### academicJournals

Vol. 10(19), pp. 2041-2047, 7 May, 2015 DOI: 10.5897/AJAR2014.9246 Article Number: AC3FD7052814 ISSN 1991-637X Copyright ©2015 Author(s) retain the copyright of this article http://www.academicjournals.org/AJAR

African Journal of Agricultural Research

Full Length Research Paper

# Sensitivity of *Colletotrichum lindemuthianum* from green beans to fungicides and race determination of isolates from State of São Paulo, Brazil

Ronaldo Caravieri de Souza Filho<sup>1</sup>, Tadeu Antônio Fernandes da Silva Júnior<sup>1</sup>\*, José Marcelo Soman<sup>1</sup>, Ricardo Marcelo Gonçalves<sup>1</sup>, Alisson Fernando Chiorato<sup>2</sup>, Margarida Fumiko Ito<sup>2</sup> and Antonio Carlos Maringoni<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Plant Protection Department, School of Agronomic Sciences (FCA)/UNESP, Zip Code 18.610-307 Botucatu, SP, Brazil. <sup>2</sup>Agronomic Institute of Campinas (IAC), Zip Code 13.012-970 Campinas, SP, Brazil.

Received 15 October, 2014; Accepted 15 April, 2015

This study determined the physiological races of *Colletotrichum lindemuthianum* isolates, causal agent of anthracnose, collected in green bean producing regions, and assessed the *in vitro* and *in vivo* sensitivity of isolates to fungicides. Physiological races of isolates were determined by inoculation of bean differential cultivars under controlled conditions. *In vitro* sensitivity of colony growth and conidial germination were evaluated for carbendazim, chlorothalonil, copper oxide, mancozeb, pyraclostrobin, thiophanate-methyl and for the mixtures of mancozeb + copper oxychloride, metiram + pyraclostrobin and thiophanate-methyl + chlorothalonil at concentrations of 1, 10, 100 and 1000  $\mu$ g/mL on PDA medium. *In vivo* sensitivity was determined in detached primary leaves of green beans previously treated with the same fungicides (commercial doses) recommended for the crop, and then inoculated with conidial suspensions of *C. lindemuthianum. C. lindemuthianum* isolates were identified as belonging to races 65 and 81. Treatments with pyraclostrobin and the mixture metiram + pyraclostrobin were the most effective in inhibiting the colony growth and conidial germination *in vitro*, a result also observed for the *in vivo* experiments, where these chemicals were the most effective in controlling the green bean anthracnose.

Key words: Chemical control, *Phaseolus vulgaris*, anthracnose, physiological race, snap bean.

#### INTRODUCTION

Anthracnose, caused by *Colletrotrichum lindemuthianum*, is one of the major diseases of green bean, occurring in almost all producing countries, including Brazil. The disease affects leaves and pods of the plants, reducing

productivity and the product quality for commercialization, being the cultivation of susceptible cultivars in regions with mild temperatures and high humidity one of the main factors for this wide distribution (Dalla Pria et al., 2003).

\*Corresponding author. E-mail: tadeusilvajr@gmail.com. Tel: +55(14) 3880-7167. Author(s) agree that this article remain permanently open access under the terms of the <u>Creative Commons Attribution</u> <u>License 4.0 International License</u> Use of resistant cultivars and chemical control are essential for the efficient control of anthracnose (Ghini and Kimati, 2000). The knowledge of the physiological races of *C. lindemuthianum* that occurs on green beans and the sensitivity of isolates to fungicides are fundamental for the adoption of effective control measures, whether by the use of resistant cultivars to prevalent races of the pathogen in a region or for the chemical control in susceptible cultivars with appropriate fungicides.

Early studies in Brazil about the races of C. lindemuthianum were made during the 60's and 70's, but due to high pathogenic variability of the pathogen and the small number of differential cultivars used, the results were not reliable, as well as the use of different systems for naming the races caused difficulties to measure the variability in the fungus pathogenicity (Paradela Filho et al., 1991; Rodriguez-Guerra et al., 2003). After the work of Pastor-Corrales (1991), using 12 differential bean cultivars to study the pathogenic variability of C. lindemuthianum isolates, there was the standardization and creation of a binary scale for symptoms assessment, according to anthracnose severity, which provided the description of new races and breeding of new sources of Several studies have identified resistance. the occurrence of races of C. lindemuthianum in different regions of Brazil (Somavilla and Prestes, 1999; Thomazella et al., 2002; Bonett et al., 2008), but without specifying the origin of the isolates according to host (common beans or green beans).

Chemical control of anthracnose with fungicides have shown satisfactory results, resulting in high grain yield in common bean (Conner et al., 2004; Garcia et al., 2007; Gillard et al., 2012). In Brazil, there are more than 100 chemicals registered for the control of anthracnose in common bean, however, for green beans, only seven fungicides, from four different active ingredients (copper oxide, mancozeb, mancozeb + copper oxycloride and thiophanate-methil) are registered for use (Agrofit, 2015). Some chemicals used to control the anthracnose of common beans cannot be used on green bean, due to problems of residues. C. lindemuthianum isolates from common beans have shown a variation in the sensitivity of mycelial growth for benzimidazole fungicides (benomyl, carbendazim and thiophanate-methyl) (Maringoni and Barros, 2002; Sartorato, 2007; Sartori and Maringoni, 2007), but there is no information about the sensitivity of isolates from green beans.

The knowledge of physiological races and the sensitivity of *C. lindemuthianum* isolates to fungicides are essential for the efficient management of the anthracnose of green bean. On this study, the physiological races of 12 monosporic isolates of *C. lindemuthianum* from green bean producing regions of State of São Paulo, Brazil, were identified, as well the *in vitro* and *in vivo* sensitivity of isolates to fungicides recommended for the crop were determined.

#### MATERIALS AND METHODS

#### Cultures and growth conditions

Pods of green beans naturally infected by C. lindemuthianum were collected from producing regions of State of São Paulo, Brazil. Small portions of conidia present in the lesions were transferred to potato dextrose agar medium (PDA) (Acumedia, Baltimore, USA), followed by incubation in the dark (25°C/10 days). Isolates 3149, 3151, 3152, 3153 and 3158 (collected in Botucatu), 3148 (Campinas), 3154 (Itatiba), 3147 (Jaú), 3150 (Morungaba), 3156 (São Manuel), 3155 (São Paulo) and 3157 (Vinhedo) were purified and monosporic cultures obtained and preserved according to Castellani's modified method (Dhingra and Sinclair, 1995). isolates had typical cultural and morphological characteristics of C. lindemuthianum according to Schwartz (1991). For all experiments, inoculum was produced on PDA in the dark (25°C/10 days). For the in vitro sensitivity of conidial germination experiment, inoculum was produced on oatmeal agar medium (60 g oat meal, 12 g agar and 1.000 mL distilled water) at same conditions, but for 15 days.

#### In vitro sensitivity of C. lindemuthianum isolates to fungicides

Colony growth sensitivity of all isolates were assessed to commercial fungicides carbendazim, chlorothalonil, copper oxide, mancozeb, pyraclostrobin, tiophanate-methyl and to the mixtures mancozeb + copper oxychloride (57% + 43%), metiram + pyraclostrobin (92% + 8%) and chlorothalonil + thiophanate-methyl (71% + 29%) at 1, 10, 100 and 1000 µg/mL in 90 × 16 mm Petri dishes with PDA medium. PDA medium without fungicides was used as control. Mycelial discs (7 mm) were transferred to the Petri dishes with the treatments and plates were incubated in the dark (25°C/10 days). The average diameter of the colonies (mm) was assessed and the percentage of inhibition calculated based in the control treatment growth. Experimental design was completely randomized with four replications for each fungicide concentration and for each isolate. The effective dose causing 50% inhibition of mycelial growth (ED<sub>50</sub>) was determined according to Sartori and Maringoni (2007), and numerical index for each range of ED<sub>50</sub> were assigned: index 1 (ED<sub>50</sub> < 1  $\mu$ g/mL), index 2 (ED<sub>50</sub> from 1 to 10  $\mu$ g/mL), index 3 (ED<sub>50</sub> from 10 to 100  $\mu$ g/mL), index 4 (ED<sub>50</sub> from 100 to 1000  $\mu$ g/mL) and index 5 (ED<sub>50</sub> > 1000  $\mu$ g/mL).

Conidial germination sensitivity was evaluated for isolates 3147, 3150, 3155 and 3158 that showed sensitivity in the colony growth experiment to mancozeb and to the chlorothalonil + tiophanatemethyl mixture. PDA preparation, fungicides and concentrations were the same used for the assessment of colony growth sensitivity. Suspensions were standardized to 5×10<sup>5</sup> conidia/mL (Maringoni and Barros, 2002) and 100 µL of each suspension were distributed on the surface of the media with fungicides followed by incubation in the dark (25°C/24 h). Mycelial discs (1.5 cm) were transferred to microscope slides and stained with lactophenol cotton blue to paralyze the fungal growth. For each isolate and fungicide concentration the germination of 100 conidia were assessed per disc. Experimental design was completely randomized with four replications and each plot represented by a mycelial disc. With the results the effective dose causing 50% inhibition of conidial germination (ED<sub>50</sub>) was determinated according to the numerical index previously described.

#### In vivo sensitivity of C. lindemuthianum isolates to fungicides

Green beans plants cv. Itatiba II were cultivated in 2 L pots with substrate (mixture of soil, weathered cattle manure and sand (1:1:1), plus 0.6 kg of ammonium sulfate, 17 kg of superphosphate, 0.6 kg of potassium chloride and 0.8 kg of lime for every  $m^3$  of the

Fungicides	Isolate											
	3147	3148	3149	3150	3151	3152	3153	3154	3155	3156	3157	3158
Carbendazim	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	4	5	5
Chlorothalonil	4	5	4	3	4	4	3	3	3	3	4	4
Chlorothalonil + thiopmethyl	4	5	4	4	4	4	3	4	4	4	5	4
Copper oxide	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5
Mancozeb	5	5	5	5	5	5	4	5	4	5	5	5
Mancozeb + copper oxychloride	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5
Metiram + pyraclostrobin	3	4	4	3	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4
Pyraclostrobin	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
Thiophanate-methyl	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5

**Table 1.** Effective dose causing 50% inhibition of mycelial growth (ED<sub>50</sub>) for *Colletotrichum lindemuthianum* isolates from green beans to fungicides.

Numerical index from 1 to 5 correspond to different ranges of  $ED_{50}$ : index 1 -  $ED_{50}$  < 1 µg/mL; index 2 -  $ED_{50}$  from 1 to 10 µg/mL; index 3 -  $ED_{50}$  from 10 to 100 µg/mL and index 5 -  $ED_{50}$  > 1000 µg/mL.

mixture) under greenhouse conditions (20-28°C/70-90% RU) till the phenological growth stage V2. The primary leaves were collected, immersed in a solution of 10% Tween 80 (10 s), and then immersed, separately, in suspensions of commercial fungicides carbendazim (1 mL/L), chlorothalonil (1.5 g/L), copper oxide (1.72 g/L), mancozeb (3.20 g/L), mancozeb + copper oxychloride (0.88 + 0.66 g/L), metiram + pyraclostrobin (1,65 + 0.15 g/L), pyraclostrobin (0.15 mL/L), thiophanate-methyl (1.40 g/L) and chlorothalonil + thiophanate-methyl (1.75 + 0.70 g/L) for 5 s. The leaves were transferred in Petri dishes (150 × 15 mm) containing two paper filters wetted with distilled water and sprayed with conidial suspensions (10<sup>6</sup> conidia/mL) of each isolate, after 24 h of the fungicide treatment (Gulart, 2009). Petri dishes containing two primary leaves each were kept in the dark for 24 h and incubated in BOD (20°C/7 days) under a 12 h photoperiod (2400 Lux). Control treatment consisted of leaves immersed in water and inoculated with conidial suspensions. Absolute control consisted of leaves immersed in water without inoculation. Disease severity on leaves was determined seven days after inoculation according to the diagrammatic scale proposed by Dalla Pria et al. (2003). Experimental design was completely randomized, with three replicates for each isolate and fungicide. Data were subjected to variance analysis and means were compared by Scott-Knott's test at 5% probability.

## Determination of physiological races of *C. lindemuthianum* isolates

Seedlings of bean differential cultivars AB 136, Cornell 49-242, G 2333, Kaboon, Mexico 222, Michelite, Michigan Dark Red Kidney, Perry Marrow, Pi 207262, TO, TU and Widusa were obtained under greenhouse conditions in plastic trays of 84 cells containing sterile vermiculite. The aerial part of five seedlings of each cultivar were inoculated by spraying with a suspension (10<sup>6</sup> conidia/mL) of each isolate, 10 days after emergence, according to Pastor-Corrales (1991) and Carbonell et al. (1999). One plant of Pérola cultivar, susceptible to most races of *C. lindemuthianum*, was used as a negative control for each differential series. Seedlings were kept in a climatic room (23°C/90% RU) under a 12 h photoperiod (2400 Lux).

The disease severity was evaluated 10 days after inoculation based on disease scale from 1 to 9, with grades from 1 to 3 representing resistant genotypes, and grades above 3, susceptible genotypes (Pastor-Corrales, 1991; Gonçalves-Vidgal et al., 2007).

#### RESULTS

# *In vitro* sensitivity of *C. lindemuthianum* isolates to fungicides

Results of colony growth and conidial germination in vitro

sensitivity of C. lindemuthianum isolates to fungicides are described in Tables 1 and 2, respectively. All isolates showed low sensitivity on colony growth and conidial germination (ED<sub>50</sub> > 1000  $\mu$ g/mL) to thiophanate-methyl. chlorothalonil and thiophanate-methyl For chlorothalonil, 50% and 75% of isolates had ED<sub>50</sub> between 100 and 1000 µg/mL for colony growth, respectively. For conidial germination, 100% of the isolates showed ED<sub>50</sub> between 10 and 100 µg/mL to chlorothalonil + thiophanate-methyl, while chlorothalonil was the most effective fungicide for inhibition of conidial germination of isolates (100% of isolates with  $ED_{50} < 1$ µg/mL). It was also observed a low sensitivity to carbendazim (ED<sub>50</sub> > 1000  $\mu$ g/mL) to 100% (conidial germination) and 91.7% (colony growth) of the isolates.

Regarding to mancozeb and mancozeb + copper oxychloride, 83.4% and 100% of isolates had an ED<sub>50</sub> higher than 1000 µg/mL for colony growth, respectively, while 100% of the isolates showed ED<sub>50</sub> between 10 and 100 µg/mL for conidial germination for these chemicals. All isolates evaluated were sensitive to pyraclostrobin and metiram + pyraclostrobin (ED<sub>50</sub> from 1 to 10 µg/mL) for conidial germination. For colony growth, the sensitivity was reduced in the mixture metiram + pyraclostrobin (83.4% of isolates with ED<sub>50</sub> from 100 to 1000 µg/mL) in relation to pyraclostrobin (100% of isolates with ED<sub>50</sub> from 1 to 10 µg/mL). The isolates did not show sensitivity to copper oxide with an ED<sub>50</sub> higher than 1000 µg/mL for colony growth and conidial germination.

Funcicidae	Isolate								
Fungicides	3147	3150	3155	3158					
Carbendazim	5	5	5	5					
Chlorothalonil	1	1	1	1					
Chlorothalonil + thiopmethyl	3	3	3	3					
Copper oxide	5	5	5	5					
Mancozeb	3	3	3	3					
Mancozeb + copper oxychloride	3	3	3	3					
Metiram + pyraclostrobin	2	2	2	2					
Pyraclostrobin	2	2	2	2					
Thiophanate-methyl	5	5	5	5					

**Table 2.** Effective dose causing 50% inhibition of conidial germination ( $ED_{50}$ ) for *C. lindemuthianum* isolates from green beans to fungicides.

Numerical index from 1 to 5 correspond to different ranges of  $ED_{50}$ : index 1 -  $ED_{50} < 1 \ \mu g/mL$ ; index 2 -  $ED_{50}$  from 1 to 10  $\mu g/mL$ ; index 3 -  $ED_{50}$  from 10 to 100  $\mu g/mL$ ; index 4 -  $ED_{50}$  from 100 to 1000  $\mu g/mL$  and index 5 -  $ED_{50} > 1000 \ \mu g/mL$ .

**Table 3.** Anthracnose severity in detached primary leaves of green bean cv. Itatiba II treated with fungicides and inoculated with *C. lindemuthianum* isolates.

Foundation	Isolate									
Fungicide	3147	3150	3155	3158						
Control (water)	71.7 <sup>a</sup> *	100.0 <sup>a</sup> **	100.0 <sup>a</sup>	100.0 <sup>a</sup>						
Carbendazim	66.7 <sup>a</sup>	41.7 <sup>b</sup>	51.7 <sup>b</sup>	46.7 <sup>c</sup>						
Chlorothalonil	4.0 <sup>c</sup>	1.7 <sup>c</sup>	1.7 <sup>e</sup>	1.7 <sup>e</sup>						
Chlorothalonil + thiopmethyl	8.7 <sup>c</sup>	6.0 <sup>c</sup>	9.3 <sup>d</sup>	8.0 <sup>d</sup>						
Copper oxide	31.7 <sup>b</sup>	40.0 <sup>b</sup>	35.0 <sup>c</sup>	40.0 <sup>c</sup>						
Mancozeb	1.7 <sup>c</sup>	2.7 <sup>c</sup>	1.7 e	3.0 <sup>e</sup>						
Mancozeb + copper oxychloride	4.0 <sup>c</sup>	2.7 <sup>c</sup>	2.0 e	5.0 <sup>d</sup>						
Metiram + pyraclostrobin	O <sup>f</sup>	O <sup>f</sup>	O <sup>f</sup>	0 <sup>f</sup>						
Pyraclostrobin	O <sup>f</sup>	0 <sup>f</sup>	O <sup>f</sup>	O <sup>f</sup>						
Thiophanate-methyl	41.7 <sup>b</sup>	43.3 <sup>b</sup>	43.3 <sup>b</sup>	55.0 <sup>b</sup>						
V.C.%	17.6	17.0	10.7	9.6						

<sup>\*</sup>Data transformed in  $arcsen\sqrt{x}/100$ . \*\*Means followed by same letter are not significantly different at P<0.05 probability using Scott-Knott's test.

## *In vivo* sensitivity of *C. lindemuthianum* isolates to fungicides

Results of *in vivo* sensitivity of *C. lindemuthianum* isolates to fungicides are described in Table 3, and were very similar to those obtained from the *in vitro* experiments. Pyraclostrobin and metiram + pyraclostrobin were the most effective fungicides for the control of anthracnose on green beans leaves, independent of the *C. lindemuthianum* isolate evaluated, showing complete absence of symptoms in the inoculated leaves.

The treatments with chlorothalonil, mancozeb and the mixtures mancozeb+ copper oxychloride and chlorothalonil + thiophanate-methyl were also effective in the reduction of anthracnose severity on green beans leaves. However, the fungicides from the group of benzimidazole (carbendazim and thiophanate-methyl)

and copper oxide did not controlled the disease on the leaves, similar results to those obtained from *in vitro* studies.

## Determination of physiological races of *C*. *lindemuthianum* isolates

Isolates 3149, 3151, 3152, 3158, 3147, 3148, 3150 and 3157 of *C. lindemuthianum* were identified as race 65, while isolates 3153, 3154, 3155 and 3135 were identified as race 81 (Table 4).

#### DISCUSSION

The variation in colony growth sensitivity of *C. lindemuthianum* isolates from common bean to

Differential cultiver	Binary	Isolate											
Dimerential cultivar	value	3147	3148	3149	3150	3151	3152	3153	3154	3155	3156	3157	3158
Michelite	1	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S
Michigan Dark Red Kidney	2	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R
Perry Marrow	4	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R
Cornell 49-242	8	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R
Widusa	16	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R
Kaboon	32	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R
México 222	64	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S	S
Pi 207262	128	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R
ТО	256	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R
TU	512	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R
AB 136	1024	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R
G 2333	2048	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R	R
Race		65	65	65	65	65	65	81	81	81	81	65	65

Table 4. Reaction of bean differential cultivars inoculated with C. lindemuthianum isolates from green beans from various locations of São Paulo State.

benzemidazole fungicides (benomyl, carbendazim and thiophanate-methyl) has been reported in several studies in Brazil with  $ED_{50}$  ranging from 1 to 1000 µg/mL (Maringoni and Barros, 2002; Sartorato, 2007; Sartori and Maringoni, 2007). On this study we detected an low sensitivity of colony growth of *C. lindemuthianum* isolates from green beans to benzimidazoles fungicides (carbendazim and thiophanate-methyl) (Table 1). The low sensitivity of conidial germination from *C. lindemuthianum* isolates evaluated on this study to carbendazim and thiophanate-methyl agrees with Maringoni and Barros (2002), where isolates from common beans were also resistant to these fungicides.

*C. lindemuthianum* isolates from common beans also exhibit variation in colony growth sensitivity to chlorothalonil with  $ED_{50}$  ranging from 10 to 800 µg/mL (Rava et al., 1998; Maringoni and Barros, 2002), results similar to the obtained in this study

for green beans isolates. Most isolates here evaluated showed an  $ED_{50}$  from 100 to 1000 µg/mL for colony growth to chlorothalonil + thiophanate-methyl, results discrepant to those obtained by Balardin and Rodrigues (1995) and Sartori and Maringoni (2007), who reported inhibition of C. lindemuthianum isolates from common beans to concentrations ranging from 10 to 100 µg/mL. Regarding conidial germination. chlorothalonil was the most effective fungicide  $(ED_{50} < 1 \mu g/mL)$ , while thiophanate-methyl did not show a satisfactory result (ED<sub>50</sub> > 1000 µg/mL). These results show that the best performance of the mixture chlorothalonil + thiophanate methyl (ED<sub>50</sub> from 10 to 100 µg/mL) in comparison with thiophanate-methyl alone is due to the chlorothalonil activity, showing the absence of a synergistic action between these funaicides.

C. lindemuthianum isolates evaluated in this

study showed an  $ED_{50}$  for mancozeb and the mixture mancozeb + copper oxychloride higher to those described by Rava et al. (1998) for isolates from common beans, indicating a lower sensitivity of these isolates to these chemicals. No information about the sensitivity of *C. lindemuthianum* isolates to copper oxide was found, although Tsai et al. (2006) evaluated isolates of *C. gloesporioides* and *C. musae* from fruit species and found and  $ED_{50}$  ranging from 10 to 100 µg/mL for cupric fungicides, values lower to those found on this study.

 $ED_{50}$  values for the colony growth to pyraclostrobin found on this study were lower to those reported by Sartorato (2007) for *C. lindemuthianum* isolates from common beans ( $ED_{50}$  of 187.5 µg/mL) and close to the results obtained by Sartori and Maringoni (2007) to trifloxystrobin, a strobilurin from the same group of pyraclostrobin. However, colony growth sensitivity of C. lindemuthianum isolates from green beans was reduced for the mixture metiram + pyraclostrobin, which most of the isolates had and ED<sub>50</sub> ranging from 100 to 1000 µg/mL, concentration higher than that reported by Tsai et al. (2006) for C. gloesporioides and C. musae (ED<sub>50</sub> from 10 to 100 µg/mL). There is no information about conidial germination sensitivity from С. lindemuthianum isolates to pyraclostrobin and metiram + pyraclostrobin, however, there is information about other such as Cylindrocladium candelabrum on funai. eucalyptus (Ferreira et al., 2006) and Cercospora sojina on soybean (Zhang et al., 2012), demonstrating the sensitivity of conidial germination of these fungi to strobilurins.

Pyraclostrobin was also the most effective fungicide for the control of anthracnose on green bean leaves, a result that agrees with Conner et al. (2004) and Gillard et al. (2012) for white and common beans, respectively. The high sensitivity of isolates here evaluated to metiram + pyraclostrobin may have occurred due probably to the sensitivity showed by them to the pyraclostrobin. There are no reports of *C. lindemuthianum* sensibility to metiram and copper oxide.

The disease severity reduction found on this study for the mixture chlorothalonil + thiophanate-methyl, compared to thiophanate-methyl alone, demonstrates the sensitivity of *C. lindemuthianum* isolates to chlorothalonil and the low sensitivity to benzimidazole fungicides, results also observed by Garcia et al. (2007) in common beans.

According to Bashir et al. (1985), benomyl and chlorothalonil were effective for the control of anthracnose on mung bean; results similar to those obtained in this study to chlorothalonil, but differed for thiophanate-methyl, fungicide with mode of action similar to benomyl. Castro et al. (1991) also reported the efficiency of chlorothalonil for the control of anthracnose in common beans.

The efficiency of mancozeb and mancozeb + copper oxychloride observed on this study in reducing the severity of anthracnose on green bean leaves also agrees with Castro et al. (1991), who reported a disease severity reduction in common beans treated with these chemicals. The authors also demonstrated the effectiveness of carbendazim in controlling the anthracnose in common beans, result not observed on this study with green bean isolates.

Studies with *C. lindemuthianum* isolates from common beans also identified the prevalence of races 65 and 81 in Brazil (Somavilla and Prestes, 1999; Carbonell et al., 1999; Thomazella et al., 2002). Until now there was no information about the races of *C. lindemuthianum* that occur on green beans demonstrating that genotypes with resistance to races 65 and 81 of *C. lindemuthianum* should be used in genetic breeding programs of green beans, aiming the incorporation of resistance genes to anthracnose in susceptible cultivars.

#### **Conflict of Interest**

The authors have not declared any conflict of interest.

#### ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The authors thank the Coordination of Improvement of Higher Education Personnel (CAPES, Brazil) for the granting of the scholarship to the first author.

#### REFERENCES

- AGROFIT. Agrofit: System of phytosanitary pesticides. Available at: http://extranet.agricultura.gov.br/agrofit\_cons/principal\_agrofit\_cons. Accessed on March, 2015.
- Balardin RS, Rodrigues JCV (1995). *In vitro* sensitivity of *Colletotrichum lindemuthianum* races to systemic and protectant fungicides. Fitopatol. Bras. 20:494-497.
- Bashir M, Alam SS, Quereshi SH, Malik BA (1985). Control of mung bean anthracnose by foliar fungicides. Pakist. J. Agric. Res. 6(3):173-175.
- Bonett LP, Schewe I, Silva LI (2008). Variability of *Colletotrichum lindemuthianum* in common bean in Western Paraná. Sci. Agraria 9(2):207-210.
- Carbonell SAM, Ito MF, Pompeu AS, Francisco FG, Ravagnani S, Almeida ALL (1999). Physiologic races of *Colletotrichum lindemuthianum* and the reaction of cultivars and inbred lines of common bean in the state of São Paulo. Fitopatol. Bras. 24(1):60-65.
- Castro JD, Ito MF, Dudienas C, Bulisani E, Almeida L (1991). Fungicides action on two bean cultivars in Capão Bonito, São Paulo State, Brazil. Bragantia 50(2):309-321. http://dx.doi.org/10.1590/S0006-87051991000200010
- Conner RL, McAndrew DW, Kiehn FA, Chapman SR, Froese NT (2004). Effect of foliar fungicide application timing on the control of bean anthracnose in the navy bean 'Navigator'. Can. J. Plant Pathol. 26(3):299-303. http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/07060660409507147
- Dalla Pria M, Amorim L, Bergamin Filho A (2003). Quantification of monocyclic components of the common bean anthracnose. Fitopatol. Bras. 28(4): 401-407. http://dx.doi.org/10.1590/S0100-41582003000400009
- Dhingra OD, Sinclair JB (1995). Basic Plant Pathology Methods. 2nd Ed. Lewis Publishers, Boca Raton, Florida.
- Ferreira EM, Alfenas AC, Maffia LA, Mafia RG (2006). Eficiência de fungicidas sistêmicos para o controle de *Cylindrocladium candelabrum* em eucalipto. Fitopatol. Bras. 31:468-475.
- Garcia A, Souza PED, Pozza EA, Santos FDS (2007). Influence of the environmental variables in the progress of anthracnose of bean and efficiency of thiophanate methyl + chlorothalonil in the control of the disease. Ciência e Agrotecnologia 31(6):1709-1715. http://dx.doi.org/10.1590/S1413-70542007000600016
- Ghini R, Kimati H (2000). Fungal resistance to fungicides. 1st Ed. Embrapa Meio Ambiente, Jaguariuna, São Paulo.
- Gillard CL, Ranatunga NK, Conner RL (2012). The effect of foliar fungicide application timing on the control of common bean anthracnose. Can. J. Plant Sci. 92(1):109-118. http://dx.doi.org/10.4141/cjps2010-018
- Goncalves- Vidgal MC, Bonett LP, Vidigal Filho OS, Gonela A, Ribeiro AS (2007). Genetic control on the performance of common bean differential cultivars to *Colletotrichum lindemuthianum* races. Braz. Arch. Biol. Technol. 50(4):579-586. http://dx.doi.org/10.1590/S1516-89132007000400003
- Gulart CA (2009). Sensibility in vitro and in vivo *Colletotrichum lindemuthianum* (Sacc & Mag.) Briosi & Cav., the systemic fungicides. M.S. (Agri.). Dissertation University of Santa Maria. Santa Maria, RS, Brazil.
- Maringoni AC, Barros EM (2002). Occurrence of isolates of *Colletotrichum lindemuthianum* resistant to benzimidazole fungicides.

Summa Phytopathol. 28(2):197-200.

- Paradela Filho O, Ito MF, Pompeu AS (1991). Physiological races of Collectotrichum lindemuthianum in São Paulo State, Brazil. Summa Phytopathol. 17(3/4):181-187.
- Pastor-Corrales MA (1991). Estandarización de variedades diferenciales y de designación de razas de Colletotrichum lindemuthianum. Phytopathology 81:694.
- Rava CA, Sartorato A, Botelho AS (1998). *In vitro* and *in vivo* efficiency of fungicides for the control of *Colletotrichum lindemuthianum*. Summa Phytopathol. 24(1):45-48.
- Rodriguez -Guerra R, Ramírez-Rueda MT, La Vega D, Martínez O, Simpson J (2003). Variation in genotype, pathotype and anastomosis
- groups of *Colletotrichum lindemuthianum* isolates from Mexico. Plant Pathol. 52(2):228-235. http://dx.doi.org/10.1046/j.1365-3059.2003.00808.x
- Sartorato A (2007). In vitro sensitivity of *Colletotrichum lindemuthianum* isolates to fungicides Pesq. Agropec. Trop. 36(3):211-213.
- Sartori JE, Maringoni AC (2007) Effect of fungicides on colony growth of Colletotrichum lindemuthianum (Sacc. & Magn.) Scrib. J. Plant Protect. Res. 48(2):201-212. http://dx.doi.org/10.2478/v10045-008-0024-7
- Schwartz, HF (1991). Anthracnose. In: Hall, E. Compendium of bean diseases. St Paul, APS Press, pp. 16-17.
- Somavilla LL, Prestes AM (1999). Pathotypes identification of *Colletotrichum lindemuthianum* in some regions of Rio Grande do Sul, Brazil. Fitopatol. Bras. 24(5):416-421.

- Thomazella C, Gonçalves- Vidigal MC, Vida JB, Filho PSV, Rimoldi F (2002). Identification of *Colletotrichum lindemuthianum* races in Phaseolus vulgaris L. Annu. Rept. Bean Improv. Coop. 43:82-83.
- Tsai JN, Ann PJ, Hu CY, Cheng SF (2006). Evaluation of fungicides for suppression of mycelial growth and conidial germination of Colletotrichum species isolated from mango, pomelo and banana fruit. Plant Pathol. Bull. 15 (1):39-54.
- Zhang GR, Newman MA, Bradley CA (2012). First report of the soybean frog eye leaf spot fungus (*Cercospora sojina*) resistant to quinone outside inhibitor fungicides in North America. Plant Dis. 96(5):767.