

*Full Length Research Paper*

## Analysis on inclusion of social studies economy concepts in coursebooks

Mustafa SEKER<sup>1\*</sup> and Ahmet Emin OSMANOGLU<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Yildiz Technical University, Istanbul, Turkey.

<sup>2</sup>Bingol University, Bingol, Turkey.

Received 31 May, 2015; Accepted 29 June, 2015

Having an efficient and satisfactory economy education may enable an individual to actively participate in decision making process about economy-related issues. This is very important for democratic societies. This research aims to search methods and levels of teaching "economy" concepts prepared for Turkey 2005 Social Studies Program in 6th and 7th grades. In this study, 6th and 7th grade social studies coursebooks taught at schools within 2013-2014 academic year were investigated. Document review method was used in this research within the scope of qualitative research method. In this research, primary school 6th and 7th grade social studies coursebooks were used. Content analysis method was preferred. Economy concepts used in this study were formed according to the research question; clarified via literature review and pre-reading on books and finalized following expert opinion. Approximately the same number of concepts takes place in all social studies coursebooks of 6th and 7th grades. It was seen that the repetition frequency of concepts in IMYAY Publishing is more than MoNE (Ministry of National Education) Publishing. Approximately the same number of concepts takes place in 7th grade coursebooks. As for the inclusion "economy" concepts, we can say that repetition is about two times more in coursebooks of MoNE publishing than Anittepe Publishing. Analyzing 6th and 7th grade social studies coursebooks, it was found that concepts on 6th grade level are more advanced in terms of the repetition frequency of concepts. According to the results of the research, results among countries considered to be in economically developing countries such as Croatia, Taiwan and Turkey are significant. Studies prove the presence of a positive correlation between economy education and development. It is believed that this study will bring a remarkable contribution to the literature.

**Key words:** Social studies, program, economy, concept.

### INTRODUCTION

Education is a process which ensures the continuity of social system. In this process, information, skills, attitudes and values generated by society factors are acquired by

individual and that individual's and society's development is ensured. One of the fundamental disciplines being in relationship with multi-dimensional development is

\*Corresponding author. E-mail: [mseker@yildiz.edu.tr](mailto:mseker@yildiz.edu.tr). Tel: +90 (505) 2597427.

Authors agree that this article remain permanently open access under the terms of the [Creative Commons Attribution License 4.0 International License](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/)

economy. Economy-related problems are among the issues which put most pressure on people and which societies always encounter. These problems are the main reasons of the conflicts that threaten world peace between continents, nations, people, states, various institutions and organizations. The leadership of nations in political and ideological struggle mostly depends on economic power (Baker, 1950). The biggest advantage of developed countries is to have well-educated, qualified labor force that can keep up with rapid changes in production process and high knowledge generation capacity. Improvements in education increase both efficiency of labor force and knowledge generation capacity and thus positively affect economic growth. Performance of a country within development process is closely related to the efficiency of education system (Caliskan et al., 2013). Studies conducted at the beginning of 1960s via growth calculation methods revealed that the increase in economic growth mostly depends on the improvement in education level of labor force and studies conducted on various countries show that education has a significant contribution to economic growth (Cakmak, 2008). Education contributes to economic production process in terms of re-generation of knowledge, use and dissemination of new knowledge.

The activity of economy evolves out of a universal unbalance. This unbalance is derived from the fact that human needs are unlimited while the resources to fulfill these needs are limited. Human beings must order the world in order to reduce this unbalance between needs and resources (goods and services). At this point, this ordering activity consisting of production, distribution and consumption is called as economic activity. To observe, analyze, interpret and consciously steer this activity is the subject of the science of economics. Educational institutions are the production places where knowledge is generated and submitted to the demanding students. Being this close to each other in terms of fundamental concepts, education and economy is always in a relationship with each other (Dura, 1996). Knowledge on economy and the ability to apply this knowledge are required for a responsible and active citizenship. Citizens, producers, consumers, investors and people who can vote must understand and use the fundamental economy concepts in order to serve satisfactorily. A country needs people who are equipped with comprehension and using skills on economy in order to be able to have a word on world economy and protect her entity. A definition of effective citizen is to have knowledge and skill on political, social and economic issues; to apply them and realize them into life (Seiter, 1989, cited by Akhan, 2010). Economy is directly related to daily lives of people. Economy education guides students to develop responsible behaviors towards production and consumption of resources. It improves children's skill to assess alternatives in daily economy lives. It teaches how to earn, use and save money. It enables them to know

economic systems, economic models of countries. It makes students learn to what extent economic thoughts are important (Evans and Bruckener, 1990, cited by Ozturk, 2009; Turan, 2008).

Today, global changes that profoundly affect economy life and social institutions occur. The responsibility to bring up generations having skills to cope with this change smartly is undertaken by schools. The first studies conducted in America about the necessity of involving economy education in pre-university education stage were started by some academic members of Education Faculty of New York University in 1947. The question sought to be answered was bringing up young people as competent economic citizens. In the studies, it was found that schools are weak in terms of skills and tools required to understand American economic institutions, curriculum is incompetent to give place to economy institutions, problems and tools; what is more to the point, primary and secondary school students do not have sufficient education in economy. In order to solve these problems, it was recommended that program experts should meet the most competent economy experts for a few weeks and should develop a plan for teacher education in national programme and citizen competencies. The first discussion on planning was made by program experts, economists from research organizations, participants from official institutions and labor and employee organizations; a plan and program were developed. In 1948, Economy Training Workshop was organized by New York University. In this workshop, the subjects which were discussed are as follows; factors which lead to production, distribution, stability and instability, full employment, unemployment, high and low productivity, national income analysis, a commonly used technique in research, an assessment tool being used in only colleges, crucial and emergent socio-economic problems of the period, things that should be known by each citizen about economy system, required materials in classrooms, which visual aids can be used to revive the curriculum, how social resources can be useful, suitable goals for the perspective of economy at secondary school level, how a democratic policy should be. One of the outcomes of the conference has been the establishment of the Joint Council of Economic Education. The Council adopted the principles of not being interested in special interests of any group, having no relationship with propaganda activities, having no effect on code activities, imposing no economic program (Baker, 1950). The Council started planning for analysis and evaluation of economy practices in Social Studies coursebook texts used in primary and secondary schools in 1971. In the analyses, the researched subjects are as follows; which concepts, generalization and principles take place in coursebooks, how these are taught in analytic terms, how economic concepts, generalizations and principles are defined, to what extent economy content is comprehensible and interesting. At the end of the research,

recommendations were made about which concepts should be given in coursebooks at primary and secondary school levels and how these concepts should be taught (Davison et al., 1973). As a result of this kind of studies, expectations started to bring up talented people who can bring new horizons in economy system and can adapt themselves to demands related to producer, consumer and economy (Sonmez, 2005). In order to acquire these skills, Day and Ballard developed a sample practice to be applied in classroom. This practice called as "Classroom Mini Economy" offers a teaching form of a class economy of which students are a part in order to provide a similar version of economy activities in real life. This teaching form aims to fulfill the needs of citizen being educated, productive and having educational motivation in a highly dependent society with the rapid change today. Furthermore, it is aimed to ensure the effective teaching of important economic principles and life skills. Students are taught these principles and skills and they are made to apply their knowledge and experiences from other disciplines. In this practice, 1st-6th grade students earn money by various ways in a mini economy and they spend them in class canteen, class auction or a canteen created by classmates. Students apply class tasks to earn money; manage an enterprise, pay tax, rent goods and invest. Mini economy is an effective miniature economic system which functions in a regular classroom. In this way, children experience a really willing learning (Day and Ballard, 1996). This kind of study shows the importance of learning economy principles at primary school level.

A more basic practice applied in Turkey in this scope was developed by the cooperation between Ministry of National Education and Dogus Holding. The aim of the practice called as 3 Moneybox Financial Literacy Training Program is to make children learn money management, acquire the awareness of saving and make up their own budgets in early ages. In this practice for which Association of Monetary and Financial Literacy serves as practitioner and observer, it is aimed to raise awareness of saving and sharing with a moneybox for 4th grade students in Turkey and to make them financially literate. In parallel with the trainings started in Istanbul, it was planned to conduct student and parents training in 9 different provinces of Turkey (Eskisehir, Nigde, Antalya, Denizli, Kahramanmaras, Sanliurfa, Hatay, Rize and Erzurum).

In Turkey 2005 Social Studies Program, economy subjects are taught in a separate learning area. This development is an indicator of the fact that the importance of teaching economy subjects at primary school level in Turkey is comprehended. To have efficient and competent economy education may enable a person to take an active role in decision-making process. This is also important for democratic societies. Our world is getting more complex and interdependent in terms of social ties. Therefore, people need to have more economic knowledge in order to keep with the ever-changing world.

It is a must to create a competition environment in order to stand as an industrial power and to be successful in international trade. The duty of economy education is to provide necessary learning in order to build up the basis of economy and get rid of incorrect information about economy. Economy education makes people acquire thinking skills and significant economy knowledge required by citizens to be individual/social, effective and participatory citizens. Furthermore, it can contribute to critical thinking and decision making skills of people in addition to making them acquire social conscious (Staubs, 2007; Schug, 1985, cited by: Akhan, 2010).

This research aims to search the inclusion of economy concepts and levels in 6th and 7th grade social studies lesson. To this end, data were collected after the social studies coursebooks were investigated.

## METHODOLOGY

In this research, 6th and 7th grade social studies coursebooks which are taught in 2013-2014 academic year were investigated. Qualitative research method was used during the study. In this scope, document review method was used in this research within the scope of qualitative research method. Document review is a method used to collect, investigate and asses official or private records. This method ensures rich data collection (Ekiz, 2003). Qualitative research does not aim to generalize the results to a population (Yildirim and Simsek, 2008). Therefore, no population has been mentioned in this study. In order to obtain a holistic picture and get deep knowledge, sampling method was used. Coursebooks taught in 2013-2014 academic year comprise the sampling of the research. In this research, MoNE Publishing (Primary School, 6th and 7th Grade Social Studies Coursebooks) and IMYAY (Primary School, 6th Grade Social Studies Coursebooks) and Anittepe Publishing (Primary School, 7th Grade Social Studies Coursebooks) were used.

All texts, writings in figures etc. which take place in all units except for National Anthem, Ataturk's Address to the Turkish Youth, context, dictionary etc were examined.

## Sub-problems of the research

1. What are the "economy" concepts given in 6th and 7th grade social studies coursebooks? To what extent do these concepts take place?
2. What are the similar and different "economy" concepts in 6th and 7th grade social studies coursebooks?
3. What are the methods of teaching similar and different "economy" concepts in 6th and 7th grade social studies coursebooks and to what extent are they taught?
4. In quantity terms, is there any change in "economy" concepts as the grade levels increases?

## Data Analysis

First of all, content analysis method was used to analyze the data in order to determine the quantity of related economic concepts. The content analysis is a method which enables us to code and define the content, themes or patterns of text data contents within systematic classification period and interpret them in a subjective way (Hsieh and Shannon, 2005, cited by Zhang and Wildemuth); to reach concepts and correlations that can explain the collected data

and to reveal what may be hidden in the data (Yildirim and Simsek, 2008). Berelson (1952) reported that the corner stone of content analysis is categories (Gokce, 2006). The category of economy concepts used in the research was designed according to the research question and clarified by literature review and pre-reading of the books and finalized by the expert opinion. In the analysis of curriculum of 6th and 7th grade social studies, the mentioned concepts were found as follows: "budget, value, natural resources, economy, economic activity, labor, entrepreneur, customs, right, waste, unemployment, importation, market, industry, capital, contact, saving, copyright and patent, commerce, consumption, production, product, tax and investment". Teaching only above mentioned concepts during the education process might be insufficient for an effective teaching of the "economy" subject. Therefore, it was decided to emphasize on different "economy" concepts. The record unit of the analysis in this research is word. The scope unit is sentence. The reliability of the content analysis depends on whether the participants who tally understood the texts in the same way or not. As the number of tallying participants increases, the common understanding between them weakness and the reliability decreases. Reliability increases when categorization, definition and tallying are made by one person. In this case, the correlation rate between the tallies made by one person in different times must be high. In addition, tallying is controlled by experts and the consensus between them is tested. A 80% consensus shows the reliability/consistency (Inal, 2004).

This study was conducted by one researcher. During the categorization process, the opinions of 2 experts from education studies were asked and consensus was ensured. After the categorization, tallying process started. At each inconsistency during tallies or any change in tallying, the process started all over. After the consistency was ensured in tallying style, the process was repeated two weeks later. The tallying association between two tallying was found approximately 98%. The tallying process conducted to ensure the internal validity and reliability of the research was re-conducted by 3 education studies experts without any sampling. 95% consensus was ensured in tallies. Considering these rates, reliability and internal validity of the tallies were ensured. Gokce (2006) reports that there is no other validity assessment tool in definitions of categories within content analysis of coursebooks. If it is believed that definition of categories can be shared by everyone and the research scale assess what should really be assessed, the validity of research is ensured. On the other hand, Alkan (1989, cited by; Inal, 2004) states two fundamental criteria of content validity of content analysis: The first one is the convenience of scales (categories) in terms of assessment. The second criterion is related to sufficient scope and dimensions included by the sampling texts in terms of teaching subjects. The lack of sampling in the research proves that the validity is ensured in this way as well. The developed category was made after literature review and it was formed extensive and wide not to cause any problem in content. After the coding process, the coded words were collected in a separate document and saved. On this way, code lists were made to be studied in a more detailed way. The concepts in the code lists were classified and sub-categories were made. The unweighted scores of the categories were presented in frequency (f) and percentage (%). The frequency of each economy concept in the book was determined. The frequencies of the all determined concepts were collected. According to each total frequency, percentage distribution of each concept was determined. First of all, 6th and 7th grade coursebooks were compared. During the comparison, same and different concepts taking or not taking place in both books were recorded. Same concepts' level of taking place in the books was named as low, normal and high. In order to name the level of the percentage rate of the same concept, percentage distribution of the concepts was considered. Percentage rates of a same concept in the first and second book were added and the total was divided into three. The result obtained from this

part is the first result. The first result was multiplied with the second one and the second result was obtained. The level between the first and second results was considered normal. The values smaller than the first result were named low and those bigger than the second result were named high level. In this way, books were compared to each other and whether the distribution of concepts in the books is normal or balanced or not.

## FINDINGS

The frequency and percentage distribution of economy concepts given in 6th grade coursebooks published by MoNE and IMYAY Publishing are presented in Table 1.

According to Table 1, 69 economy concepts are detected in 6th grade coursebook published by MoNE Publishing. These concepts are repeated 505 times. According to the analysis of the concepts, frequency and percentage rates of concepts which take place in the first 2% are as follows: Product 84 (16.63%), economy, economic, commerce and tax 39 (7.72%), production 37 (7.32%), exportation 20 (3.96%), buying-shopping, money and commercial (2.17%).

A total of 72 concepts were detected in relation with economy concept in 6th grade coursebook of IMYAY Publishing. These concepts are repeated 586 times. According to the analysis of the concepts, frequency and percentage rates of concepts which take place in the first 2% are as follows: Product/produced 123 (21.65%), economic 44 ( 7.74%), production 34 (5.98%), commerce 31 (5.45%), economy 27 (4.75%), shopping/buying 25 (4.40%), consumer 24 (4.22%), producing 16 (2.81%), sales 15 (2.64%), exportation, money and selling 14 (2.46%), goods and commercial 12 (2.11%).

Different "economy" concepts in 6th grade social studies coursebooks of different publishing houses are presented in Table 2.

According to Table 2, 37 different "economy" concepts were used in one other coursebook among 6th grade social studies coursebooks. It was detected that 20 different economy concepts were used in MoNE Publishing and not used in IMYAY Publishing while 17 economy concepts were used in IMYAY Publishing and not used in MoNE Publishing.

The findings obtained following the comparison of 6th grade coursebooks in terms of common economy concepts are presented in Table 3.

According to Table 3, there are 44 concepts commonly given in 6th grade social studies coursebooks (MoNE, IMYAY). Of these concepts, 7 take place in MoNE Publishing coursebooks in lower rates compared to IMYAY Publishing. These are as follows: "shopping/buying, seller/salesman, sales/selling, company, consumer, producer/manufacturer and producing". 11 concepts have high rates. These are as follows: "invoice/receipt, livelihood, income, expense, entrepreneur, factory, waste, saving, merchant, cheap and investment". A total of 18 concepts have unbalanced distribution and the rest 26 concepts have normal distribution. These are as follows:

**Table 1.** Distribution of "economy" concepts given in 6th grade social studies coursebook published by different publishing houses.

<b>Concepts (MoNE)</b>	<b>f</b>	<b>%</b>	<b>List of concepts (IMYAY)</b>	<b>f</b>	<b>%</b>
Product/Produced	81+3	16.63366	Product/Produced	121+2	21.6549296
Economy	39	7.722772	Economic	44	7.74647887
Economic	39	7.722772	Production/Manufacturing	34+2	6.33802817
Commerce	39	7.722772	Commerce	31	5.45774648
Tax	39	7.722772	Sales/Selling	15+14	5.1056338
Production	37	7.326733	Economy	27	4.75352113
Importation	20	3.960396	Shopping/Buying	3+2+20	4.40140845
e-Invoice/Invoice/Receipt	2+7+6	2.970297	Consumer	24	4.22535211
Purchasing/Buying/Shopping	2+3+6	2.178218	Producing	16	2.81690141
Money	11	2.178218	Exportation	14	2.46478873
Commercial	11	2.178218	Money	14	2.46478873
Merchant	9	1.782178	Producer/Manufacturer	2+8+4	2.46478873
Income	8	1.584158	Value/Price/Fee	7+1+2+2	2.11267606
Importation	8	1.584158	Goods	12	2.11267606
Marketing	4+3	1.386139	Commercial	12	2.11267606
Producing	2+5	1.386139	Seller/Vendor	3+7	1.76056338
Investment	7	1.386139	Export	8	1.4084507
Price/Fee	4+2	1.188119	Importation	8	1.4084507
Goods	6	1.188119	Firm	7	1.23239437
Paying	3+3	1.188119	Paying	2+5	1.23239437
Export	5	0.990099	Marketing	6+1	1.23239437
Consuming	4+1	0.990099	Company	7	1.23239437
Labor	4	0.792079	Tax	7	1.23239437
Firm	4	0.792079	Import	6	1.05633803
Entrepreneur	4	0.792079	Development	4	0.70422535
Import	4	0.792079	Loss	4	0.70422535
Cheap	4	0.792079	Labor	3	0.52816901
Producer/Manufacturer	2+2	0.792079	Invoice/Receipt	2+1	0.52816901
Craft	3	0.594059	Merchant	3	0.52816901
Customer	3	0.594059	Consuming	1+2	0.52816901
Seller	3	0.594059	Investment	3	0.52816901
Wealthy	3	0.594059	Wealthy	3	0.52816901
Bartering/exchange	1+1	0.39604	Bank	2	0.35211268
Foreign trade	2	0.39604	Storage	2	0.35211268
Livelihood	2	0.39604	Income	2	0.35211268
Expenditure	2	0.39604	Profit	2	0.35211268
Spending	2	0.39604	Credit Card	2	0.35211268
Treasure	2	0.39604	Market	2	0.35211268
Factory	2	0.39604	Competition	2	0.35211268
Waste	2	0.39604	Consumption	2	0.35211268
National Income	2	0.39604	Cheap	2	0.35211268
Taxpayer	2	0.39604	Budget	1	0.17605634
Sold	2	0.39604	Currency	1	0.17605634
Selling	1+1	0.39604	Poor	1	0.17605634
Saving	2	0.39604	Livelihood	1	0.17605634
Consumption	2	0.39604	Expenditure	1	0.17605634
Richness	2	0.39604	Entrepreneur	1	0.17605634
Storage	1	0.19802	Customs	1	0.17605634
Debt	1	0.19802	Account	1	0.17605634
Customs	1	0.19802	Account Number	1	0.17605634

**Table 1.** Cont'd

Allowance	1	0.19802	Factory	1	0.17605634
Domestic Market	1	0.19802	Discount	1	0.17605634
Exporter	1	0.19802	Waste	1	0.17605634
Business	1	0.19802	Importer	1	0.17605634
Development	1	0.19802	Loan	1	0.17605634
Gain	1	0.19802	Financial	1	0.17605634
Loan	1	0.19802	Property	1	0.17605634
Financial	1	0.19802	Welfare	1	0.17605634
Property	1	0.19802	Saving	1	0.17605634
Market	1	0.19802	Compensation	1	0.17605634
Advertisement	1	0.19802	Being consumed	1	0.17605634
Free Trade Zone	1	0.19802	Consumed	1	0.17605634
Capital	1	0.19802	Free	1	0.17605634
Company	1	0.19802	Investor	1	0.17605634
Demand	1	0.19802	Needy	1	0.17605634
Consumer	1	0.19802	Total	568	100
Needy	1	0.19802			
Total	505	100			

**Table 2.** The methods to teach "economy" concepts in 6th grade social studies coursebooks of different publishing houses.

Concepts included in MoNE and not included in IMYAY	Concepts included in IMYAY and not included in MoNE
Debt	Bank
Foreign Trade	Budget
Craft	Currency
Spending	Poor
Allowance	Account
Treasure	Account Number
Domestic Market	Discount
Exporter	Importer
Business	Profit
Earning	Credit Card
National Income	Welfare
Taxpayer	Competition
Customer	Compensation
Advertisement	Free
Sold	Being consumed
Free Trade Zone	Investor
Capital	Loss
Bartering/Exchange	
Demand	
Richness	

"storage, economy, economic, labor, firm, exportation, export, importation, import, loan, mal, financial, property, paying, money, market, marketing, commerce, commercial, consumption, consuming, production/manufacturing, product/produced, needy and rich".

The frequency and percentage distribution of economy concepts given in 7<sup>th</sup> grade coursebooks published by

MoNE and IMYAY Publishing are presented in Table 4.

According to Table 4, 60 "economy" concepts are detected in 7th grade coursebook of MoNE Publishing. These concepts are repeated for 423 times. According to the analysis of the concepts, frequency and percentage rates of concepts which take place in the first 2% are as follows: production / producing / manufacturing 75

**Table 3.** Comparison of common "economy" concepts given in 6th grade social studies coursebooks according to different coursebooks.

Concepts	Lower-upper value range %	MEB result	IMYAY result
Shopping/Buying	2.19-4.38	Low	High
Seller/Salesman	0.78-1.56	Low	High
Sales/Selling	1.83-3.66	Low	High
Company	0.47-0.95	Low	High
Consumer	1.47-2.94	Low	High
Producer/ Manufacturer	1.08-2.17	Low	High
Producing	1.40-2.80	Low	High
Storage	0.18-0.36	Normal	Normal
Economy	4.15-8.31	Normal	Normal
Economic	5.15-10.31	Normal	Normal
Labor	0.44-0.88	Normal	Normal
Firm	0.67-1.34	Normal	Normal
Customs	0.12-0.24	Normal	Normal
Exportation	2.14-4.28	Normal	Normal
Export	0.79-1.59	Normal	Normal
Importation	0.99-1.99	Normal	Normal
Import	0.61-1.23	Normal	Normal
Loan	0.12-0.24	Normal	Normal
Mal	1.10-2.20	Normal	Normal
Financial	0.12-0.24	Normal	Normal
Property	0.12-0.24	Normal	Normal
Paying	0.80-1.61	Normal	Normal
Money	1.54-3.09	Normal	Normal
Market	0.18-0.36	Normal	Normal
Marketing	0.87-1.74	Normal	Normal
Commerce	4.39-8.78	Normal	Normal
Commercial	1.43-2.86	Normal	Normal
Consumption	0.24-0.49	Normal	Normal
Consuming	0.50-1.01	Normal	Normal
Production/Manufacturing	4.55-9.10	Normal	Normal
Product/Produced	12.76-25.52	Normal	Normal
Needy	0.12-0.24	Normal	Normal
Rich	0.37-0.74	Normal	Normal
Invoice/Receipt	1.16-2.33	High	Low
Livelihood	0.19-0.38	High	Low
Income	0.64-1.29	High	Low
Expense	0.19-0.38	High	Low
Entrepreneur	0.32-0.64	High	Low
Factory	0.19-0.38	High	Low
Waste	0.19-0.38	High	Low
Saving	0.19-0.38	High	Low
Merchant	0.77-1.54	High	Low
Cheap	0.38-0.76	High	Low
Investment	0.63-1.27	High	Low

(17.73%), commerce 61 (14.4208%), economic 49 (11.58392%), product 34 (8.037825%), craft 22 (5.200946%), economy 21 (4.964539%), goods,

purchasing/shopping/buying 11 (2.600473%), merchant 9 (2.12766%).

A total of 57 "economy" concepts are detected in 7th

**Table 4.** Distribution of "economy" concepts given in 7th grade social studies coursebooks of different publishing houses.

<b>Concepts (MoNE)</b>	<b>F</b>	<b>%</b>	<b>Concepts (Anittepe)</b>	<b>f</b>	<b>%</b>
Production/Producing/Manufacturing	55+1+17+2	17.7305	Commerce	42	15.32846715
Commerce	61	14.4208	Product	30	10.94890511
Economic	49	11.58392	Economic/Financial	25+1	9.489051095
Product	34	8.037825	Production /Producing	12+2+5	6.934306569
Craft	22	5.200946	Economy	18	6.569343066
Economy	21	4.964539	Banka	13	4.744525547
Goods	13	3.073286	Tax	11	4.01459854
Purchasing/Shopping/Buying	1+6+4	2.600473	Income	8	2.919708029
Merchant	9	2.12766	Goods	8	2.919708029
Colony	8	1.891253	Merchant	8	2.919708029
Tax	8	1.891253	Debt	7	2.554744526
Selling	7	1.654846	Commercial	7	2.554744526
Market	6	1.41844	Shopping/Buying	2+3	1.824817518
Consumption	6	1.41844	Colony	5	1.824817518
Rich	6	1.41844	Poor/Needy	5	1.824817518
Price	4	0.945626	Exportation	4	1.459854015
Salary	4	0.945626	Financial	4	1.459854015
Paying	2+2	0.945626	Money	4	1.459854015
Cheap	4	0.945626	Salary	3	1.094890511
Fee	4	0.945626	Borrowing	2	0.729927007
Debt	3	0.70922	Generous	2	0.729927007
Poor	3	0.70922	Unemployment	2	0.729927007
Livelihood	3	0.70922	Development	1+1	0.729927007
Revenue	3	0.70922	Selling	2	0.729927007
Money	3	0.70922	Colonialism	2	0.729927007
Capital	3	0.70922	Fee	2	0.729927007
Richness	3	0.70922	Produced	2	0.729927007
Bank	2	0.472813	Investment	2	0.729927007
Budget	2	0.472813	Rich	2	0.729927007
Mall	2	0.472813	Banking	1	0.364963504
Foreign Trade	2	0.472813	Budgetary Deficit	1	0.364963504
Currency	2	0.472813	Foreign Debt	1	0.364963504
Unemployment	2	0.472813	Labor	1	0.364963504
Development	2	0.472813	Craft	1	0.364963504
Loan	2	0.472813	e-Commerce	1	0.364963504
Cost	2	0.472813	Price	1	0.364963504
Commercial	2	0.472813	Livelihood	1	0.364963504
Producer	1+1	0.472813	Expense	1	0.364963504
Needy	2	0.472813	Treasure	1	0.364963504
Enrichment	2	0.472813	Export	1	0.364963504
Supply	1	0.236407	Waste	1	0.364963504
Banking	1	0.236407	Employer	1	0.364963504
Interest	1	0.236407	Importation	1	0.364963504
Poorness	1	0.236407	Revenue	1	0.364963504
Prize	1	0.236407	Income per Capita	1	0.364963504
Exportation	1	0.236407	Finance	1	0.364963504
Waste	1	0.236407	Cost	1	0.364963504
Renting	1	0.236407	Paying	1	0.364963504
Financial	1	0.236407	Expensive	1	0.364963504
Officially Fixed Price	1	0.236407	Broke	1	0.364963504
Expensive	1	0.236407	Capital	1	0.364963504

**Table 4.** cont'd

Marketing	1	0.236407	Collection	1	0.364963504
Seller	1	0.236407	Cheap	1	0.364963504
Colonialism	1	0.236407	Cheapening	1	0.364963504
Saving	1	0.236407	Free	1	0.364963504
Compensation	1	0.236407	Producer	1	0.364963504
Consumerism	1	0.236407	Total	274	100
Free	1	0.236407			
Productivism	1	0.236407			
Poverty	1	0.236407			
Total	423	100			

**Table 5.** The methods to teach "economy" concepts in 67h grade social studies coursebooks of different publishing houses.

<b>Concepts included in MoNE and not included in Anittepe</b>	<b>Concepts included in Anittepe and not included in MoNE</b>
Supply	Borrowing
Budget	Budgetary deficit
Mall	Generous
Foreign Trade	Foreign debt
Currency	Labor
Interest	e-Commerce
Poorness	Income
Prize	Expense
Renting	Treasure
Loan	Export
Cost	Employer
Officially Fixed Price	Importation
Market	Income per Capita
Marketing	Finance
Seller	Cost
Saving	Broke
Compensation	Collection
Consumerism	Cheapening
Consumption	Produced
Productivism	Investment
Needy	
Poverty	
Getting rich	
Richness	

grade coursebooks of Anittepe Publishing. These concepts are repeated for 274 times. According to the analysis of the concepts, frequency and percentage rates of concepts which take place in the first 2% are as follows: commerce 42 (15.32%), product 30 (10.94%), economic/financial 26 (9.48%), production/producing 19 (%6.93), economy 18 (6.56%), bank 13 (4.74%), tax 11 (4.01%), income 8 (2.91%), goods 8 (2.91%), merchant 8 (2.91%), debt (2.54%) and commercial 7 (2.55%).

Different "economy" concepts given in 7th grade coursebooks of MoNE and Anittepe Publishing are

presented in Table 5.

According to Table 5, 44 "economy" concepts are not used in one other coursebook. There are 24 different economy concepts which are used in MoNE and not used in Anittepe while there are 20 different economy concepts being used in Anittepe Publishing and not used in MoNE.

Common "economy" concepts given in 7th grade social studies coursebooks of MoNE and Anittepe Publishing were compared and the obtained findings are presented in Table 6.

According to Table 6, there are 37 common concepts

**Table 6.** Comparison of common "economy" concepts given in 7th grade social studies coursebooks according to different coursebooks.

Concepts	Lower-Upper Value Range %	MoNE Result	ANITTEPE Result
Economy	2.82-5.64	Low	High
Economic/Financial	3.79-7.58	Low	High
Goods	1.20-2.41	Low	High
Financial	0.64-1.28	Low	High
Money	0.64-1.28	Low	High
Colony	0.76-1.53	Low	High
Commerce	5.18-10.37	Low	High
Commercial	0.93-1.86	Low	High
Merchant	1.05-2.10	Low	High
Fee	0.32-0.64	Low	High
Production/Producing/Manufacturing	2.39-4.78	Low	High
Product	3.77-7.45	Low	High
Tax	1.41-2.83	Low	High
Needy	0.32-0.64	Low	High
Rich	0.32-0.64	Low	High
Poor/Needy	1.08-2.16	Normal	Normal
Exportation	0.80-1.60	Normal	Normal
Unemployment	0.47-0.95	Normal	Normal
Development	0.47-0.95	Normal	Normal
Revenue	0.35-0.71	Normal	Normal
Salary	0.60-1.20	Normal	Normal
Paying	0.27-0.55	Normal	Normal
Expensive	0.27-0.55	Normal	Normal
Selling	0.40-0.80	Normal	Normal
Capital	0.27-0.55	Normal	Normal
Colonialism	0.40-0.80	Normal	Normal
Cheap	0.20-0.40	Normal	Normal
Free	0.20-0.40	Normal	Normal
Producer	0.20-0.40	Normal	Normal
Purchasing/Shopping/Buying	6.51-13.03	High	Low
Bank	5.44-10.88	High	Low
Banking	2.80-5.60	High	Low
Debt	2.58-5.17	High	Low
Craft	0.67-1.34	High	Low
Price	0.43-0.87	High	Low
Livelihood	0.43-0.87	High	Low
Waste	0.43-0.87	High	Low

given in 7th grade social studies coursebooks (MoNE, ANITTEPE). Of these concepts, 15 are used in lower rates in coursebooks of MoNE Publishing compared to Anittepe Publishing. These are as follows: "economy, economic/ financial, goods, financial, money, colony, commerce, commercial, merchant, fee, production/ producing/manufacturing, product, tax, needy and rich". 8 of them are on "high" level. These are as follows: "purchasing/shopping/buying, bank, banking, debt, craft, price, livelihood and waste". The rest 14 concepts take

place in the books with a normal distribution.

These concepts are as follows "poor/needy, exportation, unemployment development, revenue, salary, paying/, expensive, selling, capital, colonialism, cheap, free and producer".

Different "economy" concepts given in 6th and 7th grade social studies coursebooks are presented in Table 7.

According to Table 7, it can be seen that some economy concepts such as "banking, credit card,

**Table 7.** Economy concepts given in 6th and 7th grade social studies coursebooks.

Concepts of 6th Grade	Concepts of 7th Grade
Storage	Supply
Invoice/Receipt	Banking
Firm	Borrowing
Entrepreneur	Budgetary deficit
Customs	Generous
Expense	Mall
Allowance	Foreign debt
Account	e-Commerce
Account number	Interest
Domestic Market	Poorness
Exporter	Price
Factory	Prize
Discount	Employer
Business	Unemployment
Import	Development
Importer	Renting
Profit	Income per Capita
Credit Card	Salary
National Income	Finance
Taxpayer	Cost
Property	Cost
Customer	Officially Fixed Price
Welfare	Expensive
Competition	Broke
Advertisement	Capital
Sold	Colony
Free Trade Zone	Colonialism
Capital	Collection
Company	Consumerism
Bartering/ exchange	Cheapening
Demand	Fee
Being consumed	Productivism
Consumer	Produced
Consuming	Tax
Producing	Needy
Investor	Poverty
Loss	Richness

account, account number" related to fundamental economic concepts like "supply, demand, enterprise, storage, capital, employer, consumer, cost" take place in some grade levels, yet do not take place in coursebooks of other grade levels.

The distribution of "economy" concept in 6th and 7th grade social studies coursebooks in terms of quantity is presented in Table 8.

In Table 9, distribution of "economy" concepts in 4 different social studies coursebooks (6th and 7th grade) is analyzed.

According to the research, it was found that 20 same "economy" concepts are given in 4 different coursebooks. Out of these concepts, "financial, commerce, merchant and needy" take place in 6th grade coursebooks less while, "exportation, money, selling, producer and product" take place more. The concepts which are included balancedly in both grade level coursebooks are as follows: "purchasing/shopping/buying, economy, economic/financial, livelihood, waste, mal, paying, commercial, production/ producing/manufacturing cheap and rich".

The quantity of economy concepts by grade levels is presented in Table 9.

According to Table 9, it can be seen that "economy" concepts are mentioned for 1073 times in 6th grade, this quantity falls to 701 in 6th grade coursebooks.

## DISCUSSION

Various 'economy' concepts given in 6th and 7th coursebooks of Social Sciences are presented in Table 7.

69 'economy' concepts were detected in 6th grade coursebook of MoNE Publishing. These concepts are repeated for 505 times. In the analysis of the concepts, percentage based ranking is as follows; concepts taking place in 2% are "Product (16,63%), Economy/Economic/Commerce/Tax (7.72%), Production (7.32%), Exportation (3.96%), Purchasing/Shopping/Money/Commercial (2.17%). A total of 72 concepts were detected in relationship with the economics concept in 6th grade coursebook of IMYAY Publishing. These concepts are repeated for 568 times. In the analysis of the concepts, percentage based ranking is as follows; concepts taking place in 2% are "Product/Produced (21.65%), Economic (7.74%), Production (5.98%), Commerce (5.45%), Economy (4.75%), Shopping/Purchasing (4.40%), Consumer (4.22%), Producing (2.81%), Sales (2.64%), Exportation, Money and Selling (2.46%), Goods and Commercial (2.11%).

6th grade social sciences coursebooks were examined and it was found that 37 different "economy" concepts were not used in another coursebook. In MoNE Publishing, there were 20 different economy concepts which were not used in IMYAY Publishing. On the other hand, in IMYAY Publishing, there were 17 different "economy" concepts which were not used in MoNE Publishing. There were 44 mutually-used concepts in 6th grade social sciences coursebooks (MoNE, IMYAY). Of all these concepts given in the coursebook of MoNE Publishing, 7 concepts are included in lower rates compared to IMYAY publishing. These are; "Shopping/Purchasing/Buying, Seller/Salesman, Company, Consumer, Producer/Manufacturer and Producing". 11 of these concepts are given in high level. These concepts are as follows; "Invoice/Receipt, Livelihood, Income, Expense, Entrepreneur, Factory, Waste, Saving, Merchant,

**Table 8.** Distribution of economy concepts between 6th and 7th grade coursebooks

<b>Concepts</b>	<b>Lower/Upper Value</b>	<b>Values</b>	<b>6th Grade Result</b>	<b>7th Grade Result</b>
Financial	Lower Value Upper Value	0.345056226 0.690112	Low	High
Commerce	Lower Value Upper Value	7.154964272 14.30993	Low	High
Merchant	Lower Value Upper Value	1.22628584 2.452572	Low	High
Needy	Lower Value Upper Value	0.484685643 0.969371	Low	High
Purchasing/Shopping/ Buying	Lower Value Upper Value	1.834152828 3.668306	Normal	Normal
Economy	Lower Value Upper Value	4.001695866 8.003392	Normal	Normal
Economic/ Financial	Lower Value Upper Value	6.090370328 12.18074	Normal	Normal
Livelihood	Lower Value Upper Value	0.274379974 0.54876	Normal	Normal
Waste	Lower Value Upper Value	0.195577807 0.391156	Normal	Normal
Mal	Lower Value Upper Value	1.548964848 3.09793	Normal	Normal
Paying/	Lower Value Upper Value	0.621850479 1.243701	Normal	Normal
Commercial	Lower Value Upper Value	1.219741931 2.439484	Normal	Normal
Cheap	Lower Value Upper Value	0.409130197 0.81826	Normal	Normal
Production/Producing/ Manufacturing	Lower Value Upper Value	6.38826129 12.77652	Normal	
Rich	Lower Value Upper Value	0.54509917 1.090198	Normal	Normal
Exportation	Lower Value Upper Value	1.353574291 2.707149	High	Low
Money	Lower Value Upper Value	1.135346791 2.270694	High	Low
Selling	Lower Value Upper Value	1.314407801 2.628816	High	Low
Producer/	Lower Value Upper Value	0.682440706 1.364881	High	Low
Product	Lower Value Upper Value	9.545886618 19.09177	High	Low

**Table 9.** The quantity distribution of repetition levels of concepts by 6th and 7th grade levels.

6th Grade		7th Grade	
505	568	423	274
	1073		701
	1774		

Cheap and Investment". In total, 18 concepts show unbalanced distribution and the rest 26 concepts show normal distribution. These are as follows; "Collecting, Economy, Economic, Labour, Company, Export, Import, Exportation, Importation, Loan, Goods, Financial, Property, Paying/Payment, Money, Market, Marketing, Commerce, Commercial, Consumption/Consuming, Production/Manufacturing, Product/Producing, Poor and Rich".

Analyzing MoNE Publishing, 60 "economy" concepts were detected in 7th grade coursebooks. These concepts are repeated 423 times. In the analysis of the concepts, percentage based ranking is as follows; concepts taking place in 2% are "Production/Producing/Manufacturing (17.73%), Commerce (14.4%), Economic (11.5%), Product (8.03%), Craftsmen (5.2%), Economy (4.9%), Goods/Purchasing/Shopping/Buying (2.6%), Merchant (2.1%). In 7th grade coursebooks of Anittepe Publishing, 27 "economy" concepts were detected. It was found that these concepts are repeated for 274 times. In the analysis of the concepts, percentage based ranking is as follows; concepts taking place in 2% are "Commerce (15.32%), Product (10.94%), Economic/Financial (9.48%), Production/ Producing (6.93%), Economy (6.56%), Bank (4.74%), Tax (4.01%), Income (2.91%), Goods (2.91%), Merchant (2.91%), Debt (2.54%) and Commercial (2.55%). 44 "economy" concepts are not used in another coursebook. In MoNE Publishing, there were 24 different "economy" concepts which were not used in Anittepe Publishing. On the other hand, in Anittepe Publishing, there were 20 different "economy" concepts which were not used in MoNE Publishing.

There are 37 mutually-used concepts in 7th grade social sciences coursebooks (MoNE, ANITTEPE). Of these concepts, 15 concepts used in coursebooks of MoNE Publishing take place in lower rates compared to Anittepe Publishing. These are "Economy, Economic/ Economical, Goods, Financial, Money, Colonial, Commerce, Commercial, Merchant, Price, Production/Producing/ Manufacturing, Product, Tax, Poor and Rich". 8 of these concepts are in "high" level. These concepts are as follows; "Purchasing/Shopping/Buying, Bank, Banking, Debt, Craftsmen, Price, Livelihood and Waste". The rest 14 concepts take place in the books with normal distribution. These concepts are as follows;

"Poor, Exportation, Unemployment, Development, Revenue, Salary, Payment/Paying, Expensive, Selling,

Capital, Colonialism, Cheap, Free and Producer" concepts. According to the research; fundamental concepts such as "Supply, Demand, Enterprise, Collecting, Capital, Worker, Consumer, Cost" and some economy concepts used by almost every employee in relationship with daily life such as "Banking, Credit Card, Account, Account Number" take place in social sciences coursebooks of some grades, yet do not take place in coursebooks of other grades. The distribution of "economy" concepts in 4 different social sciences coursebooks of 6th and 7th grades is balanced. According to the research, 20 same "economy" concepts are included in 4 different coursebooks. Of all these concepts, "Financial, Commerce, Merchant and Poor" occupy less place in 6th grade coursebooks while "Exportation, Money, Selling, Producer and Product" concepts are found in more places. The concepts given balancedly in coursebooks of both grades are "Purchasing/Shopping/Buying, Economy, Economic/ Financial, Livelihood, Waste, Goods, Payment, Paying, Commercial, Production/Producing/Manufacturing, Cheap and Rich". According to this research, "economy" concepts are included 1073 times in 6th grade coursebooks while this figure falls down to 701 in 7th grade coursebooks.

Not only the way economy concepts are included in coursebooks but also the way they are included in curriculum is important. Investigating curriculum of 6th and 7th grade social sciences, it was observed that "economy" topics are distributed in different unites. In curriculum of 6th grade, it was observed that different perspectives are adopted towards "economy" concepts in "Life on Earth" unit of "People, Places and Environment" learning field, "Turks on Silk Road unit of "Culture and Heritage" learning field, "Resources of Turkey" unit of "Production, Distribution and Consumption" learning field and "Our Country and the World" unit of "Universal Connections" learning field. In the curriculum of 7th grade, "economy" topics are analyzed in "Population in Our Country" unit of "People, Places and Environment" learning field, "Travelling in Turkish History" unit of "Culture and Heritage" learning field, "Economy and Social Life" unit of "Universal Connections" learning field (MoNE, 2005).

Considering all these issues, it can be seen that "economy" concepts are included in National Education perception of Turkey. However, we can say that there are some deficiencies/problems in the way these "economy" concepts are given in curriculum of Social Sciences and in the way these concepts are applied at schools. As a matter of fact, some problems are encountered in different countries as well. As reported in some sources (Zachlod, 2006), this fact could result from many factors. Considering the problems particularly underlined in these sources, we can mention the reasons of these problems as the fact that teacher are not trained efficiently on economy concepts and thus they quickly forget economy concepts taught in lessons as they do not use them in

practical life; not sufficient attention is paid to concepts and teachers do not feel comfortable during the presentation of concepts. In addition, the reasons of why economy concepts and topics are not taught well can be the fact that teachers who are the practitioners of the curriculum and the lesson do not have a positive approach to the economy concepts (Morgan, 1991; Meszaros and Suiter, 1998).

It was found that there are some studies in parallel with the results of this study (Ivković, 2013; Tsai, 2000). In the study conducted by Ivković (2013), it was reported that there are some deficiencies in concepts related to entrepreneurship, innovation and market economies; but it was concluded that there is a lack of a planned and determined organization in the use of concepts in coursebooks of the same or different grades; concepts given in a coursebooks are not included in another one and thus there are some deficiencies in the use of concepts.

Similarly, Tsai (2000) reported differences and deficiencies in the use of economy concepts in Taiwan coursebooks. These common results in coursebooks of Croatia, Taiwan and Turkey which have the status of economically underdeveloped countries are significant. The presence of positive correlation between economy education and development can be understood from these studies.

## RECOMMENDATIONS

Societies which are ready to make any kind of investment economically and want to preserve their presence within interstate competitions in the future must put special emphasis on economy education. In this scope, common policies should be determined towards the use of "economy" concepts in coursebooks of both state and private publishing houses; detailed studies should be conducted to this end and the good examples from the world should be investigated. In addition, implementation processes of these policies should be seriously followed, a strict tie should be built between theory and practice in these issues, the use of visual and audio materials that can attract students' attention at schools should be more emphasized. Furthermore, methods and techniques used by other countries during education process should be analyzed and different practice samples should be considered. Within the scope of this policy, in order to resolve most frequently encountered economy problems and prevent the losses related to the wrong use of capital and income at the very point of the prerequisite of active citizenship; economy concepts should be rated and placed in coursebooks and correct subjects in an efficient and quality way, students should be trained as "economy" literates even at this early stages of their lives. As stated by Akhan (2010), students can be conscious producers, consumers and entrepreneur in the future on condition that they learn "economy" concepts and the functions of

these concepts efficiently. For that reason, each and every student should pass through a quality education process in terms of economy literacy.

Such studies conducted on coursebooks should be more extensive, the attention of researchers should be attracted in order to conduct up-to-date and effective research on these issues, more emphasize should be given to project activities under the support of official/scientific research boards. In addition, giving more importance to use of mass communication tools and social media can be important for an effective "economy literacy".

Apart from this, recommendations of scientific research should be considered more and studies conducted on this issue in different countries should be taken into consideration. Success and failure reasons revealed by such studies in our country and in the world should be examined well; more effective field studies should be conducted on this issue in order to determine the social preparedness level and then related measures should be taken.

## Conflict of Interests

The authors have not declared any conflict of interests.

## REFERENCES

- Akhan NE (2010). Sosyal Bilgiler Disiplininde Ekonominin Yeri ve Önemi. Sosyal Bilgilerin Temelleri. Ankara: Maya Akademi.
- Baker GD (1950). Economic Education, *J. Educ. Sociol.* 23(7):389-396.
- Berelson B (1952). *Content Analysis In Communication Research*, New York: The Free Press.
- Çakmak O (2008). Egitimin Ekonomiye ve Kalkınmaya Etkisi. *D.U.Ziya Gökalp Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi* 11:33-41.
- Çalışkan S, Karabacak M, Mecik O (2013). Türkiye'de Eğitim-Ekonomik Buyume İlişkisi: 1923-2011 (Kantitatif Bir Yaklaşım). *Yönetim Bilimleri Dergisi.* 11(21): 29-48.
- Day HR, Ballard D (1996). *The Classroom Mini-Economy*, Indiana Department Of Education, Center for School Improvement and Performance Office of Program Development, Charlestown. USA.
- Dura C (1996). Eğitim ve Ekonomi İlişkileri. *Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Dergisi.* 7:19-47.
- Ekiz D (2003). *Eğitimde Arastırma Yöntem Ve Metodlarına Giriş*. Ankara: Anı.
- Gökçe O (2006). *İçerik Analizi, Kuramsal Ve Pratik Bilgiler*. İstanbul: Siyasal Kitabevi.
- İnal K (2004). *Eğitim ve İktidar*. Ankara: Utopya.
- Ivković Ž (2013). *Learning Economics: Content Analysis of Textbooks for Lower Grades of Elementary School*. *Učenje za poduzetništvo.*3(2):202-214.
- Meszaros B, Suiter M. (1998). The Case for Economics in The Elementary Classroom. *Region*, 12(4): 104-109.
- Morgan JC (1991). Using Econ And Me to Teach Economics to Children in Primary Grades. *Social Stud.* 82(5): 195-197.
- Ozturk C (2009). *Sosyal Bilgiler*. Kavram, İçerik ve Program. *Sosyal Bilgiler Öğretimi*. (Editor: Cemil Ozturk) (1-31). Ankara: PegemAkademi.
- Sonmez V (2005). *Hayat ve Sosyal Bilgiler Öğretimi Öğretmen Kılavuzu*. (Besinci Baskı). Ankara: Anı Yayıncılık.
- Tsai V (2000). *The Content Analysis of Economic Concepts in the Textbook of Elementary Education*. Unpublished Master Thesis. National Pingtung University of Education, Tayan.

Turan I (2008). Ekonomi. Sosyal Bilgilerin Temelleri. (Editor: Ali Sinan Bilgili). Ankara: Pegem Akademi.  
Turkey Ministry of National Education (2005). Social Studies Curriculum, Ankara.  
Yildirim A, Simsek H (2008). Sosyal Bilimlerde Nitel Arastırma Yontemleri. Ankara: Seckin Yayıncılık.  
Yılmaz A (2009). Sosyal Bilgilerin Programına Gore Hazirlanan Ders Kitaplarındaki Bazi Kavramların Veriliş Bicimlerinin Karsilastirilmesi. Marmara Cografya Dergisi. 19: 130-152.

Zachlod M (2006). Teaching Economics Concepts in The Primary Grades. Soc. Stud. Rev. 45(2):18-21.  
Zhang Y, Wildemuth BM (2009). Qualitative Analysis Of Content. Web Site: [http://ils.unc.edu/~yanz/Content\\_analysis.pdf](http://ils.unc.edu/~yanz/Content_analysis.pdf) adresinden 25.05.2009 tarihinde edinilmistir.