaction is the basis of learning and the acquisition of skills. Other factors, such as location, equipment, and skill, come later. The priority for effective communication and love represents the core and the unchanging preconditions of almost all education and training issues.

The measurement-assessment approach of the curriculum

Measuring is the most fragile and critical tool in art and design education, requiring a special strategy. It also affects future approaches and the interests of students during their educational life. Therefore, it must be ensured that current errors and inappropriate regulations are not repeated, and we must consider the requirement for the use of proper tools in a contemporary education environment.

It is expected that the measurement—evaluation approach of the 2013 curriculum is contemporary. Specifically, all the development characteristics and
sensitivities of the two age groups (elementary and secondary) must be considered. The evaluation of these two age groups must also be different. This is especially true of development assignments and the expectations of children, who are part of a rather small subset of formal education such as 5–9. The characteristics of 5- to 9-year-old children are naturally very different.

The following statement refers to the measurement approach of the 2013 curriculum: ‘The measurement and evaluation process in visual arts classes is discussed as student-centred.’ What is student-based measurement and evaluation? What is measured and evaluated to determine a student’s worth? It is clear that teachers’ own evaluations influence the students’ feedbacks. However, what does this mean in a situation as such that promotes student motivation and students?

**Explanations regarding the structure and application of the curriculum**

The following statement is an explanatory section regarding the structure of the curriculum that stands out: ‘Attainment goals aim for students to generally acquire knowledge, perception and psychomotor skills in the Visual Arts Class Education Curriculum; these can be developed by making amendments appropriate to the age and level of the students, enabling an evaluation of art types and their meaning.’ The ‘evaluation of art types' is important. What does the ‘evaluation of art types and their meanings' relate to? Does art have a meaning? Does art have meanings? If so, are they local or universal? By which scale will they be evaluated? These matters require urgent clarification.

Article 13 of the 2013 curriculum provides additional principles on the use of principles, thereby creating information pollution in terms of content and presentation. The article is as follows: ‘Matters concerning the area of cultural heritage, which is one of the three fundamental areas of the curriculum, must be related to museum education and art history.’ The term ‘museum education’ could be taken to refer to the training provided to museum workers, and would, therefore, have nothing to do with formal education. However, there is another expression, ‘education in museum’ and this clearly includes education. This error should immediately be remedied.

**Evaluation of Visual Arts Curriculum by Grade (1-8) level**

This section of the curriculum concerns evaluations based on the level of attainment, a truly problematic section. Some of the sentences referring to the attainment goals in italics both in the curriculum and in the added text describe the material; they are also the only ones taken to the problematic section. The Appendix lists all attainment goals included in the curriculum.

1. **First grade Visual Arts course curriculum**

   a. **Visual communication and design:**

      a.1. ‘They are aware of the steps of the application process forming visual arts studies.’

      The application step is regarded as a single-step process, as it relates to direct design. However, what is required here at least the idea drawn from the explanation relates to the visual arts studies formation process.

      In addition, it is clear that if it had stated ‘art’ and/or ‘design’ instead of visual arts studies, then it would have been understood with an integrity that is more meaningful and easily recognized.

      This attainment goal connects children with an organization and structure as an ‘application step,’ which is static, linked to previous rules, and as if the contrary has not been proven. However, when art or design processes are considered, it is easy to see how much relates to the individual and follows different paths. For someone to be teachable, s/he must be connected to certain principles. Nonetheless, it is difficult to mention an organization that is called forming steps in the field of Art and Design. Instead, it would be better to include an attainment goal that emphasizes the relationship among creativity, information and experience, and its connection with anticipation.

      a.2 (no.6). ‘They are aware of the figure-location relationship in visual arts study.’

      The placement of one shape on top of the other, a change in the measurement and/or the placement in the composition using the shapes that are formed.

      Children in this age group do not possess the necessary location perception to arrange the location in an artwork; 5-year-old children generally arrange the composition using floating objects. Thus, they could not meet the attainment goal. The aforementioned explanation concerns actions, not the visual conception. In this case, there is no connection between the point of action performance and the explanation and attainment goal.

      a.3 (no.8). ‘They observe objects and figures in their environs and draw them.’

      Children aged 5 cannot be expected to make drawings based on observation. At this stage, they can only draw floating objects and their perception of location is not yet developed. Their drawings float in space; front, back, and
near (Buyurgan and Buyurgan, 2012) and their presentations and perspective in a primitive sense have not yet developed. Of course, there may also be some children below or above this development standard. However, the curriculum, which covers general development, must meet its responsibility in this regard.

a.4 (no.10). ‘As visual arts study is formed, they use art components and design principles.’

Color: Main colors
Line: Zigzag, dot, undulating, spiral
Shape/Form: Geometric, organic

What kind of line is a ‘dot’? When was it included in the literature as a type of line? This issue requires clarification because this curriculum applies to all elementary and secondary school children in Turkey. Stating that a dot is a type of line is a material error, and ‘dot’ or ‘dot effect’ is listed among art elements in the first directive. Was a dot consciously included as a line type? Any information pollution originating from this error requires clarification.

b. Cultural heritage:

b.1. ‘They notice that art is a part of culture.’

It is naturally difficult to talk to a group of children (who think that they are engaging in a fun activity) about art and culture and to convey that art is a part of culture. To do so is developmentally inappropriate.

c. Art criticism and aesthetics:

c.1 (no.3). ‘They can identify differences between artworks.’

This goal requires children to know the difference between art forms, not to teach the difference between artworks. This statement requires rewriting and this error should be fixed.

2. Second grade visual arts course curriculum

‘The 2nd grade visual arts course emphasizes that students create new ideas based on inspiration/ reflections from experiences, school, close surroundings, Turkish culture and different cultures. They can use art materials and techniques to apply these reflections onto ideas.’

What does to ‘apply these reflections onto ideas’ mean this requires explanation. The curriculum contains a number of repeated errors and these must be removed.

a. Visual communication and design:

a.1. ‘Students try to find various solutions to the problems faced as visual art work is formed.’

The problems concern how the matter is to be expressed, how the location is to be formed, which colors, lines, and shapes/forms will be used.

The aforementioned attainment goal cannot be understood without the accompanying explanation. Events considered a ‘problem’ and listed subsequently are in reality only the stages of the process. These questions can never be answered via the question-answer method. This is against the nature of art. Furthermore, it only can be achieved if the child is willing. However, children see what they want, and by using tools they can only achieve this by trying, doing, making mistakes and trying again. Therefore, as far as this particular expression of the attainment goal is understood, it is of serious concern and requires explanation. It should be removed from the curriculum.

a.2 (no.3). ‘Students describe the use of imagination in visual artworks.’

Imagination is discussed and the students carry out projects on this.

An attainment goal should indicate a single action: clear, understandable and plain. It should not require any further sentences to ensure understanding. These children are 6 years of age. Such requirements are developmentally inappropriate. Children do not learn imagination from others, neither is it something to be learned (Striker, 2005).

Why is ‘imagination is exemplified’ placed underneath a statement concerning a ‘subject’ and not an ‘attainment goal’? This is unacceptable.

İprişoğlu (2009: 47) comments on this as follows: ‘Children think in a tangible manner, and hardly distinguish imagination and reality from each other. But if they draw what they see and think, they can express this with a few lines and colors. They abstract tangible shapes that they see. It is natural that this abstraction is not like an abstraction that goes through mind filter as it happens with adults. It wouldn’t be wrong to call it thinking with eyes. This is the first step taken in the visual thinking process. This ability of children can be used in any matter.’

a.3 (no.8). ‘Visual arts studies are formed by inspiration from daily life.’

This is not an attainment goal; instead, it falls within category of ‘subject.’

b. Cultural heritage:

b.1 (no.5). ‘They recognize handcrafts.’

It is impossible to recognize handcrafts without first differentiating between arts and crafts. An attainment goal constructed by an ‘information’ step (it is a cognitive
attainment goal and forms the first step of cognitive skills) places a high level of expectation on 5- and 6-year-old students. While children at this stage of perception can see and experience via games, it is not expected that they would recognize handicrafts.

c. Art criticism and aesthetics:

c.1. ‘They recognize the scope of the artwork.’

‘Teachers show their students artwork samples including different scopes. They are asked what they see in the artworks. When these are classified according to subject, they are asked what they see. When these are classified according to subject matter, they are asked whether the work is a portrait, still life or landscape. The answers given by the students are written on the board. The teacher indicates that artworks that include a head are called portraits; artworks in which objects such as fruits, bowls, jugs, fabrics, and the like are used together are called still lifes; and artworks that include nature and scenery are called landscapes.

Although it seems beneficial for children to recognize that artworks have different names depending on the subject matter, it is clear that the process included in the explanation is beyond that of the children’s development. Thus, we should avoid filling children’s heads with unnecessary and confusing information. Regarding this point, only the school levels in formal education have changed in this age group, which is evaluated within the pre-school term until 2012. Children are at the same level in terms of the accumulation of skills. These children are only 6 years of age. Therefore, it is fruitless to expect them to possess skills above their development level. Within the Turkish context, how many families actually own art, be it a still life, portrait, or landscape? How many families are aware of this distinction? This attainment goal bears no relation to the reality of the families of children of this age, should either not be included at this level or be removed.

c.2. ‘They interpret the ideas and feelings in their own artwork and that of their peers.’

Considering that children have trouble expressing their own feelings and thoughts in terms of linguistic development, it is unfair to expect children at this age to interpret the feelings of others. Such an interpretation requires knowledge. The desire to raise adolescents who are free from bias and who possess the ability criticize is understandable, but we cannot ask these children to engage in thought interpretation without knowledge. They can be asked to guess and to reason but they cannot be asked to interpret. Moreover, the concept of ‘interpreting the ideas and feelings’ needs to be clarified. We need to consider whether we could interpret the feelings of another person no matter what our age is. Moreover, is such an interpretation necessary? Furthermore, this cannot come before the need to develop the ability to feel empathy, no matter at what age.

3. Third grade Visual Arts course curriculum

a. Visual communication and design:

a.1. ‘They follow the steps of the application process when forming a visual arts study.’

This attainment goal is identical with that for 1st grade children and suffers the same problems.

a.2. ‘An expressive approach is used when visual arts study is formed.’

Students may be asked to apply the positive experience of receiving a good report card, the excitement from sports activities, and the like to their work.

Each child possesses their own unique level of intelligence and skills. Thus, taking a conceptual approach and connecting this type of obligation to a connective element (such as an attainment goal) may not produce the desired results. Moreover, constraints should not exist in art education. Nevertheless, if children are forced to convey their feelings and thoughts through colors and shapes instead of using an expressive approach, then they will be constrained. This attainment goal should instead be offered as a tool, one that is not obligatory yet depends on the freedom of statement.

a.3 (no.5). ‘They define and use foreground, middleground, background plans in two-dimensional studies.’

Children should know about location, volume, value concepts, and most importantly basic perspective rules for foreground, middleground and background planning. It is expected that they have some experience on this matter. Furthermore, taking into account the children’s age and age-appropriate development assignment requirements (they are still at the ‘tangible realism’ stage), if they have difficulty fulfilling the requirements of this criterion, they may grow to dislike painting. These factors must be considered. Perhaps it would be more efficient and beneficial if this goal was approached by providing students with fundamental information such as indoor and outdoor locations.

a.4 (no.7). ‘They use art components and design principles when forming visual art studies.’

Color: Hot, cold
Location: Positive, negative
Balance: Symmetrical, asymmetrical, central
Contrast: Dark-light and opposite colors, and the like

Positive–negative shapes are related to shape and
ground. It is necessary that volume (like form of the relationships) is exemplified if the location is to be defined.

b. Cultural heritage:

b.1 (no.2). ‘They examine the relationship between an artwork’s form and function.’

What is meant by the function of an artwork? Because an artwork or the art phenomenon targets an inherent feature, it cannot be linked to any material value or function. Thus, the function of an artwork should not be defined. This attainment goal should be removed.

c. Art criticism and aesthetics:

c.1 (no.2). ‘They examine examples of portraits, landscapes, still lifes and depictive artworks.’

Examples of portrait, landscape, still life and depictive artworks are shown: portraits by Osman Hamdi Bey, landscape paintings by Nazmi Ziya, still life paintings by Mahmut Çiç and Feyhaman Duran, and artworks of Sami Yetik on the Independence War.

What does depictive art mean? If it means artworks with a theme from a well-known event or period, then this should be directly and clearly stated. At present, this is unclear.

c.2 (no.4). ‘They can express an opinion on the artworks they study.’

Judgment:
Is this artwork valuable? Why?
Would you want to hang this artwork in your room? Why?

It is rather dangerous to ask such judgment-based questions. Broadly speaking, this question is inappropriate. Here, the economic value of the artwork is emphasized. Presenting such a question usually applied to a design product is unethical. It is clear that the writers of the curriculum do not respect ethical matters.

c.3 (no.6). ‘He/she recognizes that artworks have a value.’

The reasons behind the affective, economic, political, and historical components of an artwork, relative to the student’s level, are emphasized.

What does the evaluation of artworks in terms of an effective component mean? This statement requires further explanation.

Additionally, economic, political, and historical components are not usually considered in relation to artworks but may apply to the interpretation of an artwork based on the period in which it was created and the analysis of society. The meaning drawn from here is that an artwork will be evaluated based on political, economical, and historical components. To resolve the ethical contradiction created by this erroneous expression, the statement should be rewritten or the goal removed.

c.4 (no.7). ‘They are aware of the ethical rules in the arts field.’

4. Fourth grade Visual Arts course curriculum

a. Visual communication and design:

a.1. ‘They use design steps to form a visual arts study.’

The criticism levelled at this attainment goal for 1st and 3rd grade classes also applies here. Using the term ‘design’ instead of ‘application’ does not change the goal of the attainment. Thus, the same problems exist here as described previously.

a.2 (no.4). ‘They relate their experiences using different thoughts, art forms and cultural themes, and form a visual arts study.’

a.3 (no.5). ‘They make decisions to create composition unity in a visual arts study.’

Children must be given as much freedom as possible in arts and design studies. Creativity can only grow in free environments and in free souls (Boydaş, 2006). The conclusion to be drawn here is to never leave children alone to make their own choices. However, studies structured like a cooking recipe are not appropriate. Therefore, these components and principles should not be limiting in nature; it is appropriate to encourage students to talk about what they used, how they used it and to make them aware.

a.4 (no.6). ‘They can create depth on a two-dimensional level.’

The placement of one shape on top of the other, changes in measurement and the placement in the composition using the shapes that are formed.

This attainment statement is constructed quite successfully. Although it clearly expresses the
expectation, when it is read along with its explanation, it becomes confusing. What is to be placed ‘on top of the other’ on a two-dimensional level, for instance, when painting on paper? While a large-small relationship or a foreground-background relationship will certainly create a difference in depth perception, on their own they are insufficient to do so. Regarding the color component, the value needs to be known, and it is not until this stage that the color component includes a value. It is not clear at all what is meant by ‘change in the placement in the composition.’ Is there more than one composition? Will components such as shape, color, form, and the like within a single composition change place in a single composition? If so, then the contribution of this to depth perception should be clearly explained.

It appears that the explanation does not belong to this attainment goal or is insufficient as a description. Furthermore, it could lead to conceptual mistakes. As such, the statement should be rewritten or replaced.

a.5 (no.9). ‘They use art components and design principles to form a visual art study.’

Color: Color types, light, dark, intense

What does ‘intense color’ mean? Color intensity or the concept of saturation is included in the literature. However, whether color is mentioned clearly or whether it refers to another topic requiring technical information requires clarification.

b. Cultural heritage:

b.1 (no.3). ‘They compare the general characteristics of artworks from different cultures.’

This goal is similar to that in b.2 (as shown in Appendix). It is not appropriate to put two identical attainment goals in the same grade level. This will cast doubts on to the reliability of the curriculum. Therefore, one of these attainments should be removed from this grade level.

b.2 (no.4). ‘He/she identifies the common characteristics in artworks from different cultures in the museum.’

Although seemingly, this statement may reach its goal under a collection of ethnographic products and artworks from different cultures (like the Ankara Anatolian Civilizations Museum), it does, of course, apply to schools and formal education in Turkey. Therefore, the goals of the curriculum need to be ‘general’ and ‘accessible’ in line with the ‘rules’ and ‘educational ethics.’ It is an overreaching task to find works from different cultures in artists’ workshops. Thus, this statement should be removed from this attainment goal. Both the statement and explanation need to be rewritten. Alternatively, they could be removed from the curriculum.

c. Art criticism and aesthetics:

c.1. ‘They know the difference between abstract, realistic and figurative artworks.’

Have the students been previously taught about abstract art? How in-depth will this information be? Is it appropriate for school children to evaluate the concept of abstract art? In addition, is there a new understanding or concept called ‘figurative art’? Because these concepts are listed together and followed by ‘artworks,’ it is clear that they are regarded as examples of the same class. In this case, are there no figures in abstract art? Are there no figures in realist art? This information pollution must be resolved and removed from the attainment curriculum.

c.2. ‘They can explain their reasons for selecting an artwork.’

Do children select artworks? What does this attainment goal seek to gain? If it refers to the ability to make a selection from many choices and to link this selection to arbitrarily specific reasons, then it is possible to express this in Turkish terms and more clearly. This curriculum attainment should be rewritten or removed.

c.3. ‘They notice that people have different aesthetic preferences.’

Artworks of different styles are selected by students. Students are able to explain their reasons for selecting that artwork.

What has changed is not the phenomenon of ‘aesthetic preference;’ it is the differences in aesthetic likings. We make our selections according to our aesthetic likings (Kagan, 2008: 32). This attainment goal should be rewritten to reduce information pollution and to better relate to Turkish art literature.

c.4. ‘They obey ethical rules in the visual arts field.’

The earlier comments regarding ethics for the previous grades also apply here.

5. Fifth grade Visual Arts course curriculum

‘In the 5th grade Visual Arts course, the focus is on students absorbing the information they receive and artworks are evaluated in a more meaningful way. At this level, the formation of visual art study and the conveying of personal values and ideas for art appreciation are emphasized. The usage of art components and design principles by students is emphasized in their works.’

What does ‘artworks are evaluated in a more meaningful way’ mean? Does this statement infer that the evaluation of artworks in previous grades was less
meaningful? If so, what kind of ethical problem does this situation create in terms of education and art education? What does ‘personal value’ mean? What does ‘conveying of personal values and ideas’ mean? As of 2012, this grade now falls within the scope of secondary schools, and as such, this should be made clear. It is obvious that the suggestions made here regarding class level and expectations reveal intentions that are erroneous in terms of information, conception and education pedagogy. This line of thought should be ignored and this section restructured.

a. Visual communication and design:

‘Understanding and applying the process, starting with brainstorming and continuing until ideas, drawings, details and a visual art study emerge.’

The criticism aimed at the equivalent statement for the 1st, 3rd and 4th grades applies here.

a.1. ‘They use the steps of the application process to form a visual arts study.’

a.2. ‘Measurement and ratio are used to illustrate the phenomenon of location in visual arts study.’

Because the space phenomenon mainly relates to volume, it is inappropriate to only use ratio and measurement, which takes us to the same point on a two-dimensional level, and describe location. This goal requires review and rewriting.

a.3. ‘He/she uses aerial perspective in visual arts study.’

After giving the valor, an aerial perspective may be appropriate; however, without fundamental knowledge of perspective, it is somewhat concerning to state this optical illusion (created by a change of background colors) as an attainment goal. It is thought that this expression could be included as an activity suggestion in location definition or color knowledge.

a.4. ‘They draw a human figure based on proportions from observations.

The drawing of figures by observation only may not be appropriate for children of this age. Based on live models, 5th graders might find it difficult to use patterns. However, basic patterns can be created using live models once rotation—proportion, balance, line effects, and the like are explained, which are included in the curriculum. Thus, by trial and error, children learn the components and principles of, for example, space, close-far and perspective.

b. Art criticism and aesthetics:

b.1 (no.6). ‘They learn why artworks are evaluated differently.’

It is emphasized that aesthetic judgments may be different because an artwork is evaluated sensually, economically, historically, socio-culturally, and functionally.

What does ‘evaluated differently’ mean? The explanation for this is quite interesting: it is stated that aesthetic judgment in an artwork could be different because of political, economic, socio-cultural, and functional components. There is consistency in neither the explanation nor the attainment goal. Namely, historical, economic, and political events determine our judgment about an artwork along with the social inputs in which that artwork is created. These are determinative components which cannot be depicted as influential or external causes. However, differences between artworks are extremely characteristic and personal in terms of the artists and designers of that period. This should not be confused with any effect. Thus, this is a flawed explanation and statement based on aesthetics, which is evaluated beyond the usual scope. The concern is that such misinformation will be reflected onto the students when their teacher attempts to apply this attainment goal.

b.2 (no.7). ‘They obey ethical rules in visual art studies.’

The previous comments regarding this attainment goal apply here as well.

6. Sixth grade visual arts course curriculum

a. Visual communication and design:

a.1. ‘Students create a presentation file of visual arts studies.’

A presentation file is prepared reflecting the process starting with brainstorming and continuing until the formation of ideas, drawing, detailing and visual arts study occurs.

The preparation of a ‘presentation file’ must be defined and included in the explanation.

a.2 (no.3). ‘They convey their ideas and experiences in visual art studies using written, oral, rhythmic, dramatic, and such methods.’

It is of little value to relate the other narration tools (such written, oral, rhythmic, drama) of an idea, belief or emotion that is already expressed by the visual language of art. The purpose is to obtain a visual expression using various tools. The fundamental goal has been reached by conveying thoughts and experiences by visual means. Nor is there any necessity or meaning in conducting the process in the reverse order. Thus, this attainment goal requires revision.

a.3 (no.4). ‘They reflect their ideas in visual arts study based on a selected theme and topic.’
Information on cells from science class is used in 6th grade attainment goals and the concept of texture in the Visual Arts course (6.1.8). In this context, students are able to form external textures originating from different cell textures that they have seen in Science class.

The attainment statement is rather clear and concise. The explanation mentions a relation between courses, and also suggests an activity based on this relation. Is it necessary to include an explanation regarding this attainment goal? Why are additional expressions repeatedly required to explain the limitations of attainment goals, despite the inclusion of this and similar activity examples in various attainment goals in the curriculum? This aspect will be confusing for teachers applying the curriculum. To achieve language consistency, the explanation should include definitions.

b. Cultural heritage:

b.1 (no.3). ‘He/she recognizes the role of handcrafts in society.’

What role do handcrafts play in society? To fulfill this attainment goal, students need to identify it. Therefore, instead of stating the ‘role of handcrafts in society’ the goal should be more explicit. The language used in the curriculum does not reflect daily Turkish language.

b.2 (no.5). ‘He/she notices how visual artworks, history and culture affect one another.’

History and art are sub-components of culture. Therefore, extreme care must be directed when composing a sentence describing such an interaction. Reference to the history-art relationship to culture may be a more appropriate approach. It is thought that this or a similar rearrangement could improve this attainment goal, thereby reducing information pollution.

c. Art criticism and aesthetics:

c.1 (no.2). ‘He/she explains the emotions and thoughts reflected by the artist in their artwork.’

The student is asked to interpret or guess the possible emotions and thoughts of the artist relating to their artwork; that is, the student is asked to provide an opinion. We can never completely know the emotions and thoughts of artists as reflected in artworks and cannot, therefore, explain these at whatever level, even if we observe the creation of the piece. We can merely state our opinion. This expression, which includes an extreme aesthetical information error, should be removed. This goal contains a conceptual error and is, as such, unethical.

c.2 (no.6). ‘He/She explains how artworks evoke personal feelings, emotions and aesthetic reaction.’

Aesthetic reaction is an attitude we demonstrate in a situation, event, artwork, product, and the like. Therefore it does not move. It is related to an attitude to be developed as a result of an evaluation, after going through an intelligence and knowledge filter; it consists of mental analysis. Therefore, it is essential that this error be remedied.

7. Seventh grade Visual Arts course curriculum

a. Visual communication and design:

a.1 (no.2). ‘He/she skilfully uses art techniques in visual arts study.’

The student cannot be expected to competently use techniques to create art and design. No such goal exists for visual arts education in the formal education process. Skill deemed to be at an expert level is only appropriate as a goal at higher education institutions. This attainment goal, which could discourage students and confuse attainment goals, should be removed from the curriculum.

a.2 (no.3). ‘They take a moment from any period of their life and retell it in a visual arts study.’

Students create a story from personal events and develop it. We see here that an event that could be a suitable ‘subject matter’ is turned into an attainment goal. Attainment goals do not consist of subjects; they consist of actions and are designed to gain a single goal. Thus, this attainment goal should be removed and/or replaced.

a.3 (no.4). ‘Traditional and contemporary materials and techniques are used in visual arts study.’

Traditional materials include dry paint, watercolor paint, crayons, and brushes, and contemporary materials include video, computers, cameras, and tablets.

The technical and material aspects of visual arts cannot be an attainment goal applied to the entire country and art education. They can only be various techniques and materials suggested under all attainment goals. This matter should be evaluated under a separate heading. Techniques and materials are both given as information and experience, not only at this level but for all levels. They do not possess the necessary content to be considered a separate ‘attainment’ goal and only in one class.

b. Cultural heritage:

b.1 (no.2). ‘They analyze how art and culture affect one another.’

This and similar expressions are included in numerous
sections in the curriculum. This statement should be replaced with one that emphasizes that interaction originates from culture.

b.2 (no.3). ‘He/she explains the contributions of artists to society.’
There is no obligation for artists to have a ‘positive’ effect such as making a contribution to society. Thus, instead of the term ‘contributions,’ words that emphasize the function and state of the artist in society would save this statement from being ineffective.

c. Art criticism and aesthetics:

c.1 (no.2). ‘Art criticism is used to evaluate artworks.’
The following questions are included in addition to those included in the art criticism section in attainment 3.3.3. for 3rd grade classes.

Definition:
How would you term the main texture in the artwork? (Is it superficial or natural?)
What forms are effective in this artwork? (Geometric, organic, or both)
Which tools were used?
What technique was applied in the artwork?
What is the name of the artist who made the artwork?
What kind of artwork is this? (Graphic design, ceramic, sculpture, painting, printmaking, and the like)
When was this artwork made?
List some of the significant events that took place in the period that this artwork was made.

Solution:
How were light and color values formed?
From which perspective was the artwork looked at and made?
What is the closest and farthest thing to you in the artwork? Why do you think so?
How were the shapes arranged in the artwork?
How was value used in the artwork? (Light, dark, medium or high contrast)
Were the objects or figures in the artwork life-size?
If the artwork is a sculpture, does it look light or heavy?

Interpretation:
What is the main theme of the artwork?
What do you think the artist made this artwork from?
Are there symbols in the artwork with different meanings?
If so, what are they?
Does the object in the artwork evoke a particular scent for you?
Does the object in the artwork evoke a particular taste for you?
Does the object in the artwork evoke a particular image for you?

Does the artwork have a special message? What could that be?
What do the lines, colors and shapes make you feel when you look at the artwork?

Judgment:
Is this artwork beautiful? Why?
Does this artwork feel cold to you?
Do you think this artwork has a historical value?
Do you think this artwork has a function? Why?
Do you like this artwork? Why?
Do you think the artwork is successful?
Is this artwork worth putting into a museum?
Which room of your home do you think would be appropriate for this artwork? Why?
Why would someone want to make an artwork such as this (criticism of artwork)?
If necessary, there may be further questions taking into account the type of artwork and student level.

The purpose of asking children such questions is not clear. In this case, it is of little value to criticize a group of adults who evaluate the harmony of frames placed in a room. Which one of them is correct? Is it to approach the artwork from an economic perspective and to treat it as a valuable ‘good;’ is it to evaluate the work based on the value added to you, your room or your office? This issue should be emphasized and the attainment goals and explanations should be written to avoid any misunderstanding that may poison both teacher and student and following generation. Therefore, this statement must be removed.

c.2 (no.3). ‘They compare the artwork-making processes of artists.’
Groups may be formed in the classroom and each group may be asked to research a different artwork-creation process. Acquired information is then shared in the classroom.

The artwork types shown above are separated in terms of the material they are made of and the technique used. These are not ‘types.’ These are the shapes and forms distinguished according to the material and technique of the artwork. Thus, the creative process of these artworks cannot be obtained following any research, and they cannot be known. However, materials and technical use conditions and processes can be evaluated, but it is understood that this is not the intended attainment goal. Therefore, the explanation must be revised and improved, and the attainment goal should relate to technique and material. Furthermore, this begs the question: For how much longer will technical difference and variety of material be repeatedly included as an attainment goal?

c.3 (no.6). ‘They interpret the effects of social and cultural
beliefs in an artwork.’

What does ‘social belief’ mean in artworks? What does ‘cultural belief’ mean? The aim of the attainment goal and explanation is not clear and is, thus, unethical.

8. Eighth grade visual arts course curriculum

a. Visual communication and design:

a.1. ‘They show the creation process of visual arts studies in their drawing book.’

Students can visually record in a drawing book the possible evolution of design and application from its inception to its end. However, this is only one aspect that can be shown visually. The ‘didactic’ process that is frequently emphasized in the curriculum and ‘starting with brainstorming’ is not included here. When the curriculum was designed, it is believed to have been the intention. Therefore, it would be beneficial to revise the attainment goal to directly and clearly convey the intended purpose.

a.2. ‘They develop a process file as a source of visual arts study.’

Although a ‘presentation file’ is mentioned previously, the content of the file here is not clearly defined. In addition, a ‘process file’ is mentioned. Even if the ambiguity here is overlooked, one could ask if there is a source for forming art or design. Is this source the process file? Or is it a file in which a series of formations are accumulated with literary, linear and other factors? This type of file will have the characteristics of a file showing the development process of children or adolescents and providing some idea about their references. This is certainly necessary in terms of receiving feedback. However, it does not have the characteristics of a source. In other words, the sole purpose of making a process file cannot be new investments in a source. Creativity is not guided by such a rule. When the connectivity of the attainment goal is considered, it would be worthwhile to amend the statement to prevent misunderstandings of this type.

a.3. ‘They make use of contemporary art to create a visual art study.’

The term ‘current art’ must be clearly defined. In addition, on reflection, benefiting from art using their own production and artistic creativity sounds strange. This attainment appears to be an activity. There is an obligation for attainment goals to be directed at a single target, and with a general and clear statement. This attainment fails to do so and should be removed.

a.4. ‘They form visual arts study using inscriptions and visuals.’

If inscriptions and visual materials are involved, the design and graphic arrangement are mentioned. Therefore, it would be more direct and clear if a ‘design’ phrase was used instead of visual arts study.

a.5. ‘They reflect current events to visual art studies.’

This attainment concerns a ‘topic’ and should be revised or removed.

b. Cultural heritage:

b.1. ‘They define how artworks are affected by social, political and economic factors.’

Because this issue also appears in the ‘recognition’ or ‘defining’ stage in the previous class levels, it is only natural that this function evolves into a higher expectation at this level. Here, the attainment goal should be amended to reflect a higher skill level.

c. Art criticism and aesthetics:

c.1 (no.3). ‘He/She expresses the relation between aesthetics and art.’

The term ‘aesthetics’ is used only for art. Moreover, it is an expression equivalent to art in many fields. For example, the term ‘aesthetic surgery,’ which is somewhat confusing, is used in health sciences (Tunali 1998). The term ‘aesthetic’ is defined by ‘surgical,’ and there is no need for this distinction. It is crucial that the attainment goal is revised because the use of aesthetics above is not related to art.

c.2 (no.4). ‘They analyze their studies and those of their peers.’

Clarification is required regarding the dimension of the study to be analyzed here and its definition. Otherwise, it is difficult to deduce an action from this attainment goal.

c.3 (no.5). ‘He/She expresses the definition of art.’

What does ‘expresses the definition of art’ mean? What was the original intention if written in daily Turkish language? The writers of the curriculum need to clarify this point. The goal is confusing as it states that the process will end with a ‘discussion,’ as the attainment sentence includes the word ‘expresses.’ Thus, it is essential that the attainment goal and explanation be rewritten in everyday Turkish.

c.4 (no.6). ‘He/She analyzes the effect of components such as images, inscriptions and symbols in contemporary media.’

What are the effects of the tools in contemporary media and how will they be analyzed? This should be clearly stated. Is it in accordance with the organization of each component or will they be analyzed using two-dimensional
and three-dimensional studies in terms of the difference between technique and function when these materials are used? This statement needs to be revised to avoid confusion and should be based on the age of the target children/adolescents.

c.5 (no.7). ‘He/She notices the effects of popular culture on modern visual arts.’
This may represent a more appropriate approach to discuss the effects of popular culture tools. The created culture is made by art and design products and, as such, it does not affect something that comes out of itself; however, it may be reflected by the relevant tools.

**DISCUSSION**

The results of the descriptive analysis of the 2013 Visual Arts Curriculum (1-8) are summarized as follows:

i) The information and directives in the introduction section of the curriculum should be reviewed, and the information should be handled in the light of relevant science and according to the design and art field with a motivating and leading approach.

ii) The contradictions between directives regarding the areas of learning in the curriculum and naming and content should be removed. Furthermore, the continuity of the interdisciplinary approach (made clear in the 2006 and 2013 curricula) should be determined again, with characteristics that will ensure its reinforcement.

iii) Regarding the curriculum’s attainment goals designed for each class level:
- Language integrity must be provided by means of appropriate and clear use of the Turkish language. Expressions that violate language rules and to go beyond scientific expression must be removed.
- Each expression must be directed at an action and all attainment goals that go beyond this must be revised following the attainment format and include applicable characteristics.
- Areas of learning must be made appropriate for the predetermined content. Hence attainment criteria deemed inappropriate are shown in the above analysis.
- Those regarding an activity and limited to a single application must be amended.
- Various determinants of the attainment goals are inappropriate (such as economic value, too general, inapplicable and incoherent). To ensure the integrity of the curriculum, this issue must be resolved.
- The expectation that the organization of attainment goals would be improved in the 2013 curriculum has not been met. Future analysis will investigate this issue further.

Kahraman (2014) records that teachers interviewed have also vocalized how some of the attainment goals are difficult and excessively detailed and how they should be re-designed according to the students’ levels appropriately (235).

iv) The curriculum contains numerous examples of erroneous information causing misunderstanding regarding phrases related to art and design in the name of visual arts.

v) The issue of measurement-evaluation was only briefly discussed and the terminology of the related tools was not explained. Measurement tools must be introduced.

vi) Basic data obtained in the evaluation of the educational curriculum show that the curriculum was not created through an understanding enabling economy, practicality, intelligibility and the development of a new skill at each grade level. Thus, despite the curriculum lacking essential characteristics, it has been in operation since the beginning of the 2013–2014 academic year. It can be argued that it has harmed visual arts classes, which should be ‘optional’ classes, as a separate class and with its own content.

vii) It is expected that art education classes (which are the most fundamental classes in formal education to ensure the transfer of national values and culture), and elementary and secondary school curricula that are the first step in this process, have necessary characteristics and content to serve this purpose. Those who do not have national values are not expected to have universal values. It is the right of every child to learn about their culture, values and art through a historical consciousness. It is expected that education curricula, which are the most direct and planned tools, contain a refined understanding. The goals of the curriculum are open to a number of interpretations and place the teachers in a difficult situation. It is undeniable that worldwide, it is of utmost importance to ensure awareness, respect for nature, self-respect, ethics, and culture treasures. However, Turkey’s curriculum contradicts these concepts and contains many ethical errors. Therefore, the curriculum cannot be considered a guide offering practical education. Instead of strengthening the curriculum, it has weakened it. As this problem continues into higher educational levels, we cannot expect young Turks to accept the world as it is, nor will they be well-rounded citizens. Thus, it is only a dream to expect our youth, who are ‘strangers’ to the realities of the world and with a ‘lost’ education, to be ‘people of the world.’ As the Great Atatürk (the founder and first president of Turkey) stated, ‘A nation without art is one whose veins have been cut off.’

viii) It is not easy for people who are familiar with the universal language of art and the power of artistic transfer in communication to adapt to a world limited by technology. Thus, it is essential that children in the process of becoming adults receive art education to ensure the successful adaption to modern conditions. Unfortunately, the curriculum has failed at this juncture to address these significant points.
ix) The results of this study highlight the need for further study into the classification of the attainment criteria in skill areas and the founding of a grading system for this classification.

x) This evaluation presents an opportunity to compare current data with that of the 2006 curriculum.

xi) It is expected that data from this evaluation will present significant challenges for scholars conducting academic research in this field, primarily the Ministry of National Education, and will be the unifying point in the search for solutions. As Kahraman discusses, teachers commenting on the problems experienced in arts classes have repeatedly expressed that the course is not taken seriously, that teachers are inapt in some exercises, and that families’ social standing and the total course hours fall short (236). It is expected that such direct comments from teachers fully involved in the curriculum will be taken into account more seriously and, so will this evaluation.

xii) It is expected that scholars in this area will conduct empirical research and quantitative data analysis to assess the success or failure of Turkey’s art education policy.

CONFLICT OF INTERESTS

The author has not declared any conflict of interests.

REFERENCES


Tonguç İH (1932). İlk, Orta ve Muallim Mekteplerinde Resim, Elişleri ve Sanat Terbiyesi (Painting, Handcrafts and Art Education in Elementary and Middle Schools and Teacher Training Schools). İstanbul: Muallim A. Halit Library.


Tunali İ (1998). Estetik (Aesthetics). 5th Ed. İstanbul: Remzi. (https://www.google.com/search?q=ismail+tunal%衣estetik+1998&rlz=1C1EJFA_enTR722TR722&tbm=isch&source=iu&ictx=1&fir=EGIQPHMZcmmBM%3B%253A%252Cq7FkA8tbYMVI%M%252C&usg=A14_-kRQJQ3_EkRZUjrhxqkAkJgjZTog&sa=X&ved=2ahUKEwi6wZmOs__fAhWuy4UKKch9D7oQ9OEwBXeECAAYQBA#imgrc=EGIQPHMZcmmBM:).
APPENDIX

Outline of the Visual Arts curriculum (Grades 1-8)

1st Grade visual arts course curriculum

a. Visual communication and design
   a.1. Students are aware of the requirements for visual arts studies.
   The visual arts curriculum incorporates different materials and involves determination and representation of feelings, thoughts, and observations.
   a.2. Students use different materials, tools and techniques in visual arts studies.
   a.3. They reflect their feelings and thoughts through visual art.
   a.4. They produce visual art based on themes, subjects, thoughts, poems and stories.
   a.5. They arrange forms on a two-dimensional level.
   The arrangement comprises various shapes, such as squares, circles, of triangles, atop a coloured background cardboard.
   a.6. They are aware of the figure–location relationship in visual arts studies.
   An exercise is designed where students position themselves within a specified space. During the exercise, distance and size relations among the objects and students within that space are identified.
   a.7. Students use big–small relations in visual arts studies.
   a.8. They observe objects and figures in their environs and draw them.
   a.9. They can form three-dimensional pieces.
   Three-dimensional art, such as origami, can be formed using techniques such as cutting, gluing, and/or folding.
   a.10. As visual artworks are formed, students use art and design principles.
   Colour: Main colours
   Line: Zigzag, dot, undulating, spiral
   Shape/Form: Geometric, organic

b. Cultural heritage
   b.1. They understand that art is a part of culture.
   b.2. They notice that art is a part of culture.
   b.3. They express their impressions regarding museums, art galleries, artist workshops, historical ruins, etc.

c. Art criticism and aesthetics
   c.1. Students distinguish between artificial objects and natural objects.
   Students recognize artificial (human-made) and natural objects in their surroundings, including artworks. After the objects are examined, the art components of these objects are identified, such as colour, line and shape/form.
   c.2. Students describe the formal characteristics of artworks.
   Artworks are selected according to the age and level of students; they are examined in terms of colour, line and shape/form.
   c.3. Students indicate differences between artworks.
   The differences between two selected artworks are considered. A statue and an oil painting are brought to the class or images are shown. Students are asked to describe the differences between the two works. The teacher writes the students’ ideas on the blackboard. He/she then seeks further discussions about the statements on the board. The teacher then explains the difference between the two pieces.

2nd Grade Visual Arts course curriculum

The 2nd grade visual arts course emphasizes that students create new ideas based on inspiration/reflections from experiences, school, close surroundings, Turkish culture and different cultures. They can use art materials and techniques to transfer such inspiration into ideas.

a. Visual communication and design
   a.1. Students try to find various solutions to the problems faced as visual artworks are formed.
   Students are asked how a matter can be expressed, the way the space is to be represented, which colours, lines, and
shapes/forms are to be used.
a.2. Students notice that unexpected/unforeseen results can occur when artwork is produced.  
It is emphasized that it is natural for plans and designs to change, depending on the stage and process.
a.3. Students describe the use of imagination in visual artworks.
Imagination is discussed and the students carry out projects on this topic.
a.4. Inspiration comes from various written resources, concepts and themes as visual art studies are formed.
a.5. Foreground and background are used in visual artworks.
a.6. Objects are placed according to their size and ratio-proportion in visual art studies.
a.7. He/she makes drawings based on observations to form visual art studies.
a.8. Visual arts studies are formed by inspiration from daily life.
a.9. He/she makes three-dimensional studies using different materials.
Manual shaping techniques can be used when these studies are generated. In this context, simple shapes can be made such as animals, fruit and kitchen utensils.
a.10. Art components and design principles are used as visual art studies are formed.

**Colour:** Intermediate colour
**Form:** Three-dimensional (cube, cylinder, pyramid, cone, sphere)
**Line:** Vertical, horizontal, diagonal
**Shape/Form:** Two-dimensional geometric and organic

b. Cultural heritage
b.1. They identify different intentions from different cultures.
Specifically, intentions with symbolic meaning are selected.
b.2. They recognize architectural components belonging to Turkish culture.
Architectural components such as bay windows, adobe windows, rectangular windows, yards, roofs, ceilings, and doors are shown.
b.3. They recognize architectural components from other cultures.
Residential structures such as traditional Japanese houses, Eskimo houses, etc. are shown.
b.4. They recognize the importance of museums, art galleries, artists’ workshops, historical ruins, etc.
b.5. They recognize handcrafts.

c. Art criticism and aesthetics
c.1. They recognize the scope of the artwork.
Teachers show their students artwork samples including different scopes. They are asked what they see in the artworks. When these are classified according to subject, they are asked what they see. When these are classified according to subject matter, they are asked whether the work is a portrait, still life or landscape. The answers given by the students are written on the board. The teacher indicates that artworks that include a head are called portraits; artworks where objects, such as fruit, bowls, jugs, or fabrics, are used together are called still lifes; and artworks that include nature and scenery are called landscapes.
c.2. They interpret the ideas and feelings in their own artwork and that of their peers.
Students may be asked to state what they wanted to reflect in their visual artworks and to express an opinion about what their classmates reflected in their artworks.

### 3rd Grade Visual Arts course curriculum

The focus here is students learning through questioning. Students are able to express opinions, apply their knowledge and evaluate when forming visual arts studies. Attention is also paid to the examination of art and architecture from different cultures.

a. Visual communication and design
a.1. They follow the steps of the application process when forming visual arts pieces.
Students recognize and apply the process, which starts with brainstorming and continues until an artwork is formed.
a.2. An expressive approach is used when artwork is formed.
Students may be asked to apply the positive experience of receiving a good report card, the excitement from sports activities, etc. to their work.
a.3. Ideas are formed using inspiration from daily resources when creating visual artworks.
Aural, written and visual resources are examined.
a.4. They use observed geometric and organic shapes in drawings.
Geometric and organic forms of objects such as flowers, leaves, seashells, etc. are used in drawings based on observation.
a.5. They define and use foreground, middleground, background plans in two-dimensional studies.
a.6. They make three-dimensional pieces using different materials by adding and subtracting.
Students make three-dimensional studies using material such as wood, metal, fabric, waste products, etc.
a.7. They use art components and design principles when forming visual art studies.

Colour: Hot, cold
Location: Positive, negative
Balance: Symmetric, asymmetric, central
Contrast: Dark–light and opposite colours, etc.

b. Cultural heritage
They discuss how handcrafts reflect different cultures and periods using artworks.
b.1. They compare artworks from their own and other cultures.
Visits are made to museums, art galleries, artists’ workshops, historical ruins, etc. Where this is not possible, replicas and copies are used.
b.2. They examine the relationship between an artwork’s form and function.

c. Art criticism and aesthetics
c.1. They are aware of the intentions of local culture.
The intention, often having symbolic meaning, behind artworks, such as architecture, paintings, carpets, rugs, jewellery, or china, is examined. The intention/purpose is shown in artworks by Osman Hamdi Bey, Nuri İyem, Malik Aksel, Mustafa Plevneli, Nuri Abacı, Erol Akyavaş, Bedri Rahmi Eyüboğlu, and Turgut Zaim, in the doors at Sivas Divriği Ulu Mosque and Şifahane, Erzurum Çifte Minareli Madrasa, and Dolmabahçe in the use of tulips, carnations and tree of life in Turkish ornamental arts.
c.2. They examine examples of portraits, landscapes, still lifes and depictive artworks.
Examples of portrait, landscape, still life and depictive artworks are shown: portraits by Osman Hamdi Bey, landscape paintings by Nazmi Ziya, still life paintings by Mahmut Cüda and Feyhaman Duran, and artworks of Sami Yetik on the Independence War.
c.3. They show the art components and design principles used in artworks.
Students are taught about art components and design principles until they are able to express and demonstrate this in artworks.
c.4. They can express an opinion on the artworks they study.
The focus here is on definition, solution, interpretation and opinions.

Definition:
What do you see in artworks?
What materials were used in the artworks?
What kind of art form is this?
What colours do you see?

Solution:
How are the colours arranged?
Are warm colours or cold colours dominant in the artwork?
Which lines are used in the artwork? (Straight, curved, broken, zigzag, all).
How is balance formed in the artwork?
How is location formed in artwork? (Straight, one on the top of the other, depth, etc.)

Interpretation:
What does the artwork make you feel?
What kind of voice does the artwork have?
What is the story in the artwork?
If you had to name this artwork, what name would you give it?
Does the name of artwork reflect the content of the study?
Judgment:
Is this artwork valuable? Why?
Would you want to hang this artwork in your room? Why?
What is the difference between this artwork and its copy?

c.5. He/she indicates the differences between artworks and objects that do not have artistic value.
c.6. He/she notices that artworks have a value.
The reasons behind the effective, economic, political, and historical components of an artwork, relative to the student’s level, are emphasized.
c.7. They are aware of the ethical rules in the arts field.

4th Grade Visual Arts course curriculum

In addition to the visual arts course enabling sensitivity to the arts, art components and design principles are emphasized. Students are taught to explain their opinions about their own visual artworks, the materials used and the main idea behind their work. A further focus is on examining the effect of historical artworks on modern culture.

a. Visual communication and design
a.1. They use design steps to form visual arts studies.
a.2. They show the use of the information and experience gained in their visual arts studies.
a.3. They use their imagination as they form visual arts studies.
a.4. They relate their experiences using different thoughts, art forms and cultural themes to form visual arts studies.
a.5. They make decisions to create composition unity in a visual arts study.
The students make decisions to select appropriate art components and design principles in visual arts studies.
a.6. They can create depth on a two-dimensional level.
The placement of one shape on top of the other, changes in measurement and changing the placement in the composition using the shapes that are formed.
a.7. They use contour lines and shadowing techniques in drawings based on observation.
Contour should be handled as a single line.
a.8. They use different materials and conduct three-dimensional studies.
As indicated in attainment 4.2.4, following the examination of artworks in museums from different cultures, applications are made based on students’ opinions (using materials such as clay, etc.).
Furthermore, they show colour and texture components in their studies as indicated in attainment 4.1.9.
a.9. They use art components and design principles to form visual art studies.

Colour: Colour types, light, dark, intense
Texture: Real, artificial
Value: Intensity of a colour, grading and shadowing
Variety: Usage of one or more art components together to create interest.

b. Cultural heritage
b.1. They define the roles of artists and craftspeople.
b.2. They compare the distinct characteristics of artworks from Turkish culture with those of other cultures.
b.3. They compare the general characteristics of artworks from different cultures.
Examples of artworks from Turkish culture and from European, Asian, African, etc. cultures.
b.4. He/she identifies the common characteristics in artworks from different cultures in the museum.
Visits are made to museums, art galleries, artists’ workshops, historical ruins, etc. Where no such opportunities exist, then replicas and copies are used.
b.5. They recognize the various professions in the visual arts field.
They examine occupations such as photographer, sculptor, painter, architect, illustrator and designer.

c. Art criticism and aesthetics
c.1. They know the difference between abstract, realistic and figurative artworks.
c.2. They can explain their reasons for selecting an artwork.
c.3. They notice that people have different aesthetic preferences.
Artworks of different styles are selected by students. Students are able to explain their reasons for selecting that
artwork.
c.4. They obey ethical rules in the visual arts area.

**5th Grade Visual Arts course curriculum**

In the 5th grade visual arts course, the focus is on students absorbing the information they receive and artworks are evaluated in a more meaningfully way. At this level, the formation of visual art study and the conveying of personal values and ideas for art appreciation are emphasized. The usage of art components and design principles by students is emphasized in their works.

a. Visual communication and design

*Understanding and applying the process, starting with brainstorming and continuing until ideas, drawings, details and a visual art study emerge.*

a.1. They use the steps of the application process to form a visual art study.

a.2. Measurement and ratio are used to illustrate the location phenomenon in visual arts study.

a.3. He/she uses aerial perspective in visual arts studies.

a.4. They draw a human figure based on proportions from observations.

a.5. They use different materials in visual arts studies.

*Videos, computers, cameras, tablets, etc. can be used, depending on schools’ resources.*

a.6. They form a relief or sculpture using three-dimensional art materials.

a.7. They use art components and design principles when visual art studies are formed.

*Colour: Colours, light, dark, tones formed by students*

*Form: Concave, convex, negative, positive*

*Texture: Surface embroidery*

*Value: Intensity of a colour, graduation*

*Balance: Symmetrical, asymmetrical*

b. Cultural heritage

b.1. They can explain the similarities and differences between the artworks and artists from different cultures.

*Examples of artworks mainly from Turkish culture and other cultures (e.g., European, Asian, African).*

b.2. They can identify the differences between historical and contemporary artworks.

b.3. They can identify the relation between museums and visual arts.

*Museums, museum types and the contribution of museums to cultural inheritance are emphasized.*

b.4. They can identify the relation between the art materials used and the various types of artists in the visual art field.

*Artistic professions and materials used are emphasized; for example, those materials (e.g., clay, metal, stone, bronze, plaster, wood, etc.) are used by sculptors to form their artworks.*

c. Art criticism and aesthetics

c.1. They compare natural and constructed environment.

c.2. They analyse the visual characteristics of selected artworks.

c.3. They interpret the content of selected artworks.

c.4. They analyse artworks according to the period and conditions in which they were created.

*The environment and conditions in which artists lived, the function of artworks, and religious, intellectual and cultural characteristics are examined.*

c.5. They analyse their own visual art studies.

*They can express that their artworks are formed according to the conditions and environment in which they live.*

c.6. They learn why artworks are evaluated differently.

*It is emphasized that aesthetic judgments may be different because an artwork is evaluated sensually, economically, historically, socio-culturally, and functionally.*

*It is emphasized that aesthetic judgments may be different because an artwork is evaluated sensually, economically, historically, socio-culturally, and functionally.*

c.7. They obey ethical rules in visual art studies.

**6th Grade Visual Arts course curriculum**

In the 6th grade visual arts course, students are able to reflect their emotions and thoughts in their works using art
components and design principles. The analysis and evaluation of how artists use forms, materials and symbols in their artworks are emphasized.

a. Visual communication and design
   a.1. Students create a presentation file of visual arts studies.
   A presentation file is prepared reflecting the process starting with brainstorming and continuing until the formation of ideas, drawings, details and visual arts study occurs.
   a.2. They use different materials and techniques in the formation of visual arts study.
   a.3. They convey their ideas and experiences in visual arts studies using written, aural, rhythmic, dramatic, etc. methods.
   a.4. They reflect their ideas in visual art studies based on a selected theme and topic.
   Information on cells from science class is used in 6th grade attainment goals and the concept of texture in the visual arts course (6.1.8). In this context, students are able to form external textures originating from different cell textures that they have seen in science class.
   a.5. They use perspective in visual art studies.
   Line perspective is used in this attainment goal to create depth.
   a.6. They make short- and long-term drawings based on observations.
   a.7. They use sculpture, assembly or modelling techniques to form three-dimensional studies.
   It is emphasized here that assembly is formed naturally and by organizing industrial objects within a new arrangement.
   a.8. They use different types of handcrafts together in visual art studies.
   Different types of Turkish handcraft, such as calligraphy with marbling, stencilling with marbling, jewellery and weaving, etc. when visual art studies are formed.
   a.9. They use art components and design principles when forming visual art studies.
   Colour: Colour relationships
   Line: Different line types
   Texture: External texture, visual texture
   Value: Grading
   Ratio-proportion: Realistic, deformed

b. Cultural heritage
   b.1. He/she explains the theme selected by an artist in their artworks, the materials used and techniques.
   b.2. He/she examines handcraft examples in ethnographic museums.
   Materials such as replicas, copies, etc. are used in locations where there is no ethnographic museum.
   b.3. He/she recognizes the role of handcrafts in society.
   b.4. He/she recognizes Anatolian civilizations by means of artworks in museums.
   b.5. He/she understands how visual artworks, history and culture affect one another.
   b.6. He/she can explain the similarities and differences between professions in visual arts.

c. Art criticism and aesthetics
   c.1. He/she uses critical-thinking skills to define, explain, interpret and judge artworks.
   The examination of artworks by a detailed explanation of the artist’s intention and related information. At the end of the examination, the student is asked ‘Is this artwork successful? Why is it successful?’
   c.2. He/she explains the emotions and thoughts reflected by the artist in their artwork.
   c.3. He/she explains the effect of visual language in conveying personal expressions.
   The role of art components and design principles in conveying expressions in the examined artwork, specifically art components, are emphasized.
   c.4. He/she discusses why artists create artworks.
   c.5. He/she explains the effect of personal opinions and value judgments on the evaluation of artworks.
   c.6. He/she explains how artworks evoke personal feelings, emotions and aesthetic reaction.

7th Grade Visual Arts course curriculum

The focus in the 7th grade visual arts class lies on the study of the creative process, its analysis and discovery. Students are able to produce designs using traditional and contemporary art materials based on art components and design principles. The development of students’ visual arts language is emphasized using inquiry skills to evaluate themes,
topics and symbols in artworks. Students are encouraged to investigate the meaning and value of art.

a. Visual communication and design
a.1. He/she illustrates the steps of the application process based on research in their drawing book to form visual arts studies.

a.2. He/she skilfully uses art techniques in visual arts study.

a.3. They take a moment from any period of their life and retell it in a visual arts study. Students create a story from personal events and develop it.

a.4. Traditional and contemporary materials and techniques are used in visual arts study. Traditional materials include dry paint, watercolour paint, crayons, and brushes, and contemporary materials include video, computers, cameras, and tablets.

a.5. They use different perspective techniques in visual arts studies. They use line and aerial (colour) perspective together to create depth in the location.

a.6. They use different techniques in drawings based on observations.

a.7. They create three-dimensional works using different materials and techniques.

a.8. They use art components and design principles to form visual arts studies.

b. Cultural heritage

b.1. They notice different styles in artworks.

b.2. They analyse how art and culture affect one another.

b.3. He/she explains contributions made to society by artists. The cultural, social, economic, scholastic, etc. contributions of artists are discussed.

b.4. He/she examines the effect of historical events on artworks.

c. Art criticism and aesthetics

c.1. They define the themes, topics and symbols included in artworks.

b.2. Art criticism is used to evaluate artworks. The following questions are included in addition to those included in the art criticism section in attainment 3.3.3. for 3rd grade classes.

Definition:
How would you describe the main texture in the artwork? (Is it superficial or natural?)
What are forms effective in the artwork? (Geometric, organic, both)
Which tools were used?
What technique was applied in the artwork?
What is the name of the artist who made the artwork?
What kind of artwork is this? (Graphic design, ceramic, sculpture, painting, printmaking, etc.)
When was this artwork made?
List some of the significant events that took place in the period that this artwork was made.

Solution:
How were light and colour values formed?
From which perspective was the artwork looked at and made?
What is the closest and farthest thing to you in the artwork? Why do you think so?
How were the shapes arranged in the artwork?
How was value used in the artwork? (Light, dark, medium or high contrast)
Were the objects or figures in artwork life-size?
If the artwork is a sculpture, does it look light or heavy?

Interpretation:
What is the main theme of the artwork?
What do you think the artist made this artwork from?
Are there symbols in the artwork with different meanings? If so, what are they?
Does the object in the artwork evoke a particular scent for you?
Does the object in the artwork evoke a particular taste for you?
Does the object in the artwork evoke a particular image for you?
Does the artwork have a special message? What could that be?
What do the lines, colours and shapes make you feel when you look at the artwork?

Judgment:
Is this artwork beautiful? Why?
Does this artwork feel cold to you?
Do you think this artwork has a historical value?
Do you think this artwork has a function? Why?
Do you like this artwork? Why?
Do you think the artwork is successful?
Is this artwork worth putting into a museum?
Which room of your home do you think would be appropriate for this artwork? Why?
Why would someone want to make an artwork such as this (criticism of artwork)?
If necessary, there may be further questions taking into account the type of artwork and student level.

c.3. They compare the artwork-making processes of artists.
Groups may be formed in the classroom and each group may be asked to research a different artwork-creation process. Acquired information is then shared in the classroom.
c.4. They notice style of artists in visual artworks.
c.5. They examine artworks based on personal and contextual information.
Students must take in to account that contextual information reflects the environment and conditions of the artists, the function of the artwork, influencing characteristics, and religious, intellectual and cultural characteristics. It is emphasized that personal information is obtained by observing and examining an artwork.
c.6. They interpret the effects of social and cultural beliefs in an artwork.
The effects of the beliefs and social environment from different cultures on artworks are interpreted.
c.7. They recognize the direct effect of components in contemporary media such as images, text and symbols.
c.8. They express how information and experience can affect attitudes towards an artwork.

8th Grade Visual Arts course curriculum

In 8th grade visual arts classes, the focus lies on the application of previously learned information, skills and experiences. Students are able to use different techniques together in the formation of visual art studies. For students to develop opinions on artworks, the focus lies on inquiries into the purpose, meaning and value of artwork.
a. Visual communication and design
a.1. They show the creation process of visual art studies in their drawing book.
a.2. They develop a process file as a source of visual arts study.
a.3. They make use of contemporary art to create a visual arts study.
a.4. They form a visual arts study using inscriptions and visuals.
a.5. They reflect current events in visual arts studies.
Topics such as the economy, natural disasters, environmental sensitivity, job health and safety, scientific developments, technological developments, etc. can be used.
a.6. They use different perspective techniques in their visual arts study.
One/two directional perspectives and aerial perspective are used together to create a sense of depth in the location.
a.7. They illustrate different perspectives in their drawings based on observation.
Drawings are formed using different perspectives such as bird’s-eye view, worm’s-eye view, fish-eye view, and face-on view.
a.8. They make three-dimensional studies using both different techniques and materials.
a.9. Art components and design principles are used when visual art studies are formed.
Colour: Contrast relationship
Value: Shadowing
Ratio-proportion: Ration relationships
Unity: Harmony
Variation:
Good use of one or more art component.

b. Cultural heritage
b.1. They define how artworks are affected by social, political and economic factors.
b.2. They understand the roles of artists in society.
b.3. They compare the characteristics of artworks according to term, style, and materials used.
b.4. They understand the importance of protecting artworks in museums.

c. Art criticism and aesthetics
c.1. He/she analyses the effect of the arrangement of visual language in artworks.
Artworks are examined in the context of art components and design principles.
c.2. He/she notices the effect of knowledge and experiences in evaluating an artwork.
c.3. He/she expresses the relation between aesthetics and art.
c.4. They analyse their studies and those of their peers.
c.5. He/she expresses the definition of art.
Definition, types and changes in art in different timeframes can be discussed.
c.6. He/she analyses the effect of components such as images, inscriptions and symbols in contemporary media.
c.7. He/she notices the effects of popular culture on modern visual arts.
Perceptions of democracy of foreign students studying at Mustafa Kemal University

Servet HALİ* and Fatih ÖZYURT

Department of Social Science Teaching, Faculty of Education, Mustafa Kemal University, Antakya, Turkey.

Received 21 October, 2018; Accepted 10 December, 2018

In Turkey, foreign students are studying in most of the universities. On July 15, 2016, these students faced a treacherous coup attempt against democracy and were able to witness the Turkish people's reaction to the coup attempt. The aim of this study is to examine the views of foreign students studying at Mustafa Kemal University on democracy. In the literature, foreign students who studied in Turkey have been searched in terms of many variables, but because foreign students not seen in a study examining the perception of democracy, this research has seen momentous. The sample of the study composed of foreign students studying at Mustafa Kemal University. In this study, qualitative research was applied as a data collection method. The opinions of the students were taken with the interview form and the collected information was evaluated from the educational point of view. In this study, the descriptive survey model, which is one of the general surveying methods, is used. "The Perception of Democracy of Foreign Students" questionnaire was applied to measure the perceptions of democracy of foreign students in the university. By taking into consideration various variables, it is concluded that foreign students are sensitive about democracy and anti-democratic events.

Key words: Foreign students, democracy, sense of democracy, The Arab Spring.

INTRODUCTION

According to the definition, which is generally accepted and also included in the Turkish Language Association, the concept of democracy is a form of government based on the rule of the people. It is the administration of the representatives of the people, elected as the result of free elections and preferences (Doğan, 2001: 147). This concept coming from Latin is composed of the words “demos” meaning “people” and “kratos” meaning “sovereignty, power” (Gözübüyük, 2000: 22). It indicates that political power is in the hands of the people. Abraham Lincoln described democracy during one of his speech in 1864 as "the administration of the people by the people for the people". "The principle of democracy requires the domination and possession of the nation, regardless of the means to exploit domination" said Atatürk (Tunç, 2008, 1115). Although democracy seems to be a simple definition of a few words, Dewey made a statement describing how much it could affect people, society, nations and countries. According to Dewey, democracy affects the culture of the society as well as

*Corresponding author. E-mail: s.hali@hotmail.com.
The industry, politics and education and it expresses itself in the attitudes and lives of people (Kaya, 2004: 2).

The emphasis on the form of government is often seen in the definitions of democracy. The people who will choose political power in the form of a rule based on people's sovereignty should have a free and independent will. Since democracy is based on the sovereignty of the people, the sine qua non must be the people. Within the public, the ideas and emotions, feelings of equality, justice, freedom and independence should be established. It should take place in every aspect of life and become a lifestyle. In democracy, the right to govern belongs not to a person, a family, a community or a crowd but the whole of the people. It is worth noting that equal and free individuals have it as a form of life, a way of thinking, a way of being and a moral understanding beyond the idea of democracy as a form of political management, which is described as the process of collective decision making and implementation (Özdelen, 2009: 162). It is stated that democracy is not a mere form of government but a way of life philosophy and life style. In this sense, democracy is a system that humanity cannot give up in terms of operability (Hotaman, 2010: 131). In order for democracy to become more functional, it is necessary to internalize democracy as a value and to live it in every aspect of life. Unfortunately, democracy does not work in all societies or the whole society in this way. Due to various reasons and various problems, democracy has never occurred, has been interrupted, or the level of democracy according to the definition of desired democracy has not been reached. When looking at an individual from the first moment of his birth until his death, s/he is born without knowing anything, but at the end of her/his life s/he has learned so many things and experiences. Any knowledge or experience that they learn are not to be underestimated because they cost the entire life of the individual. Raising an individual in democracy is a process like embroidery. This process starts in the family and continues in school, social environment and work life. The most functional method for the process of democracy in this way is education. There are many studies that explain the relationship between democracy and education in the world (Evans and Rose, 2006: 919; Harber and Serf, 2006: 988; McCowan, 2006: 460; Neuberger, 2007: 300).

John Dewey explained the link between democracy and education in his book "Democracy and Education". John Dewey used the philosophy of education to explain the link between democracy and education. Defending the necessity of a democratic education for the development of democratic society, Dewey emphasized the necessity of having an education that directs the life style of the individual and the use of appropriate methods for this education (Dewey, 1996: 85).

Voicing controversial topics in class, providing a discussion environment, learning of democratic concepts such as equality, freedom, human rights, etc., is important in terms of the development of democratic values (Levitt and Longstreet, 1983: 144-145).

Patrick (2003: 1-12) pointed out the importance of discussions for the teaching of democracy with an effective education in the school environment, and that the current events should be allowed by the teacher to an open classroom environment.

To gain the value of democracy to individuals or societies is with education. The basic condition for becoming a democratic society is a democratic education (Hotaman, 2010: 130). Education is an act of teaching the knowledge, skills, value, culture and language required in life or in society to enable individuals to gain a place in social life. The first place where education is given is family. Therefore, democracy education starts first in the family. It is a paradox that individuals who are not asked for ideas and who are raised under oppression whose decisions are not respected behave in accordance with democratic life. According to Dewey, ideally, democracy requires a highly educated people who are aware of the social tasks and responsibilities of political life. Otherwise, as Plato says, when the education of the public is insufficient, the insatiable desires of the leaders who are not bound by certain principles can easily transform democracy into demagoguery and despotism (Hotaman, 2010: 132). We cannot give individuals certain abilities or a certain level of intelligence. But as we can teach individuals how to hold the pen, we can teach skills, or values such as respect, love, friendship, benevolence, in every branch of life, as an example to give them the correct behavior. Democracy is one of these values. Each individual is responsible in the society to gain the value of democracy. A democratic family can behave democratically to the individual, but when an individual is in a queue in the market and sees someone who breaks the queue and the market employee allowing it, the individual may experience contradictions about democracy and this may have a negative effect on his later years (Köylü, 2001: 135).

At the point of democratization process as a country, the democratic system, such as a chain, is a democratic society, while the democratic society constitutes a democratic family and the democratic family constitutes a democratic individual. It is seen that democracy as a political regime, a way of life and value is becoming increasingly established in the management, society and individual dimension (Özpolat, 2010: 10).

If democracy culture and democratic values left as it is learned in the family and if it cannot be transferred to schools and education, it is similar to a building with a foundation of half. A second phase of the culture of democracy in the family is to continue education of individuals in schools (Orhan, 2013:20). What is important here is that teachers, principals and deputy directors of the schools, and even the other employees of
the school should be aware of their duties and responsibilities in the education of democracy. When the name of the work is education, education is not only an action carried out by teachers, but it is more global. School workers should also be a part of this action (Kaya, 2004: 71). Beyond the differences and inequalities of people in the school environment, the idea that they are equal in terms of dignity and that they should be treated equally in a legal and political sense should prevail. In this sense, equality in education does not mean that everyone should be placed in the same schools of similar quality, but equal effort is made to ensure that individuals are developed and succeeded in line with their abilities. The aim of these ideas is to educate the ideal citizen. The ideal citizen is the individuals who have absolute independence regarding judgements. The citizenship of the individual can be measured effectively by the degree of control of his/her own life. But in this context, participation is not a random activity, but a conscious act of citizens. In this context, democracy does not mean the administration of the people or the masses. Because the masses make noise, and while working, citizens consciously make reconciliation. The existence of an idealized and reconciled democracy depends on well-educated citizens who know and guard their rights. Ideal citizens follow the ideal path of education (Demirbolat, 1999: 230).

The introduction of a culture of democracy in Turkey follows a period in the last period of the Ottoman Empire following the developments such as the 1839 the Imperial Edict of Gülhane, 1876 First Constitutional Monarchy and 1908 the Ottoman Basic Law. The full transition to democracy has been literally with the foundation of the State of the Republic of Turkey. In order to reach the level of contemporary civilization, especially in the field of politics after the transition to democracy in other areas have been included in the work. In the name of the settlement of democracy, especially in education, different applications were made (Kaya, 2004: 70). In recent years, both in terms of country policy and the development of relations with the Turkic Republics, students are accepted, and universities are opened.

With the development of technology, communication and communication networks have become a small place in the fields such as communication, culture, economy, education and sports, although the world does not change as a face measurement. The change in globalization is reflected in the field of education. The common market understanding that emerged in every field has also existed in education. The important product of the education market is the circulation of foreign students. According to the OECD report in 2013, the number of international students has doubled between 2000 and 2011 in the world. Today, there are approximately 4.5 million higher education students. A Mongol student in Turkey. The dimensions of this student circulation have reached such a point that this situation has turned into an economic sector for some countries. According to the data of the US Department of Commerce in 2000, the contribution of foreign students at higher education level to the US economy increased to the fifth rank in the service sector (Kıroğlu, 2010: 26). According to the same report published by OECD in 2013, the highest number of international students is from China, India and Korea. Asian students account for 53% of all students studying abroad. It is also stated in the report that countries have increased their interest in making them interesting and demand of the countries and making them more attractive (OECD, 2013).

Turkey is also a country that accepts foreign students. In particular, Turkey accepts students from other Turkic states and relative communities. In addition to the students coming from other Turkic states, Anatolia has always been a place of migration since the history of the continents as it is located on the connection roads of the continents. Especially recently, as a result of developments in the Middle East with the Arab Spring, Turkey has made numerous effects of hosting asylum seekers arriving. There are also many students who want to get away from the turmoil in their own country. The total number of foreign students studying in Turkey with a government scholarship is 15,220. Among the countries with the highest number of students, the number of Syrian students is 1841 and the number of students with Afghan nationality is 1197. These numbers are the number of students at higher education level. Even though the majority of the students are from Middle Eastern countries, the Turkic Republics and neighboring countries, there are students from all around the world. In Turkey, there are students from 151 different countries (MEB, 2017: 232; Parlak and Şahin, 2015: 67, Seydi, 2013:221).

METHODOLOGY

Statement of problem

The traitor coup attempt experienced in Turkey on July 15 had a negative impact on all the people living in Turkey and also affected foreign students studying here. This study was carried out in order to examine the views of foreign students studying in Turkey on this coup attempt in order to examine their views on democracy and the problem sentence of the study is as follows: What are the views of foreign students about democracy? The answer to this question was sought by taking into account the age, gender and departmental variables of the students.

Aim and importance of research

Turkey has experienced periods of instability in terms of democracy. Coup d'état that took place in Turkey, foreign intervention and coup attempts are the leading cause of this instability. Once again, an attempt was made to sustain an
instability through the coup attempt and tragedy carried out on July 15, 2016, but the Turkish people did not relive the past events and intercepted conflicts and the coup attempt was prevented. This study was carried out in order to reveal the perceptions, opinions and thoughts of foreign students at Mustafa Kemal University who witnessed such an environment on democracy. When the literature is examined, many studies on democracy have been put forward. There are studies in Turkey that show the perceptions of democracy in schools, in different age groups or in various regions and regions. In addition, although many studies on foreign students have been conducted, the perceptions of democracy have not been studied. The study is considered important in this respect.

Study group

The study group consists of foreign students studying at Mustafa Kemal University in the spring term of 2017-2018. 89 foreign students of a total of 247 studying at the MKU have been reached. The questionnaire of 11 students was considered incorrect or missing, and the remaining questionnaires completed by 78 students have been evaluated. Of the 78 students included in the study, 44 were female and 34 were male (Table 1).

Data collection and analysis

Before starting the study, 14 foreign students were enrolled in short compositions in order to determine the readiness levels of foreign students about democracy and to measure their literacy levels in Turkish. It was observed that the students mentioned about 15 to 20 different concepts related to democracy. After it was understood that the students had enough knowledge to do research on democracy, the survey preparation process was started. As a first step, a questionnaire consisting of 58 items was formed. The questionnaire is divided into two parts. The first part consists of demographic variables (age, gender, department, etc.) with personal information and the second part consists of questions about measuring the perceptions of foreign students studying at Mustafa Kemal University about democracy. After taking the opinions of four faculty members who have done their PhD in this field, the items of the questionnaire were checked in terms of contradiction by the faculty members in the Turkish Teaching Department and applied to the students group of 12 for the validity and reliability of the questionnaire within the frame of pilot study. As a result of the analyses, the reliability coefficients of the 29 items of the draft questionnaire consisting of 58 items were low and these items were excluded from the survey. After reviewing the remaining items, another pilot study was conducted again and validity and reliability of the questionnaire were calculated and a 29-item questionnaire with a Cronbach Alpha coefficient of 0.88 was finalized. The questionnaire was transferred to SPSS 22 program and the results were tabulated and interpreted. The general evaluation of the scale used in the research is as follows (Sarıgöz et al., 2016; Dönger et al., 2016):

\[ \text{SA} = \frac{\text{EYD} - \text{EDD}}{\text{SS}} = \frac{5 - 1}{5} = 0.8 \]

where SA: Range of Option, EYD: Highest Value, EDD: Lowest Value, SS: Number of Options.

1.00 - 1.80: I strongly disagree
1.81 - 2.60: I do not agree
2.61 - 3.40: I am undecided
3.41 - 4.20: I agree
4.21 - 5.00: I strongly agree

In this study, the descriptive survey model, which is one of the general surveying methods, is utilized. The general surveying model is a method of screening on the literature or a group or sample taken from it, in order to make a judgment about the population in a universe of many elements and data. (Karasar, 2010: 79).

**FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION**

When the results of independent groups t-test analysis according to the gender variable of the foreign students who participated in the study in Table 2 were examined, it

### Table 1. Results of t-test analysis according to the gender variable of foreign students.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Group</th>
<th>N</th>
<th></th>
<th>Ss</th>
<th></th>
<th>t</th>
<th>p</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>99.37</td>
<td>14.321</td>
<td>76</td>
<td>-1.274</td>
<td>0.206</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>104.14</td>
<td>18.735</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

p>0.05

### Table 2. ANOVA test analysis result according to the age variable of foreign students.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Group</th>
<th>N</th>
<th></th>
<th>Ss</th>
<th>Source of Variance</th>
<th>Sum of Squares</th>
<th></th>
<th>Avg. of Squares</th>
<th></th>
<th>F</th>
<th>P (ANOVA)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>18-20</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>103.03</td>
<td>9.61</td>
<td>Between groups</td>
<td>370.96</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>126.65</td>
<td>0.455</td>
<td>0.715</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>21-23</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>100.15</td>
<td>22.84</td>
<td>Total groups</td>
<td>20607.53</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>278.48</td>
<td>0.186</td>
<td>0.663</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>24-26</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>105.25</td>
<td>7.88</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>20987.49</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>27-29</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>107.80</td>
<td>6.72</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>78</td>
<td>61.78</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>p&gt;0.05</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
was seen that there was no statistically significant difference between the mean scores of female and male students (t=−1.274; p>0.05). According to these results, it can be said that there is no statistically significant difference between male and female students’ perceptions of democracy and therefore gender difference does not have any effect on the perception of democracy.

According to the age variable of the foreign students who participated in the study, Table 3 shows that there was no statistically significant difference between the female students and male students according to the age variable [F = 0.455; p > 0.05]. Therefore, it can be said that perceptions of foreign students belonging to different age groups towards democracy are equal or similar.

When Table 4 is examined, there is no statistically significant difference between the students in different departments according to the department type variable of the foreign students who participated in the research [F=0.699; p>0.05]. Therefore, it can be said that the perceptions on democracy of foreign students studying in different departments are similar or closer to each other.

### Table 3. ANOVA test analysis result according to the department type variable of foreign students.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Group</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>( \bar{x} )</th>
<th>Ss</th>
<th>Source of Variance</th>
<th>Sum of Squares</th>
<th>Sd</th>
<th>Avg. Of Squares</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>p (ANOVA)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Medical Fac.</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>101.75</td>
<td>7.50</td>
<td>B/w Groups</td>
<td>2000.40</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>200.04</td>
<td>0.699</td>
<td>0.722</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arts and Sci. Fac.</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>95.27</td>
<td>16.78</td>
<td>Inter Groups</td>
<td>18895.92</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>286.30</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Architecture Fac.</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>101.50</td>
<td>14.06</td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>20896.32</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FEAS</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>103.00</td>
<td>10.67</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Department</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Edu. Fac.</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>101.50</td>
<td>13.66</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agri. Fac.</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>99.80</td>
<td>13.70</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medic. V.S.</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>98.20</td>
<td>8.59</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Med. Ser. V.S.</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>117.80</td>
<td>47.19</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Antakya V.S.</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>102.33</td>
<td>7.94</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>p&gt;0.05</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The aim of the study was to determine whether the gender variable has a significant difference on the democracy perceptions of foreign students attending the university. According to the findings of the study, it is concluded that the gender variable has no effect on the perceptions of democracy of foreign students. However, from the interviews, it can also be concluded that male students are more interested in the subjects of democracy in the countries where foreign students come from. In order to increase the awareness level of both male and female students, it can be suggested to re-examine the education programs for all researchers. Regarding the research conducted by Kaya et al. (2012), it was revealed that there was no significant difference among the opinions of undergraduate students in regards to the democratic attitudes and behaviors of academic staff.

As a result of preliminary preparations and questionnaire application to foreign students, it was observed that there was no statistically significant difference between the perceptions of democracy according to their faculties, gender, age and education. In the survey, many concepts related to democracy were mentioned and it was tried to determine whether or not democracy did express what it meant to students and whether they thought about it positively or negatively. Although we are concerned that students may be affected by the events in the world and in Turkey in the recent years and that they have negative thoughts about democracy, it has been observed that foreign students who have been selected by Turkey do not have negative thoughts. In the study conducted by Aydemir and Aksoy (2010) with the aim of determining the democratic attitudes of students studying at Faculty of Education at İnönü University in relation to some variables, a significant difference was found between the gender and democratic attitudes of the students. Regarding the results of this study, it has been interpreted that it could be due to the effect of women’s more emotional and sensitive nature than men in general. In addition, the effect of gender on having democratic values may be arose from the effect of women’s positive discrimination in social life. In recent years, it has been interpreted as the effect of publishing defending women’s rights and giving positive emphasis on women’s place in social life as well as the fact that the state has made women’s rights an official policy (Kontaş et al., 2016). In the study conducted by Elkatmış and Toptaş (2015), it can be concluded that the gender variable is not significant enough to reflect democratic attitudes. In his research, Kepekçioglu (2015) found out that female students’ perception of justice and democracy are higher than the male students’ perception. Considering this study, it can
**Table 4.** The distribution of foreign students in the 2016-2017 academic year according to faculties.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S/N</th>
<th>Faculties and Vocational Schools</th>
<th>Number of Students</th>
<th>Countries</th>
<th>Number of Students</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Tayfur Ata Sokmen Medical School</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>Turkey</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Faculty of Science and Literature</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>Syria</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Veterinary School</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>USA</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Faculty of Architecture</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>Austria</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Faculty of Economics and Administrative Sciences</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>Azerbaijan</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Faculty of Education</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>Bulgaria</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Physical Therapy and Rehabilitation V.S.</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Germany</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Faculty of Dentistry</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>Iran</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Faculty of Agriculture</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>Iraq</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Hatay Health Vocational School</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>Netherlands</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>High school of Physical Education and Sports</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Jordan</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Hatay Vocational School of Health Services</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>Canada</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Antakya Vocational School</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>Palestine</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Vocational School of Art and Design</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>Turkmenistan</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Kırıkhan Vocational School</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>Afghanistan</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Reyhanlı Vocational School</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>Somalia</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Hassa Vocational School</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Yemen</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>Samandağ Vocational School</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Kirghizstan</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>Yayladağı Vocational School</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Albania</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>Graduate School of Natural and Applied Sciences</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Egypt</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>Institute of Social Sciences</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Uzbekistan</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Russia</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Kazakhstan</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Guinea</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>247</strong></td>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>247</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: MKU Student Affairs Office [http://www.mku.edu.tr/files/b95140c9-56b2-48a3-a13a-9154fa045fc0.pdf](http://www.mku.edu.tr/files/b95140c9-56b2-48a3-a13a-9154fa045fc0.pdf)

be concluded that female students believe that it is important to use many rights in social life and these evaluations of young people have been found to be effective in differentiating the perception of justice. In the study conducted by Karadeniz et al. (2017) on the democratic attitudes of the students studying at a vocational school, there was no significant relationship between the students 'perceptions of the instructors' democratic attitudes and behaviors, and gender and class variables. The fact that lecturers do not discriminate between their students can be interpreted as a satisfactory result in every respect. The literature showed that although many studies about democratic attitudes and the perception of democracy has been conducted, there are very inadequate research on foreign students studying in Turkey in that sense. In order to make the study more comprehensive and valuable, it is possible to suggest that researchers should be made awareness raising about the perception of democracy and the events in the world. Furthermore, it is suggested that students who have positive ideas about democracy should benefit more from Turkey as a result of this study.

The findings of the study showed that there is no difference in the knowledge of the students about democracy according to the faculty variable and between the groups that the study works on. In the study conducted by Sarı and Sadik (2011) on the perception of democracy of prospective teachers studying at Faculty of Education, it was concluded that measures should be taken for democratization of university life from student representative selection processes to leisure time activities and from the way of students' communication with academic staff to students' participation in decision making process at all levels in order to establish a culture where the implicit program of the department, faculty or campus is adopted as a way of life for democracy. Therefore, it is understood that there is no effect of departments on the subject of democracy in higher education, the students in all departments are sensitive about democracy and also they are sensitive to anti-democratic applications. However, it can be evaluated that there are differences in perception due to political socio-cultural differences from the management forms of the countries where the students live. Based on the
results of the research, it can be suggested to conduct new studies in accordance with the management structure and general structure of each country in which the students belong.

CONFLICT OF INTERESTS

The authors have not declared any conflict of interests.

REFERENCES


Patric J (2003). Essential elements of education for democracy: what are they and why should they be at the core of the curriculum in schools? Indiana University, USA October 16:1-12